Tourism and Place in Treasure Beach, Jamaica: Imagining Paradise and the Alternative.

Michael J. Hawkins

Louisiana State University and Agricultural & Mechanical College

Follow this and additional works at: https://repository.lsu.edu/gradschool_disstheses

Recommended Citation

This Dissertation is brought to you for free and open access by the Graduate School at LSU Scholarly Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in LSU Historical Dissertations and Theses by an authorized administrator of LSU Scholarly Repository. For more information, please contact gradetd@lsu.edu.
INFORMATION TO USERS

This manuscript has been reproduced from the microfilm master. UMI films the text directly from the original or copy submitted. Thus, some thesis and dissertation copies are in typewriter face, while others may be from any type of computer printer.

The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted. Broken or indistinct print, colored or poor quality illustrations and photographs, print bleedthrough, substandard margins, and improper alignment can adversely affect reproduction.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send UMI a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if unauthorized copyright material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.

Oversize materials (e.g., maps, drawings, charts) are reproduced by sectioning the original, beginning at the upper left-hand corner and continuing from left to right in equal sections with small overlaps.

Photographs included in the original manuscript have been reproduced xerographically in this copy. Higher quality 6" x 9" black and white photographic prints are available for any photographs or illustrations appearing in this copy for an additional charge. Contact UMI directly to order.

Bell & Howell Information and Learning
300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, MI 48106-1346 USA

UMI®
800-521-0600

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
TOURISM AND PLACE IN TREASURE BEACH, JAMAICA:
IMAGINING PARADISE AND THE ALTERNATIVE

A Dissertation

Submitted to the Graduate Faculty of the
Louisiana State University and
Agricultural and Mechanical College
in partial fulfillment of the
requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

in

The Department of Geography and Anthropology

by

Michael Hawkins
B.A., University of Maryland, 1973
M.A., University of Florida, 1991
December 1999
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would first like to thank the good people of St. Bess Parish, Jamaica. They really are as gracious as the guidebooks say. The patience, encouragement and wisdom of my chair, Miles Richardson, made this dissertation possible. Kent Matthewson sparked my interest and informed my research. Jean Rahier, Steven Hoelscher, Kathleen Kennedy, Ary Lamme III, Carville Earle, Keith and Bonnie Henderson, and Daven Ramphall all contributed time and thought to my efforts. William Davison was always there when I needed him. My parents, James and Marion Hawkins, and my family, were unflagging in their support and encouragement. Julie Koliopulos and Michael Harmon and their sojourn to Jamaica provided the opportunity and the context for my research. Elizabeth Vaughan, Lisa Adam, Katie Algeo, Phil Chaney, Scott Smiley, Anne Brucklacher, Andy Maxwell, and Kit Anderson provided inspiration, advice, assistance and commiseration whenever needed, as friends and fellow graduate students. I am grateful to the folks back home in Maryland, West Virginia, Louisiana and Florida for remembering me and sustaining our friendships over the years. I would like to thank the Robert C. West Fund and the Louisiana State University Board of Regents for their funding of this research.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ................................................................. ii

ABSTRACT ................................................................................ iv

CHAPTER

ONE INTRODUCTION ................................................................. 1

TWO GETTING THERE ............................................................... 32

THREE “GUIDES” TO THE HISTORY OF TOURISM AND DEVELOPMENT IN JAMAICA ............................................... 64

FOUR ROOTS AND ROUTES: THE DEVELOPMENT OF POST-TOURISM IN TREASURE BEACH ................................. 108

FIVE COMMODIFICATION AND CHANGE ................................. 161

REFERENCES ........................................................................... 182

VITA .......................................................................................... 198
The tourism production system has been generating images of the Jamaican landscape and culture since the mid-nineteenth century. This system consists of those individuals and corporate entities who produce and market the product itself, including travel writers, advertising agencies, hotel owners and government agencies; and the people, their culture, and elements of the landscape which are commodified as tourist attractions. The tourist gaze has traditionally focused on an idealized Caribbean landscape. Because of a shift in Western patterns of consumption, the focus of the gaze has shifted to emphasize the culture and people who inhabit the landscape. As the tourism industry seeks to differentiate Jamaica from other destinations, those aspects of culture which originally evolved as forms of resistance to Western domination, Rastafarianism and reggae music, are now valued and marketed as part of the tourism product. All-inclusive resorts have successfully packaged selected elements of culture and landscape as a simulated and safe experience of the "real" Jamaica for mainstream post-tourists. Alternative post-tourists, on the other hand, seek out experiences in "undiscovered" places. Treasure Beach, Jamaica is an alternative destination being drawn into the formal tourism production system. Remote places may be so commodified as to lose their distinctive sense of place that attracted tourists in the first place. Although Treasure Beach is caught up in a process of change, the local power structure and the people themselves are adapting and have retained a strong sense of their place in the world.
CHAPTER ONE
INTRODUCTION

Columbus was sailing homeward from the Caribbean on February 21, 1493 when he wrote these words in his log:

The sacred theologians and learned philosophers were quite correct when they said that the earthly Paradise is at the end of the Orient, because it is a most temperate place. Those lands which I have now discovered are at the end of the Orient (Columbus 1987, 190).

Christopher Columbus was searching for a fantasy spun out of biblical sources, writings of the early Church Fathers and the legend of St. Brendan. These texts were transformed into mappa mundi which were reproduced and circulated widely throughout Europe and literally served as guides for Columbus (Flint 1992). After his initial “discovery” Columbus became merely the first in a long line of travelers and writers who represented the landscape and inhabitants of the New World to their compatriots in the West. He described in more detail paradisiacal features of the Antillean landscape which would reappear much later in the literature of tourism:

This island is one of the most beautiful I have ever seen; if the others are beautiful, then this is more so. Of what I have seen so far, the coast is almost all sandy beach. It has many large, beautiful trees... I never tire from looking at the vegetation, which is so different from ours. You can even smell the flowers as you approach this coast; it is the most fragrant thing on earth... The flocks of parrots darken the sun and the large and small birds of so many species different from our own that it is a wonder (1987, 88-9).

His representation of the Caribbean landscape goes beyond a description of beaches, tropical vegetation, fragrant flowers and exotic birds. Columbus consistently enhanced his images of the New World with superlatives designed to evoke a sense of

1

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
wonder and an aura of difference. In his reports to Ferdinand and Isabella, he used this “discourse of the marvelous” partially as a rhetorical device to increase the value of these new lands he was presenting to their Catholic Majesties in lieu of sending home ships laden with spices and gold (Greenblatt 1991, 72).

Commodification of Paradise

Karl Marx (1983, 444) wrote:

A commodity appears, at first sight, a very trivial thing, and easily understood. Its analysis shows that it is, in reality a very queer thing, abounding in metaphysical subtleties and theological niceties.

By endowing the landscape with “marvelous” aesthetic qualities, and identifying the islands with paradise, Columbus was striving to add surplus value to, or commodify, his “discoveries.” To be sure, he refers to the possible use value of the landscape by holding out the promise of future shipments of gold, and by noting that “there are many plants and trees here that could be worth a lot in Spain for use as dyes, spices, and medicines” (Columbus 1987, 88). Columbus focused, however, on the aesthetic and metaphysical properties of the landscape in his reports — or imaginings — to the Spanish court.

The views of Columbus and his immediate successors regarding the human inhabitants of this marvelous landscape were more complex. Columbus reported that the Arawaks were “marvelously” compliant and the Caribs remarkably ferocious (Greenblatt 1991). The Spanish viewed both groups as a useful source of labor: the peaceful Arawaks under the repartimiento system whereby they were parcelled out to
work for the new settlers, and the supposedly cannibalistic Caribs who were to be captured and sold as slaves in Spain (Sauer 1966; see also Hulme 1986). Columbus suggested that the enslaved Caribs should receive the benefits of Christianity and could also be exchanged for cattle, thus bringing together the Christian and capitalist ideals of “commodity conversion and spiritual conversion” (Greenblatt 1991, 71). The value of Native Americans in the Caribbean as commodities and labor, however, proved limited. Within three decades, disease, overwork and maltreatment had nearly extinguished the original human occupants of the landscape (Lovell 1992). In Carl O. Sauer’s words:

By 1519 the Spanish Main was a sorry shell. The natives, whom Columbus belatedly knew to be the wealth of the land, were destroyed. The gold placers of the islands were worked out. . . . What the Spanish wanted was to get out and seek their fortunes in parts as yet untried and unknown (1966, 294).

The utility of the Caribbean landscape, in the form of its soils and climate, was not fully realized until the Dutch introduced sugar cultivation in the mid-seventeenth century. As a peripheral area in the capitalist world-system, the surplus value created by African slaves was funneled to the core regions in Europe (Wallerstein 1980). For the next two hundred years, the human misery of slavery and environmental degradation wrought by the clearing of forests for sugar cane and other tropical staple crops submerged the image of an earthly paradise spun by Columbus. For European planters, the rational Enlightenment ideal of the “geometric layout of the early cane
"plantation" was more aesthetically pleasing than the natural vegetation (Richardson 1992, 45).

**Imagining Jamaica**

The Jamaican Tourist Board recently crafted the slogan "Five hundred years ago Columbus logged Jamaica. Now it’s your turn" (Pattullo 1996, 151). Images of the Caribbean landscape as Paradise lay dormant until an incipient tourist trade in the late nineteenth century called upon these representations of an idealized landscape to sell the islands as destinations for wealthy North Americans and Europeans. Jamaica was one of the first islands of the Caribbean to be marketed as a tropical resort, and its tourism industry has managed to adjust over the years to changes in tastes and clientele (Hanna 1989; Taylor 1993). This dissertation traces the evolution of tourism in Jamaica from its nineteenth century origins to its contemporary manifestations through the images of landscape and culture generated by the tourism production system. Stephen Britton (1991, 455) defines the tourism production system as "the various commercial and public institutions designed to commodify and provide travel and touristic experiences." This holistic view of the tourism industry consists of those individuals and corporate entities who produce and market the product itself, including travel writers, airlines, advertising agencies, hotel owners and government agencies; and the people, their culture, and elements of the landscape which are commodified as tourist attractions (Britton 1991, 455).
My central argument is that tourism in Jamaica has traditionally focused on an idealized landscape as the object of the tourist gaze; and that because of a shift in Western patterns of consumption, the focus of the gaze has shifted to include the culture and people who inhabit the landscape. I use John Urry’s (1990, 1-2) notion of the “gaze” to mean a way of looking at places that is constructed, directed and legitimatized by the tourism production system as a form of commodification. The images generated by this system essentially dehumanized the landscape of Jamaica by ignoring or disparaging ordinary Jamaicans and their culture, or portrayed the people as either exotic objects or servile stereotypes. Over the last twenty-five years the tourist production system has significantly widened its focus to include Jamaican culture, as well as the landscape, as an attraction to market to foreign tourists. Place images now commodify people and their culture as a means to differentiate Jamaica from other island destinations, and to diversify the tourist product within the country. Jamaica’s new slogan is “We’re More Than A Beach, We’re a Country” (quoted in Patullo 1996, 151). My objective is to trace the evolution of place images and the process of commodification as it occurred in the traditional resort areas, and beyond, to a particular place in the countryside of southwestern Jamaica — Treasure Beach.

In the late 1960s and early 1970s cultural, political and economic shifts occurring in developed societies triggered a crisis in the Jamaican tourism industry, and the nature of global tourism began to reflect changes in Western consumption patterns (Lash and Urry 1987; Harvey 1989; Featherstone 1991; Montforth and Munt
This new "condition" is variously called late capitalism (Jameson 1984), post-Fordism (Harvey 1989) or simply postmodernism. Since the mid-1980s tourists have increasingly rejected packaged mass-tourism in favor of more individualized "experiences" which reinforce distinctive lifestyles (Bourdieu 1984; Urry 1990; Craik 1997). A plethora of "new" tourisms arose to meet this demand for differentiation, and as a result, exotic landscapes, places and the culture of the people who inhabit them are now more in demand as touristic commodities (figure 1.1). New tourism is also called sustainable tourism, alternative tourism and postmodern tourism. I prefer the word post-tourism because it antedates the other terms and lends itself to a broader interpretation. Sustainable and alternative tourism both imply small-scale tourism, whereas I use post-tourism as a cover term for both large-scale, or mainstream post-tourism, and small-scale forms. I have borrowed the term "alternative" to describe small-scale post-tourism.

Overview of the Dissertation

In the remainder of Chapter One I will first clarify my use of post-tourism, its origin and the two different forms it takes in Jamaica. Secondly, I will discuss Treasure Beach as the site of both alternative tourism and my ethnographic fieldwork. I briefly describe the objects of commodification, local landscape and culture, while emphasizing the place of Treasure Beach and its people in a wider context.

I begin Chapter Two with a first person narrative which introduces the reader to Jamaica and leads to a discussion of sustainable tourism and Butler's destination
The following list is not exclusive but is indicative of the types of terms used as descriptors of the new forms of tourism.

academic tourism
adventure tourism
agro-tourism
alternative tourism
anthro-tourism
appropriate tourism
archaeo-tourism
contact tourism
cottage tourism
culture tourism
eco-tourism
ecological tourism
environmentally friendly tourism
ethnic tourism
green tourism
nature tourism
risk tourism
safari tourism
scientific tourism
soft tourism
sustainable tourism
trekking tourism
truck tourism
wilderness tourism
wildlife tourism

Additionally, terms used to describe markets include:
	niche

individuated
specialised
flexible
personalised
customised
designer

Figure 1.1. Partial list of new tourisms (Mowforth and Munt 1998).
life cycle. I then briefly outline the economic role of tourism in Jamaica and the diversity of opinion concerning the value of the industry. This ambiguity regarding tourism arises partly because of a shift in Jamaican identity after independence from a European cultural ideal to an Afrocentric one and a concomitant resistance to foreign hegemony. I will discuss at some length Jamaica’s legacy of colonialism and the country’s efforts to overcome deep divisions along color and class lines which have been the subject of much debate and scholarly inquiry. I will also emphasize the transcultural character of Jamaican identification with “blackness” because of the importance of its most visible images — reggae, Rastafarianism and resistance — as touristic commodities. I then proceed to a discussion of the literature on tourism, gender, commodification, and textual analysis.

Since the nineteenth century Jamaica has been imagined, packaged and sold as a tourist commodity. In Chapter Three, I use guide books and travel accounts to trace the evolution of tourist landscapes as tourism grew to be the country’s largest industry. I intertwine this genealogy of place images with the history of Western development paradigms and ideology.

Chapter Four chronicles the commodification of landscape and culture in a specific place, Treasure Beach, in the context of alternative post-tourism. I use ethnographic techniques to portray sense of place, interaction between tourists and locals, and the emergent process of incorporation into the formal tourist production system.
In Chapter Five, I trace the accelerating commodification of Treasure Beach on a global scale and its recently achieved status as an important niche in Jamaica's tourism industry. I assess changes in tourist clientele and relate impressions of key informants regarding this transformation. While this study is not meant to be predictive, I offer conclusions on sustainability and future possibilities.

Post-tourism

I have adopted the term and spelling of post-tourism from Maxine Feiffer's 1986 book *Tourism in History: From Imperial Rome to the Present*. Feiffer's post-tourist is above all reflexive.

[He] knows that he is a tourist not a time traveller when he goes somewhere historic; not an instant noble savage when he stays on a tropical beach; not an invisible observer when he visits a native compound. Resolutely “realistic,” he cannot evade his condition of outsider (1986, 271).

The post-tourist is aware of the impact of tourism on remote places, although the lack of tourists in such places is the reason they are there. Feiffer's post-tourists may enjoy “authenticity” but are aware of the quotation marks around the word. They seek diversity; sights and sites may be sacred, informative, beautiful, “kitschy” or just different. Feiffer does not theorize post-tourism, nor does she mention postmodernism, but she uses the right terminology: the role of pleasure and fantasy, reading the *feeling* of Paris from the Eiffel Tower, the pastiche of simulated objects that represent the “real” thing (Feiffer 1986, 257-270).
Feiffer's portrayal of post-tourism seems to be contradictory. Post-tourists seek the authentic but are aware that their presence makes authenticity problematic. They are searching for an uplifting experience but are just as liable to enjoy purely pleasurable or hedonistic experiences. They look for out-of-the-way places but revel in places that have been so heavily commodified that they are parodies of themselves. The post-tourist knows that he/she is not just an invisible observer but also a participant. We, meaning the academic community, may see something of ourselves in Feiffer's view of post-tourism.

This definition of post-tourism may seem imprecise, however,

the only way to an accurate view and confident knowledge of the world is through a sophisticated epistemology that takes full account of intractable contradiction, paradox, irony, and uncertainty in the explanation of human activities (Marcus and Fischer 1986, 15).

I use the term post-tourism in preference to new tourism, alternative tourism and sustainable tourism because, unlike these other tourisms, it implies no claims to authority, and because I believe that post-tourists enjoy both “authentic” and inauthentic or staged experiences. Urry (1990, 100) equates the term “post-(mass) tourist” with Feiffer’s post-tourist to mean a way of traveling and a way of seeing the world that has expanded beyond the rather narrow mass-produced experiences produced by the formal tourism system that constituted mainstream, middle class tourism until the 1980s. This is not to say that the formal tourist production system no longer packages experiences, only that in this era of post-tourism, there are now a multitude of choices tailored to specific lifestyles and tastes rather than an
undifferentiated mass market. The postmodern consumer is able to choose from a wide array of “cultural goods” — in this case touristic experiences — designed to enhance and reinforce his or her status in society (Bourdieu 1984, 177). I contend that the multiplicity of choices can be grouped into two broad categories: mainstream post-tourism and alternative post-tourism.

Mainstream post-tourism is produced on a large scale, but with an array of choices built in. It commodifies landscape and culture by using historical, “traditional,” locally specific, and natural materials to construct experiences and places (Ley and Olds 1988; Shields 1989; Zukin 1991; Goss 1999). Alternative post-tourism is small-scale and commodifies landscape and culture to produce experiences in place (Prentice 1997; Mowforth and Munt 1998).

The varied experiences mainstream post-tourism offers may be “inauthentic” — post-tourists are aware of this — but they offer the essence of landscape and culture packaged in a pleasurable and sometimes educational form. Alternative post-tourists perceive their experiences of place as more “authentic” (Redfoot 1984; Cohen 1988; Van den Berghe 1994). Mainstream post-touristic experiences are usually fully incorporated into the formal tourism production system, whereas informal systems often arise to cater to alternative post-tourists. Alternative post-tourism seldom takes place completely outside the formal tourism production system — even the most dedicated, low-budget alternative tourist does not swim or sail to Jamaica. As the system seeks to provide new experiences, especially for up-market or affluent post-
tourists, it incorporates alternative destinations into a more formal process of commodification.

Individuals as post-tourists do not necessarily indulge exclusively in either or mainstream or alternative tourism. A visit to Disney World, for example, is a quintessential mainstream post-tourism experience. The post-tourist and his fellow visitors experience this constructed pastiche of landscape and culture through the collective gaze which requires the presence of other tourists to validate the experience (Urry 1990). The following day, the same tourist may then decide to go to Cape Canaveral National Seashore, about an hour away, backpack ten miles up the beach and camp in total solitude. The National Park Service constructs this alternative experience of “oneness with nature” with Urry’s notion of the solitary romantic gaze in mind (1990, 46).

In Jamaica, the transition from mass tourism to post-tourism began outside the formal tourism production system in the late 1960s. Young Americans and Europeans, variously categorized as “countercultural” or “hippies,” established an alternative destination on the extreme western end of the island at Negril (figure 1.2). They either camped on the beach or found lodging in local people’s homes (Lalor 1980). The Lonely Planet guide describes this early period of tourism in Negril:

What a pleasure it was to arrive in Negril in the mid-1970s, before the world had discovered this then-remote sensual Eden. For one buck a night you could sleep in a Rastafarian’s hut beside the jungled shoreline, aided in slumber by thick clouds of ganja and the cheep-cheep of geckos calling from the eaves. Back then Negril was an off-the-beaten-track haven (Baker 1996, 388).
Figure 1.2. Reference map of Jamaica
In addition to the beautiful seven-mile strand of white sand and crystal-clear waters, visitors sought out contact with the ordinary Jamaicans who lived there. These young “countercultural” Westerners felt drawn to the images of resistance which had become part of the Jamaican invented tradition as the nation emerged from its colonial past (Hobsbawm and Ranger 1983).

Partly through the experience of these alternative tourists in Jamaica and the influence of Bob Marley’s music and the reggae film “The Harder They Come,” images of Jamaican national culture in the form of Rastafarianism, reggae and ganja were reproduced and circulated globally, while the landscape retained the image of a verdant tropical paradise lapped by the calm, clear seas. As the global economic crisis of the early 1970s brought mass tourism in Jamaica to the point of collapse the tourism production system began to incorporate Negril and its “laid-back” countercultural lifestyle into the formal tourism sector (Taylor 1993, 180). In the midst of this transition a 1980 study reported that

according to residents of the area many tourists who first came to Negril as young people and stayed these houses [private homes] have since returned and stayed in formal accommodations with spouse and family. That is, the college student of today, living on a tight budget, could well be the young professional of tomorrow with a much larger budget, and fond memories of Negril. It would be natural for him to return. But had it not been for the informal sector, he would probably not have come to Negril in the first place (Lalor 1980, 189).

Mainstream post-tourism now targets exactly this upper-middle class, young — and not so young — professional segment of the market (Poon 1990).
All-inclusive Resorts

The current of post-tourism which I characterize as mainstream post-tourism grew directly out of the countercultural discovery of Negril and has been able to construct places that commodify carefully selected elements of landscape and culture. These resort enclaves, called all-inclusives, offer a safe environment in which post-tourists with the collective gaze (Urry 1990) can experience a simulation Jamaica and its culture for one price that covers everything. The major all-inclusive chains strictly forbid tipping. Each all-inclusive appeals to different set of tastes and lifestyles. The two largest all-inclusive chains, SuperClubs and Sandals are Jamaican owned, and achieve “difference” through niche marketing. They have crafted resorts designed for various market segments including singles, newlyweds, couples, families with children and fitness enthusiasts. All-inclusives are enclosed behind high walls and access is strictly limited to guests and employees (figure 1.3).

For example, Hedonism II in Negril, the prototype of all-inclusives in Jamaica is one of the most recognized symbols of Jamaica’s laid-back lifestyle....Check your inhibitions at the door. At Hedonism II, there are few rules and no limits. Just complete freedom to do what you want, when you want, with whomever you want (SuperClubs 1997, 47).

At the other end of the taste and lifestyle spectrum is SuperClub’s Grand Lido Brac, where the “gentle calm of Old Jamaica” is reproduced in Caribbean Georgian architecture.

The Island’s finest craftsmen have recreated a genuine seaside village on Jamaica’s North Coast. The crystal blue Caribbean serves as a backdrop to a whimsical collage of fretwork and gingerbread. On the
Figure 1.3. Tourist enclave at Hedonism II.
cobblestone streets of our Town Square, local artisans display their handiwork (1997, 30).

All-inclusives also provide a wide variety of activities and dining facilities within each resort. Sandals, for example, advertises four restaurants at each resort offering “an infinite variety of dining experiences and a world of choices. There are a total of 41 ultra gourmet choices in all, featuring exotic specialties from the Far East to the West Indies” (Sandals Resorts 1999, 19). Elements of Jamaican culture and landscape are present in a sanitized form. The management screens craftspeople who are brought onto the grounds to sell their pre-priced wares, sparing tourists the hassle of shopping at the craft market in town and bargaining prices (figure 1.4). Depending upon the style of the resort, Bob Marley or Harry Belafonte waft over the speakers. The “Pastafari” restaurant at Hedonism II is a perfect example of postmodern pastiche: “a unique Italian restaurant with a Jamaican accent and a magic touch with pasta” (SuperClubs 1997, 43).

Three Jamaican owned, all-inclusive hotel chains accounted for 40% of the rooms available in Jamaica and have spread throughout the Caribbean (World Trade Organization 1999, 114). They have boosted Jamaican ownership in the hotel business to about 90% of the total rooms available and contribute more to the Gross Domestic Product than any other sector of the tourism industry. (Patullo 1996). However, a 1991 opinion poll found that most Jamaicans believed that all-inclusives “were big money spinners for the big hoteliers, but stumbling blocks in the path of the small interests in tourism” (Stone 1991, 12).

17
Figure 1.4. Craftspeople inside compound at Hedonism II.
Some observers view the range of differentiation or "individuation" offered by all-inclusives to be mere "camouflage" designed to disguise the mass-produced nature of their products (Rojek 1985; Ionnides and Debbage 1997). Poon (1993) acknowledges the large-scale aspect of all-inclusives while firmly placing them in the galaxy of "new" tourisms. She argues that the flexibility of response to increasingly sophisticated consumer demands exhibited by all-inclusives are as different from Fordist mass production as the computer is from the typewriter (Poon 1993, 23). I have chosen to characterize all-inclusive resorts as mainstream post-tourism because the word "mainstream" implies a connection with past forms of mass tourism. All-inclusives, however, differ from the Holiday Inns and Hiltons of the past in that they tailor experiences to specific tastes in ways that would have been unthinkable for international hotel chains in the 1970s.

The Alternative

Alternative post-tourists seek out difference in existing places that are distinctive. Treasure Beach is gaining a reputation as the most different place in Jamaica. The tourist products consumed here, or the objects of the tourist gaze (Urry 1990), include the landscape and the culture of the people who shaped it. Four small villages that comprise the heart of this area of dispersed settlement on the dry south coast in St. Elizabeth Parish. Although the community contains a number of nodes of activity that are places in their own right, Treasure Beach has a distinct place image that is apparent at local, national and international levels. This identity as constructed
by both insiders and outsiders rests upon the reputation of the inhabitants as industrious farming and fishing folk retaining a way of life identified with traditional, rural Jamaican values.

Emerging nations in the Caribbean tend to adopt “traditional” rural values and practices associated with Afro-Caribbean culture in the construction of national identity to differentiate themselves from the legacy of the colonial past. Ethnicity, small scale farming, marketing, folk tales, funeral customs, charismatic and participatory religion, handicrafts, and music and dance forms are perceived as African in origin and are emphasized over Euro-Caribbean forms (Olwig 1993). People in Treasure Beach now identify with the Jamaican national ideal which emphasizes African cultural “roots,” but they also acknowledge their own mixed ancestry and have an oral tradition of shipwrecked Scottish sailors settling in the area.

The local identity of Treasure Beach stems as well from a landscape made distinctive by its relative isolation, dry climate and the resultant vegetation, its picturesque topography, and by the human activities that have shaped the land. The landscape is indeed very different from the tropical ideal. Four fishing villages strung along the coast, Great Bay, Calabash Bay, Frenchman's Bay and Billy’s Bay, constitute the core of the rather amorphous area called Treasure Beach (figure 1.5). Two kilometers inland a low range of hills rises 80 to 100 meters above sea level. The entire hinterland is known as Pedro Plains, extending to the foot of Malvern Hill about ten kilometers inland. Malvern Hill, part of Santa Cruz Mountains, rises dramatically
Figure 1.5. The four villages of Treasure Beach (Survey Department 1988).

21
from 40 meters in elevation at the edge of the plain to 723 meters at the summit. The Santa Cruz Mountains trend from northwest to southeast and intercept the moisture-laden northeast trade winds sweeping over the island from the North Coast (figure 1.6). The mountains meet the coast seven kilometers east of Treasure Beach at Lover’s Leap where they plunge 575 meters to the sea. The orographic effect is striking; Malvern on top of the hill receives 81.5 inches of rain per year and Pedro Plains, a scant three kilometers distant, receives only 34.17 inches (Wade 1984). The narrow coastal strip is even dryer as the low range of hills close to the sea accentuate the rain shadow.

The Lonely Planet guide validates the reputation of Treasure Beach as a distinctive place and alternative destination in the tradition of Negril in the 1970s.

The off-the-beaten-track coastal strip southeast of Black River is unique in several ways. The area is sheltered from the rains for most of the year by the Santa Cruz Mountains, so there is none of lush greenery of the North Coast. . . . Because of the extremely dry climate, farmers have had to apply ingenuity to make the most of the land. They’ve developed a ‘dry farming technique’ of laying guinea grass on the soil for mulch.

Most importantly, the region is unsullied by tourism. It’s possible here to slip into the kind of lazy, no-frills lifestyle almost impossible elsewhere on the island’s coast. The area’s residents have a reputation for honesty and conviviality. Treasure Beach’s residents have a graciousness unique to the island (Baker 1996, 440).

Baker’s description emphasizes the “unique” qualities of the land and people of the area, but “most importantly” highlights the absence of tourists. The author is clearly targeting the romantic gaze in this account.
Figure 1.6. Treasure Beach and its hinterland.

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
Ethnography in Treasure Beach

Despite the claims of Cartesian logic which detached the investigator from the object of study (Relph 1981, 28), interpretation can never be divorced from the point of view of the observer. George Marcus and Michael Fischer (1986) chronicle the efforts of ethnographers to overcome the problem of ethnocentricity in their interpretations of other cultures. Ethnographers pioneered the use of participant observer strategies, juxtaposing other cultures with their own, and perhaps most importantly, recognizing that the informants’ interpretation of their culture is a valid one (Marcus and Fischer 1986, 26). Miles Richardson (1989) equates the interpretation of culture in anthropology with interpretive efforts of cultural geographers in regard to the concept of place. He recognizes the symbolic and subjective nature of both culture and places and urges that “by integrating felt experience with the discerning symbol . . .” humanistic geographers can “. . . offer an interpretation of place in its ambiguity, ambivalence, and complexity” (Richardson 1989, 143).

There is general agreement among those who write about place that it is associated with a definite area and that each place has its distinct characteristics or identity (Meinig 1979; Relph 1981; Lee 1982). Physical space takes on an identity and becomes a place through the activities of the people who occupy it as “social space,” and through events that “took place” there (Ford 1974; Meinig 1979; Buttimer 1980). As a result, perceptions of place vary between cultures and individuals and among
insiders and outsiders (Tuan 1974; Relph 1976). As we have seen, Treasure Beach, Jamaica is a place with a very distinct identity and outsiders — tourists — now wish to experience that distinctiveness.

I chose Treasure Beach as my study area because tourism there presents such a striking contrast, or alternative, to mainstream post-tourism on Jamaica’s North Coast. When I began my fieldwork in January 1994, Treasure Beach was almost entirely outside the formal tourism production system. The romantic gaze of alternative tourism requires the absence of other tourists and the few representations of Treasure beach in print emphasized this quality (Geh 1992; Cameron and Box 1994). Although tourists had been coming to the area in small numbers since the 1930s, there was only one hotel and nearly all place images of Treasure Beach were spread by word-of-mouth. I found out about the area from two Americans friends who had started a bakery and cafe catering to a small, but steadily growing stream of independent travelers. By the end of my fieldwork in January 1997, images of Treasure Beach were beginning circulate internationally, marking the onset of the area’s incorporation into the formal tourism production system. Treasure Beach offered a rare opportunity to document the process of commodification as it unfolded and expanded from the local to a global scale.

Marcus and Fischer (1986, 18) define ethnography as “a research process in which the anthropologist closely observes, records, and engages in the daily life of another culture — an experience labeled as the field work method — and then writes
accounts of this culture, emphasizing descriptive detail.” From 1994 to 1997 I conducted four sessions of fieldwork ranging from one month to three months in length. I planned my fieldwork so that my sessions would span both the peak tourist season from December to April and the off season. I spent a total of eight months in the field which included side trips to Kingston, Negril, Montego Bay and around the coast of the island. I relied primarily on open-ended interviews with tourists and local residents to elicit data on tourism, change and daily life in Treasure Beach. Lalor’s 1980 study entitled Tourism and Development: A Case Study of Negril Jamaica illustrates the utility of informal interviews. Lalor designed a survey instrument to assess residents’ involvement in tourism. When presented with the questionnaire, many respondents claimed “they had nothing to do with tourists. The fact that as they were being interviewed, ‘guests’ were roaming all over their houses was ignored” (1980, 197). Lalor found that he elicited far more useful information in the course of informal conversation after the interview.

I have alluded to Feiffer’s (1986, 271) portrayal of the post-tourist as a self-conscious participant observer and commented on the superficial similarity between tourists and researcher. Many tourists kept travel logs, took pictures and asked questions. To a greater or lesser extent, tourists in Treasure Beach are participants in daily life at Treasure Beach and most of them actively seek out interaction with local people. Bars, shops and most restaurants were gathering places for residents and tourists alike. The Treasure Beach Hotel is perhaps the only place frequented
exclusively by tourists and staff. Interaction also took place on beaches, lanes and footpaths. Tourists on the beach gathered with members of the community when fishing boats came in to inspect the catch and buy fresh seafood. Fishermen often asked tourists for help beaching their boats and putting to sea. As Pierre Van den Berghe (1994, 29) found in his study of ethnic tourism in San Cristóbal, participant observation "is peculiarly well suited to a study of tourism. Without even trying, I found it extremely easy to be taken for a tourist myself."

My participant observation experience spanned all five levels of participation set out by Spradley (1980, 58-61) from nonparticipation — studying brochures, guidebooks, newspaper articles and the landscape — through complete participation. By complete participation I mean as a tourist, not as a local resident of Treasure Beach. Local people with whom I had daily contact regarded me as a long term tourist, or at best, an honorary member of the small expatriate community. Although the romantic gaze focuses on solitary rather than collective experiences, I found tourists in Treasure Beach anxious to share stories of their travels, backgrounds and opinions.

As an outsider I could never achieve complete participation in the sense of becoming a member of the local community. However, my friendship with Julie Koliopulos gave me access to people and social groups I would not otherwise have had. She has lived in Treasure Beach for eight years and owned Trans-Love Bakery, one of the most fruitful places to observe social interaction. Almost all members of
the community interacted on some level with tourists, but some residents had more frequent and intimate contact than others. People who ran guesthouses, owned or worked in local businesses and those who sought out the company of tourists for pleasure, romance or monetary gain were more likely to interact with tourists on a daily basis. Fortunately for my fieldwork, I found Baker's (1996) description of people in Treasure Beach as convivial and gracious true. Jamaicans possess a rich oral culture, conversation, discussion — Rastafarians would say “reasoning” — and expressing strong opinions are a part of everyday life (Cooper 1993).

Another facet of Jamaican culture that facilitated communication in my research is that many of my informants have lived or traveled abroad. Clifford (1992) argued that anthropologists have localized “natives” in place and ignored intercultural connections beyond the field site. In Treasure Beach global links cannot be ignored. Jamaica is a traveling culture and has been since the days of the Middle Passage. Fishermen on this coast have for generations had links with the Bay Islands of Honduras, the Moskito Coast and the Colombian islands of San Andrés and Providencia. Jamaicans looking for work have migrated successively to Panama, Costa Rica, Cuba, England and North America. In Treasure Beach there was a constant coming going of people, to and from North America and Europe. Much of this mobility now results from relationships, sometimes long term, between tourists and local men and women. People in Treasure Beach were not only used to travelers, they were used to traveling. Thinking of the informant as traveler tends alter the
authoritative position of the writer/ethnographer (Clifford 1992, 100). The following passage is an example of a well-traveled informant making rather sophisticated cross-cultural comparisons between one aspect of his own culture, language, and the wider world. His own.

Preston was telling travel stories. He had lived in England with relatives for several years and recently returned from traveling in Europe with his German girlfriend. He was “vexed” at his English-born relatives for making fun of his Jamaican accent.

I don’t know why they say we must speak proper English because we have our own creole talk. There is English and there is the broken. But in England they speak differently [from each other]. There is Scotch and Cockney. Yeah man, in Germany you can tell what part they come from by the way they talk. Barbados is different from Jamaica and so on.

Travel not only broadened many local residents’ world view, but their speech repertoire as well. Nearly all the tourists I came into contact with spoke at least enough English to make themselves understood. Most residents of Treasure Beach could switch easily from patois to a more standard form of English when dealing with outsiders. This flexibility is not just an example of what Clifford (1992, 99) calls “stranger talk” but is rooted in the context of Jamaican culture. Speech, like culture, is neither static nor rigid. It stems from the experience of the speaker and varies according to the situation (Richardson 1989, 150).

Like Jamaican culture, speech repertoires are located on a “postcreole continuum...a graded continuum of variation” that ranges from Jamaica creole —
patois, to Caribbean English (Alleyne 1985, 157). Caribbean English is derived from Standard English (British style) in the same way that American and Canadian English were (Nettleford 1979). Caribbean English differs from other forms of English mainly in its pronunciation. Linguist Frederick Cassidy's study concluded that Jamaican “educated” speech is distinct in its

pattern of intonation and accentuation that is often very different from the levelness of many Americans, on the one hand, or the hilliness of many Englishmen on the other. Jamaican speech is more accented: it goes up and down more frequently, and by sharper rises and falls. In short, it has a decided and characteristic lilt (Cassidy 1961, 26).

Cassidy goes on to describe patois as

the inherited talk of peasant and labourer, largely unaffected by education and its standards. This is what the linguist calls “creolized” English, that is, an English learned incompletely in slave days, with a strong infusion of African influences (Cassidy 1961, 2).

Patois is a dynamic and innovative language and from my own field experience I have found that it is spoken and understood to a greater or lesser extent across class lines.

Caribbean English is also spoken and understood across the continuum according to education, amount of contact with tourists and travel experience.

This discussion of language demonstrates that Treasure Beach had global connections long before commodification of its culture and landscape began on an international scale. In Chapter One I have examined the concept of commodification through Western images of exotic places and people, and mapped out the routes of the dissertation. I introduced the concept of post-tourism and its two forms in Jamaica, mainstream and alternative. Treasure Beach, as the site of alternative post-tourism,
possesses its own unique identity which is experienced not only locally, but influenced by Jamaican national imperatives and a transnational African-American identity. In my discussion of ethnography I situated myself in the “field” and emphasized Treasure Beach’s extra-local context. I begin Chapter Two by heeding Clifford’s (1992, 99-100) admonition to avoid separating “being there [in the field]” from “getting there” through a first person narrative of my arrival in Jamaica. My interpretation of Montego Bay’s landscape expands into a discussion of the concept of sustainability, Jamaican identity, tourism and textual analysis.
CHAPTER TWO
GETTING THERE

On the morning of December 30 1993, my Air Jamaica flight begins its descent toward Sangster International Airport in Montego Bay. Although diminished in extent and quality, the coral heads described by a 1910 guidebook as “remarkable marine gardens” are clearly visible from the air as we make our approach (Aspinall 1910, 122). The airport occupies a marine terrace that once provided level land for sugar cultivation and now serves as a platform for the arrival of the vast majority of Jamaica’s most important late twentieth century cash crop — foreign tourists. In my choice of entrepot, I am a typical tourist. Sangster Airport, the presence of which helped spark mass tourism in Jamaica in the 1960s is the point of arrival for over eighty percent of visitors to the island (Baker 1996, 362).

In other ways, I am not a typical tourist. I come to Jamaica for the first time, and like any tourist I have images in my head of what to expect. But my study of old guide books forms my images of Jamaica. I know and love the older forms of Jamaican popular music — mento, ska, rock steady, and reggae. But I have no taste for the new forms with their often violent and sexist lyrics — D.J., dub and dance hall. I know the symbols. But I lack the experience. I study tourism and there is often a blurred line between tourist and researcher (Crick 1985; Van den Berghe 1994). So, I come disguised as a tourist seeking a best case scenario in tourism. But Richard Butler’s (1980; 1991; 1992; 1997) destination life cycle of inexorable birth, maturity
and death for any place that is the object of the tourist gaze always lurks in the back of my mind.

As the plane lands, passengers glimpse the decaying remains of 1950s era propeller craft, which combined with the vibrant green of the hills beyond, enhances the exotic tingle of arriving at a “third world” tropical destination. We all have the expectation that this place will be different from everyday life.

The ground crew wheels the stairway across the runway into place at the side of the aircraft and an American woman waiting to deplane in front of me comments on the scene, “I feel like I’m entering a time warp.” It is a long, hot walk across the tarmac and through the un-airconditioned, slightly shabby, 1960s style terminal building to customs. As of my last trip in 1997, the government had begun renovation in an effort to improve the image of the most important gateway to the island. Uniformed, female airport attendants lined the way, and when we finally arrived at customs, all of the officials but one were also women. This was my first empirical inkling of the important role women play in the Jamaican economy and the perception in society that women are more reliable and “steady” as employees.

My fellow passengers and I queue up for customs inspection, tourists to one side of the room and Jamaican nationals to the other. We foreigners breeze through customs while Jamaicans are subjected to much closer scrutiny. Avoiding the thirty percent duty on imported consumer goods is both a national sport and an economic necessity. This Air Jamaica flight from Miami is not just a conduit for sun-seeking
tourists, but is also a vital link with the large Jamaican community in South Florida and beyond. Jamaicans who “go a foreign” are expected to “look back” to those they left behind, not only sending money from abroad, but returning with goods that are scarce or expensive on the island. Differential treatment accorded to tourists on one hand, and nationals and residents on the other, is not unique to Jamaica. Indeed, tourists who admit to knowing people on the island — as I found on a later trip to my chagrin — are subjected to much greater scrutiny. Expediting customs procedures for foreigners is only an initiation to a tourism production system designed to shield visitors from the reality of everyday existence in developing countries.

Passengers emerge from customs, pass through a large, well-lit, orderly concourse where non-passengers, meaning poor Jamaicans off the streets of Montego Bay, are prohibited, and confront a seemingly chaotic scene outside the glass doors of the terminal. Friends and relatives crowd the pavement waiting to greet returning Jamaican travelers, and cab drivers lean over the barricades gesturing and shouting, “Where you want to go man? You gotta place to stay?” There is, however, a hierarchical scheme to this anarchy. Tourists staying in all-inclusive resorts are met in the concourse by guides and led off to air conditioned buses waiting behind the mass of people and vehicles in front of the terminal. They are cocooned in their environmental bubble from the very start of their Jamaican experience.

Gleaming white vans labeled JUTA for Jamaican Union of Travelers Association occupy the front rank closest to the terminal entrance. These late-model
Japanese vans are privately owned, but closely regulated by the government. They cater almost exclusively to foreign tourists and are expensive by Jamaican standards. An array of independently operated taxis, many of them Russian-built Ladas, are relegated to the last ranks of taxis in the parking lot. Their clientele consists of Jamaicans and those cost-conscious, adventurous tourists who seek to avoid the tourism system.

My ultimate destination is Treasure Beach, but a Jamaican woman living in Baton Rouge gave me a friend’s address who had a room for rent in “MoBay,” as Montego Bay is called by all Jamaicans and anyone else who has been on the island more than ten minutes. I choose a JUTA van for the five minute ride to the Montego Bay Club (US$10.00), and being the sole passenger in the van, the driver looks me over and asks, “You need some ganja, man”? I politely decline and ask how much he would charge me if I were going directly to Treasure Beach. He considers for a moment and replies, “One hundred-twenty U.S.” I discovered from interviews in Treasure Beach that JUTA fares for the two hour ride should be US$80, and though supposedly regulated, vary from an almost unheard of low fare of US$50 to my US$120 quote. The driver hands me a card and says, “When you ready to go to Treasure Beach, call me and I take you, one hundred U.S.”

We drive down Gloucester Avenue through the tourist strip lined with hotels, shops and restaurants. Burger King and Kentucky Fried Chicken announce their presence with their familiar logos among craft shops, boutiques and duty-free shops.
It seems that more vendors fill the busy street than tourists. Popular Jamaican music, reggae, dub and dance hall, blare from speakers on the street. Posters on walls and buildings in red, green and yellow hues announce “Sumfest!, Reggae Bashment [concert],” and a banner stretched over the street proclaims:

SPRING BREAK ‘94
CHECK DIS OUT
DE MOST IRIE ROCKIN’
NUFF FUNNIN’, SPLASH SUNNIN’
COOL RUNNIN’ ISLAND GETAWAY!
WHERE?
REGGAE LAND
Island Ventures LTD.

Most all-inclusives are outside of town, but a few — Breezes, Jack Tar Village and Fantasy Resort — hunker behind artfully designed security walls interspersed with an occasional old grand dame of MoBay’s heyday as a Caribbean Riviera for the rich and famous. The Casa Blanca Hotel, built in 1924, was the first of the old luxury hotels and hugs the sea next to Doctor’s Cave Beach Club, at one time the most famous private “bathing beach” in the Caribbean (Chapman 1951). The driver lets me off in front of the Montego Bay Club which turns out to be in the heart of the resort district. The old Doctor’s Cave Beach Club is directly across the street flanked by the Casa Blanca Hotel to the left, and Breezes to the right. After years of decline the Casa Blanca, built in 1924, is now restored and reopened as an all-inclusive patronized by tourists with a taste for nostalgia. SuperClubs presents Breezes as a “fun” all-inclusive resort where “the festive sounds of reggae fill the air” (SuperClubs 1997, 77). The resort offers free access to Doctor’s Cave Beach Club — infamous for its exclusion of
blacks until the 1960s (Taylor 1993) — for those who want to mingle with middle-
class Jamaicans. All three establishments present high blank walls to the street. In
fact, on the seaward side of Gloucester Avenue I see no sign of white beaches or the
sparkling Caribbean, just walls.

The preceding passage raises several themes I address throughout this
dissertation. I booked a ticket, arrived by airplane, went through customs and rode in a
taxi. These are all elements of the tourism production system. The informal sector
came to the fore when my driver offered to sell me drugs and take me to Treasure
Beach at half again the official fare. Vendors in the street are a constant reminder of
the informal sector. I entered the informal sector when I rented a room in a private
apartment rather than the Casa Blanca Beach Club, as it is now called. The continuing
role of the white elite is symbolized by Spring break at Reggaeland. Island Ventures
LTD. is owned by Chris Blackwell, a wealthy white Jamaican, whose Island Records
studios introduced Bob Marley and the Wailers to the world, and who now runs a
chain of small, but very exclusive resorts. The passage also touches upon other themes
I will address including gender roles, privatization of common resources, the color bar
enforced in the past at Doctor’s Cave Beach, and the Jamaican diaspora.

The landscape of Montego Bay symbolizes change. This gateway to Jamaica
was also the country’s first major resort. I chronicle the evolution of tourism in
Jamaica and the role of Montego Bay in Chapter Three, but a reading of the landscape
evokes four topics I discuss in the this chapter. Changing tides of tourism and taste
have washed over Montego Bay and Jamaica leaving their relics to be recycled into something new or abandoned like the derelict plane on the runway. The Casa Blanca Hotel, now an all-inclusive “beach club” symbolizes the ability of the Jamaican tourism production system to adapt to changing consumer tastes that emphasize difference and nostalgia for the past. The ability, or inability, to adapt and change gives rise to the question of sustainability. Is sustainability possible, or will tourism always lead to overdevelopment and the destruction of the very resources that make places unique?

Burger King and Kentucky Fried Chicken demonstrate the penetration of global capital and culture to the periphery, while the poster advertising spring break at Reggaeland represents the worldwide popularization of Jamaican culture. The colors red, yellow and green are omnipresent in the Jamaican cultural landscape. They are the colors of the Ethiopian flag, not the Jamaican banner. Yet, these colors have come to be identified with Jamaica and represent a transnational affiliation with “blackness” and Afrocentricity. Places like Breezes use elements of Jamaican culture as a means to make their product distinctive. How did this identity arise and does tourism bear the seeds of cultural hegemony?

Montego Bay is a postmodern landscape; the old juxtaposed with the new, wealthy white Jamaicans promoting messages of black resistance, young Floridians nuff funnin’ and splash sunnin’ while Jamaicans eat the Colonel’s chicken, the First World imitates the Third World, while the Third World imitates the First. What are
the theoretical ties between postmodern consumption, and the two currents of post-tourism?

Finally, this interpretation of the landscape as a text is related to my use of guidebooks in Chapter Three as “guides” to images of Jamaican landscape and culture. Landscapes reveal the history, ideology and social practices of those who shaped them (Cosgrove 1984; Lowenthal 1985). Similarly, these images trace the development of tourism in Jamaica and the ideology of those who created them. Chapter Two ends with a discuss of textual analysis as a means of interpretation.

Sustainable Tourism

The concept of sustainable tourism grew out of disillusionment with growth-oriented mainstream development theory (Wall 1997; Mowforth and Munt 1998). Walter Rostow (1960) used the term modernization theory when he first articulated his version of mainstream development under the title The Stages of Economic Growth: A Non-Communist Manifesto. The title reveals the obvious ideological implications of his work in the context of the Cold War and the perceived struggle for the hearts and minds of “underdeveloped” nations. Modernization theory links poverty with adherence to “traditional” economic practices and lifestyles. Mainstream Western economists urged Third World countries to emulate the West and adopt free market policies and technical innovations (Isbister 1991). In its mature stage, the benefits of modernization would eventually filter down to the masses (Sachs 1992).

Modernization theory applied to tourism as a tool for development favored large-scale
Marxist-oriented dependency theorists argue that the capitalist world system caused poverty in the Third World by exploiting human and natural resources in the periphery, and siphoning off profits to the industrialized core countries (Frank 1969; Gilbert 1985). Local elites benefit over the disadvantaged and the poor, thus widening the already skewed distribution of wealth. Economic dependency is simply another form of colonialism and leads to political and cultural dependency (Rist 1990). Many observers view mass tourism as a form of neocolonialism which leads to dependency and benefits only local elites and multinational corporations (Britton 1982; Nash 1989). Dependency theory is a powerful critique of modernization theory, but offered few alternatives — Michael Manley’s experiment in Jamaica is an exception I discuss in Chapter Three — beyond state socialism as it was practiced in the Eastern Bloc, China and Cuba (Isbister 1991).

In 1976 UNESCO and the World Bank summoned an international group of academicians, government officials and industry representatives to Washington, D.C. to assess the socio-cultural impact of tourism in the Third World. A volume emerged from this seminar entitled Tourism: Passport to Development? (de Kadt 1979). The link between tourism and mainstream development theory as articulated by the academic community, the state, and private capital is evident from the title of the report. The ambiguous punctuation in the title expresses the participants’ growing
disenchantment with the results of both mainstream development theory and mass
tourism.

The Brundtland Report, entitled Our Common Future and commissioned by the
World Commission on Environment and Development (1987), coined the term
sustainable development to describe “development which meets the needs of the
present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own
needs” (quoted in Mowforth and Munt 1998, 24). The report did not mention tourism,
but advocated economic growth that was equitable, culturally sensitive and
environmentally friendly (Butler 1991; Merchant 1992). Tourism marketers and
researchers were quick to jump on the “sustainability bandwagon” (Garrod and Fyall
1998). While the image-makers made sure that their tourism product was labeled
sustainable, researchers engaged in endless debate over the meanings and utility of
sustainable tourism: is it “rhetoric or reality?” (McKercher 1993; Cater 1994, 5;
Hughes 1995). Returning to the core idea of sustainable development, do these two
words “sustainable” and “development” constitute an oxymoron? Plog (1972, 4)
placed this question in the context of tourism:

Destination areas carry with them potential seeds of their own
destruction, as they allow themselves to become more commercialized
and lose their qualities which originally attracted tourists.

Richard Butler’s cycle is the most widely cited model of tourism development
in the literature (Alburquerque and McElroy 1992). Butler is also the most prominent
critic of sustainable, alternative and “new” tourisms. He derived his “cycle of

41
evolution” for tourist resorts from Christaller’s (1963) spatial analysis of “tourist haunts” in the Mediterranean, long before sustainability became an issue in tourism (Butler 1980). According to Butler, resorts evolve in six stages. During the exploration stage very few tourists visit the site, and they use local facilities. They make their own travel arrangement and “are attracted to the area by its unique or considerably different natural and cultural features.” Tourists interact frequently with local residents but daily life is “unchanged” (1980, 7).

Increasing numbers of visitors will prompt some local residents to enter the involvement stage as they provide facilities “primarily or even exclusively for visitors.” Interaction will remain high and increase for those now involved in the evolving tourist trade. Advertising begins to appear and the local authorities may make infrastructural improvements. A specific tourist season emerges and “adjustments will be made in the social pattern of at least those local residents involved in tourism” (1980, 6). Relatively slow growth characterizes these first two stages.

Butler’s development stage is aptly named. He predicts a sharp decline in local involvement and control as numbers of tourists rapidly increase. External control replaces local ownership and facilities for tourism increase in number and size. The original “natural and cultural” attractions are commercialized and “supplemented by man-made facilities.” As the landscape changes and tourists in peak season outnumber the original inhabitants, local residents may begin to resent the changes caused by the
industry. National and regional agencies will take control of planning, and a larger cross-section tourists visit the area.

The consolidation stage marks the beginning of the end for the tourist destination. Tourism is the most important economic activity in the region and images of the resort and its attractions are broadcast far afield. Although the number of tourists is still increasing, the rate of increase declines. Local residents are now swamped with tourists and express their discontent. Major hotel chains and food franchises are now present, but few will be added. Resort cities will have well-defined tourist districts which are often separate from the old Central Business District. Older facilities, like the Casa Blanca in MoBay, are considered “second rate.”

Butler’s last two stages almost speak for themselves: stagnation and decline. Mass tourism characterizes the stagnation stage and the number of visitors reaches a plateau. Tourism reaches the saturation point, exacerbating “environmental, social and economic problems” (1980, 8). “Artificial” attractions will supplant the original natural and cultural features. Any new development will occur on the outskirts of the older resort district and existing hotel will change ownership frequently. In spite of its “well-established image” the resort is no longer fashionable and can no longer compete with newer destinations. As the number of visitors decreases, the resort slips into decline. Hotels and other facilities sit empty or are converted to other uses, such as nursing homes or cheap apartments. “Ultimately, the area may become a veritable tourist slum or lose its function completely (1980, 9).
Butler holds out the hope of possible rejuvenation. This rebirth, however, "will never be reached without a complete change of the attractions" (1980, 9). He cites Atlantic City's success in arresting decline by adopting Casino gambling as a new attraction. Miami Beach, however, he believed doomed to decline and decay (Butler 1980, 9). Butler, of course was wrong about Miami Beach. This venerable resort rejuvenated itself by tapping into its own past rather than adopting a new attraction. A new generation of tourists who possess a sense of nostalgia for the past view Miami's Art Deco landscape as a heritage product (Hewison 1987). Miami's past grandeur as a tourist resort and its present multicultural flavor have become objects of the tourist gaze because both the architecture and blend of cultures in Miami possess a very distinctive sense of style. As images of these aspects of Miami began to circulate, a new identity emerged. The city rejuvenated its tourism industry by reinventing itself, not by bringing in another attraction.

The Reinvention of Jamaican Identity

Every human identity is constructed, historical; every one has its share of false presuppositions, of errors and inaccuracies...invented histories, invented biologies, invented cultural affinities come with every identity (Appiah 1992,174).

Human identity, individual and collective, is inextricably bound up with place and culture. Like cultural geography, identity is constituted on a variety of scales: individual, local regional and national. Identity in Treasure Beach is experienced not only locally, but is also influenced by Jamaican national imperatives and a transnational African-American identity.
As Appiah wrote, “Every human identity is constructed,” especially those that function above the scale of a specific place or region. Identities constructed around nationality and race are susceptible to ideological manipulation (Hobsbawm and Ranger 1983). Edward Said (1978, 7) demonstrated in Orientalism how Europeans invented their own identity as a superior culture in opposition to “All the non-European cultures and peoples” in order to maintain and extend global hegemony.

In the postcolonial period, Jamaica and other societies in the Americas and Africa exploited by colonialism and slavery have shifted toward an identity based on “blackness” or negritude (Cesaire 1984 [1956]), in opposition to the identity imposed on them by Europeans (Nettleford 1979; Gray 1991). Many of the Caribbean’s most brilliant intellectuals — C.L.R. James (1984), Edward Brathwaite (1971), M.G.Smith (1965) — argued that West Indian identity and society could be portrayed through Marxism, creolization, or separate plural societies. The construction of a black identity began at the “grass roots” with Marcus Garvey’s black nationalist movement in the 1920s and labor riots in 1938. Rastafarianism, founded in 1930, looked to Africa as symbolized in the person of Haile Selassie I and set in opposition against Babylon representing the colonial establishment and the middle class (Nettleford 1970).

The North American strain in the form of Black Power was introduced to Jamaica by Walter Rodney, a Guyanese lecturer in African history at the University of the West Indies at Mona. In 1968, the same year Rodney began and ended his tenure
at UWI, the Jamaican Labour Party government under Hugh Shearer banned the writings of Malcom X and Stokely Carmichael for their “racist” content and seized “undesirable literature” form several Rastafarian offices (Gray 1991, 149). Rodney related his teaching of African history to the experience of blacks in Jamaica and the struggle of American blacks against racism.

Rodney was expressing an idea already held by the Rastafarians: that blacks in Jamaica had an African heritage and could find, in an undistorted African history, knowledge which could be used to recover their own history in diaspora (Gray 1991, 152).

As his lectures gained popularity among students and faculty at UWI, Rodney urged his listeners to forge links with the masses and established contacts with Rastafarian leaders in Kingston. In spite of a 1960 UWI report on Rastafarianism exonerating the movement from many of the excesses attributed to them by the press and public, the government was deeply suspicious of a possible alliance between the Rastas and the incipient Black Power movement (Nettleford 1970). Rodney’s activism earned him the ire of the Shearer government and he was declared persona non grata upon his return from a conference in New York (Gray 1991). UWI students and faculty organized a peaceful protest against Rodney’s firing which resulted in rioting by the discontented unemployed of Kingston (Chevannes 1990; Gray 1991). The “Rodney Affair” has been widely recognized as a melding of the interests of an Afrocentric millenarian religious movement, the intellectual Afrocentrism of the Black Power Movement and the working class (Chevannes 1991; Gray 1990; Nettleford 1979).
In the wake of this protest, a process evolved that Rex Nettleford calls “the proletarianisation of culture” (1979, 49). After the Rastafari were cleared of accusations of hooliganism and criminality — excepting their sacramental use of marijuana (ganja) — by a University of West Indies report in 1960, they began to gain acceptance among the Jamaican middle class (Chevannes 1990; Lewis 1993).

In close association with Rastafarianism, but with popular roots in the earlier forms of rock steady and ska, reggae music found international acclaim and continues to be a force in popular music worldwide. International recognition of reggae stars Jimmy Cliff, Peter Tosh and Bob Marley silenced all middle-class criticism and opened the way for even greater identification. . . . with the African reference point than the European (Chevannes 1990, 79).

Despite the comparatively rapid expansion of social mobility since World War II, a tiny, mostly white elite still occupies the apex of the economic and social pyramid (Beckford, 1980; R.T. Smith 1988). Nonetheless, the Jamaican national identity now looks to perceived African roots in both folk and popular culture (Nettleford 1979). In her aptly entitled article “Reggae, Rastafarianism and Cultural Identity,” Verena Reckford (1982, 79) writes of Reggae performers:

Even though they voice their love for Jamaica, in a spiritually significant sense they sing more of oneness with the black people of the world which gives the music a strong universal identity as well.

Perhaps it is this “oneness with the black people of the world” that Paul Gilroy (1994) refers to when he speaks of an identity or consciousness that envelopes “the black
Atlantic world.” Reggae and Rastafarianism spread throughout this world and beyond into “white” North America and Europe, bringing a message of resistance and respect without losing an identification with blackness (Jones 1988; Lewis 1993; Gilroy 1994; Manuel 1995).

The message was spread at first by Jamaican communities abroad, in places like Central America, Toronto, and the English Midlands (Jones 1988) and then more widely disseminated by media—in postmodern terms, part of the globalized system of cultural reproduction. Austin (1983, 235) offers an addendum:

Rasta and reggae have become marketable national commodities co-opted by a middle class intellectual elite and by Jamaica’s entrepreneurs.

Tourism and Dependency

The consumers of these cultural commodities include tourists and tourism is by far the most important industry in Jamaica and the other West Indian islands that share this culture of resistance. To Hell with Paradise: A History of the Jamaican Tourist Industry by Jamaican historian Frank Fonda Taylor (1993) expresses a view of tourism shared by many of his fellow islanders and academics. Taylor (1993, 194) included a poem by Norman Palmer published in 1912 entitled “De Tourist” in the appendix of his book:

Dey’s a pile a’millionaire!
Massy bra, dem nuf dis ‘ear.
Ebery one bring motor car
Fe dribe when dem want go far,
You tink tourist no hab money?
Top me massa, you too funny.
The Jamaican Tourist Board reported that in 1997 a record 1.9 million tourists followed in the wake of Columbus to the island of Jamaica seeking their own version of terrestrial paradise (World Trade Organization 1999). According to the same report issued by the WTO, the tourist sector is the largest single source of foreign exchange earning 45% of foreign exchange receipts, about US$1.13 billion total. Carl Stone, a Jamaican sociologist and pollster, surveyed a cross-section of people in the three most important North Coast resort towns: Montego Bay, Negril and Ocho Rios, as to their opinion of tourism. He found that 66% of those not employed in the tourist industry thought it was beneficial, but “grass roots criticisms of the industry tend therefore to centre on who gets what” (quoted in Patullo 1996, 73-74).

Jamaica is clearly economically dependent on tourism. In the case of the Caribbean, identification of tourism with cultural dependency is more problematic. Given its long legacy of economic and political domination by Europe and North America; the annihilation of Native Americans and the subsequent forced recolonization by African slaves; and radical transformations of the landscape to produce tropical staple crops (Richardson 1992), cultural dependence—if not hegemony—would seem inevitable (Britton 1982; Hiller 1976).

Erisman (1983) suggests ways in which economic and political dependency could lead to cultural dependency through tourism. In this scenario the “entire lifestyle: of the metropolitan state is regarded as a “model to be faithfully emulated” and is widely adopted by the citizens of the dependent state. Consequently, the
inhabitants “have little or no desire to maintain a distinct national identity,” and their “hearts and minds” are dominated by the metropole (1983, 345). Erisman discusses four theories in which tourism could be a factor in this process: (1) the “Trickle Down” effect, where the local elite adopts a foreign culture from tourists and is emulated by the masses; (2) “Commodization,” meaning the appropriation and transformation of the entire island and its culture by the tourist industry; (3) the “Mass Seduction Theory” whereby the high visibility of tourists attracts the inhabitants to a lifestyle of conspicuous consumption alienating them from their own cultural identity; and (4) the “Black Servility Theory” in which the locals lose their self esteem by performing low-status, menial services for tourists (1983, 350-357). Larger islands like Jamaica may not fit this model of cultural dependency. Jamaica receives only one tourist for every two local residents, and most of these are sequestered in peripheral tourist enclaves. St. Martin, on the other hand receives twenty-four tourists for each local, making it far more susceptible to the “Mass Seduction: and “Commodization” theories. The “Trickle Down” and “Black Servility” theories are rendered less plausible in the case of Jamaica because of its history of resistance to racism and a strong nationalist movement that includes some segments of the elite (Erisman 1983; Richardson 1992).

Postmodernism and Commodification of Culture

My object here is not to present a primer on postmodernism, but I hope to clarify some of the terms and concepts I use in this dissertation. Postmodernism as an
epoch, rather than as an architectural style or epistemology, grew out of the “anti-modern” or countercultural movements of the late 1960s and the global economic crisis of 1973-75 (Dear 1986). This recession is widely theorized to have marked a structural shift in the global economy from Fordist capitalism to flexible production and accumulation (Harvey 1989; Albertson 1988; Harvey 1987). Fordist production is based on mass-producing standardized goods, like the Model A Ford and its successors. The shift to flexible production began as the economic crisis of the early 1970s forced companies and whole national economies to decentralize production and develop the ability to respond rapidly to changes in consumer demands. Flexible accumulation implies a widespread shift from consumption of manufactured goods to consumption of services and cultural goods (Harvey 1989).

The institutionalization of postmodernism in culture and social practice has been linked with this economic shift (Albertson 1988; Harvey 1987; Knox 1987). Use of the term postmodernism — and the prefix “post” appended to any concept for that matter — has been criticized for implying a distinct “rupture” with what came before (Matless 1992; Thrift 1991). Matless (1992, 41) has suggested that the word postmodernism is “all used up” (1992, 41). However, even critics of “postmodernity” like David Harvey (1991, 263)

    cannot help but be impressed at the way in which a whole world of thought and cultural practice, of economy and institutions, of politics and ways of relating, began to crumble as we watched the dust explode upwards and the walls of Pruitt-Igoe come crashing down.

51

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
Pruitt-Igoe was a massive housing project in St. Louis built in modernist style which failed to meet the individual needs of its inhabitants. Its demolition symbolized for many the fall of modernity.

The terms production, consumption and commodification when applied to concepts like place and identity, and set within the context of tourism as "an international social fact" imply a close connection between capitalism, culture and social practice (Lanfant and Graburn 1992). Orthodox Marxism positions the mode of production — capitalism in the case of most of the world now — as the determining basis of social relations (Kamenka 1983). Marxism denies any variation from place to place, class relations alone determine cultural and social practices. Stuart Hall (1988, 45) however, cautioned that "class is not the only determinant of social interest (e.g., gender, race)." Culture, individual agency and — especially in case of Treasure Beach — locality could be added to Hall's examples of gender and race as noneconomic factors that influence social relations. Nigel Thrift (1994, 212) criticizes Marxist-inspired theory for its failure to recognize local and regional differences:

Differences between regions can become economic opportunities precisely because of their differences, as the growth of the modern capitalist tourist industry eloquently suggests.

It is this difference as experienced through culture and landscape that draws visitors to Treasure Beach and Jamaica, and is bought and sold as a product — commodified. Henri Lefebvre (1976) views the commodification of space as part of a dialectical struggle between the center as the seat of modernity, and the peripheral-sphere of
everyday life. In spite of this drive toward the elimination of difference, Lefebvre believes that everyday life has the potential to become a site of resistance to homogeneity:

Everyday life is certainly not immutable and even modernity will modify it; but it affirms itself as the place of continuity... (quoted in Gregory 1994, 402).

David Harvey (1989, 285) sees this “rapid capitalist penetration” into the cultural realm as global phenomenon driven by time-space compression; part of a transition in late capitalism from Fordist mass production to a system of flexible accumulation. A resulting “crisis of overaccumulation”, meaning a surplus of mass-produced undifferentiated goods, leads to an accelerated search for new, ever more ephemeral commodities. As the marketing of product images that appeal to specific tastes, lifestyles and identities intensifies, “the image of places and spaces becomes as open to production as any other” (Harvey 1989, 293).

The tourist as a consumer purchases not only goods and services but an experience that also serves as an indicator of taste, life-style and status — the experience becomes a form of symbolic capital (Britton 1991). In the context of modern France, Bourdieu (1984) addressed the increasing differentiation in cultural production as a means of using symbolic capital to reinforce group stratification. Distinctive life style choices are consistent with the habitus of a given group or class. Habitus is a system of dispositions that bear a recursive relationship with wider structures (Bourdieu 1984). In other words, people are disposed to choose objects and
practices according to a system that enhances their status within in their own social
group and differentiates them from others. These objects and experiences are forms
of cultural or symbolic capital that give people "a sense of place in their world" (King
service class, as being more eclectic in their pursuit of symbolic capital and more
drawn to commodities exhibiting novelty, pastiche, nostalgia and pleasure. They tend
to reject products they perceive as mass produced and are the ideal consumers of a new
"post-Fordist" tourism being marketed in Jamaica, and elsewhere.

Tourism — more specifically the tourist production system (Britton 1991) —
and related commercial ventures like shopping malls, theme parks, world's fairs and
gentrification projects are especially adept at commodifying local identity or sense of
place (Ley and Olds 1988; Mills 1988; Shields 1989; Zukin 1991; Sorkin 1992). The
process of commodification transforms "landscapes, social practices, buildings
residents, symbols and meanings" into images of themselves for consumption by
outsiders (Britton 1991, 462). All-inclusive resorts closely resemble these "spaces of
representation" in that the management is able to exercise social control by keeping
out unwanted outsiders — loiterers in the case of Edmonton Mall, and indeed, most
Jamaicans in the case of all-inclusives (Shields 1989). For guests staying at the
Sandals resort, "Jamaica-Jamaica," the "self-conscious production of the imaginary
landscape" may very well be all they will see of the "real" Jamaica (Zukin 1991, 231).
The repetition of the resort's "Jamaica-Jamaica" name implies a hyper-Jamaica; a

54

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
postmodern space more real to the guests than the down-at-the-heels city beyond the wall.

Auliana Poon (1990, 113), a research economist for the Caribbean Tourist Organization with a fondness for acronyms, praised these constructed places for pioneering the switch from the Keynesian model of "mass, standardized and rigidly packaged (MSRP) tourism" to "a tourism driven by flexibility, segmentation and diagonal integration (FSDI)." Superclubs cater to "DINKS" (dual income no kids) and "yuppies" and commodify not only Jamaica, but "a complete lifestyle" (1990, 114).

The Superclub chain has achieved a year-round occupancy rate of more than 90 percent, compared to the Jamaican national average of 67.9 percent (Poon 1990, 116).

The success of all-inclusives in Jamaica sparked a worldwide trend towards self-contained resort hotels. These hotel enclaves are set in lush gardens and designed with reference to the local culture and landscape. Ayala (1991) points out the increasing importance of hotel grounds to "destination resorts that seek to offer a comprehensive itinerary for the entire vacation... The enhancement of pleasure, luxury, and discovery has wrapped many hotels in botanical splendor" (1991, 581). Many of the all-inclusives in Jamaica were originally built in the heyday of upper class Anglo-American tourism allowing the management to combine "botanical splendor" with historical references. Ayala (1991, 573-4) describes this process of marketing resort landscapes:
The same historical or natural raw materials can be processed through interpretation — selection, packaging, and presentation — in different ways to produce a variety of different heritage products.

On the other hand, Kermath and Thomas's (1992) study on all-inclusive resorts in the Dominican Republic and Jamaica found that the trend to exclude the local community from tourist tends to increase hostility toward tourists. These resort complexes were usually located on the periphery of the islands far from the major centers of population. It would seem that in spite of references to local "color," the management would prefer their guests to view it from a safe distance.

A study on the Luperon Resort in the Dominican Republic (Freitag 1994) found that enclave tourism did little to promote secondary economic growth in the local community and recommended that regional fishing and farming cooperatives be formed to help supply all-inclusive resorts and to encourage local participation in the tourist industry. Freitag also noted that when given the opportunity, even these "organized mass tourists" would interact with local residents. For example, when local artisans set up stands on the beach just outside the resort boundary, guests responded enthusiastically.

Alternative Post-tourism

Stephen Britton (1991, 456) identified another type of tourist who "consciously attempts to avoid the formal tourism production system by selecting their own itinerary, accommodation, and transport" (1991, 456). Small-scale, low impact, "green," sustainable, new, or alternative tourism has received increased attention from
social scientists because of the tendency of large-scale resorts to become less desirable for both tourists and residents as the result of overdevelopment, loss of local control, and environmental degradation (Butler 1980; Britton 1982).

Jameson (1984) associates commodification of culture with a resultant superficiality, depthlessness, and loss of meaning. Ironically, the "authentic" identity of places that alternative tourists so avidly seek to experience can be completely drained of meaning for the inhabitants and visitors alike (Greenwood 1989), or replaced by staged experiences reflecting images that ought to appear before the eyes of the beholders (MacCannell 1976). Alternative tourists with their "romantic" as opposed to "collective" gaze are more sensitive to the problem of inauthenticity than mainstream tourists (Urry 1990, 140). Once these places have become "inauthentic," alternative tourists then move on to other peripheral places and leave the sites they have consumed to other, less discriminating tourists (Butler 1980).

A more optimistic interpretation of the process is succinctly presented by Erik Cohen (1988, 383):

Commoditization does not necessarily destroy the meaning of cultural products, neither for the locals or for the tourists, although it may do so under certain conditions. Tourist-oriented products frequently acquire new meanings for the locals as they become a diacritical mark of their ethnic or cultural identity, a vehicle of self-representation before an external public.

In his critique of "small scale alternative" tourism, geographer Richard Butler (1992) argues that it may not be an alternative form at all, but simply a stage in the resort cycle leading to mass tourism. Macnaught's (1982) study on the impact of mass
tourism and modernization on small island nations seems to concur with Butler's cycle. He suggested three stages of tourism in the: 1) a discovery stage when the first tourists arrive and adapt to the existing conditions; 2) a second stage in which modest facilities are developed by local people who interact on a personal basis with tourists; and 3) an institutionalized stage that when the area is absorbed into a system of international tourism.

Pearce (1992) suggests that mainstream and alternative forms of tourism may be complementary. He concludes his review of alternative tourism with the statement "that a variety of different forms of tourism" are appropriate for developing countries and urges that geographers develop "a better understanding of these many possible forms" (Pearce 1992, 30).

Boracay Island in the Philippines has had little success with alternative tourism (Smith 1989). The lack of sewage disposal and water treatment within the tourism sphere has caused serious environmental problems and tourism has "dramatically changed the traditional social structure" (Smith 1989, 151). Boracay's fame as tourist destination rests entirely on its beach and surf and not on the cultural identity of its people. As Smith points out, there are seven thousand islands in the Philippines, many of them with equally fine beaches. The surfers could easily colonize another island leaving their mess behind.

Pierre van den Bergher's *The Quest for the Other: Ethnic Tourism in San Cristobal Mexico* (1994) is one of the most thoughtful and comprehensive
ethnographic studies of small scale tourism. He recognizes the “great irony of ethnic
tourism” in that it threatens to destroy or alter the authenticity it embraces (1994, 9).
Yet, van den Bergher ends his book with a plea to the people of San Cristobal to reject
the allure of mass tourism. Although highland Mayan culture was indeed
 commodified, the interest of foreign tourists raised their status in the eyes of their
Ladino neighbors. Most of the profits from tourism stayed in the local economy and
although the benefits were inequitably distributed, tourist dollars did trickle down and
circulate among the Indians as well as the Ladino population.

Gender and Tourism

Tourism has differential effects according to gender as well as ethnicity. Swain
(1989) found that tourism and the mola trade among the Kuna people of Panama
helped insure their cultural survival and local autonomy. Swain argues that the Kuna
have benefitted from tourism because “tourism based on the group’s land and cultural
identity” was firmly under local control. At the same time, the mola trade expanded
women’s gender options and gave them a dependable source of income while it
benefitted the group’s project of maintaining local control of tourism (Swain 1989, 85).

Momsen (1994) examined tourism and changing gender roles in the Caribbean.
She found that on Barbados, even though women formed a majority of workers in the
formal hotel industry, men were more likely to receive training and there was little
opportunity for them women to advance. In the informal sector, in contrast, women
found more opportunities in crafts, selling home-produced food and especially in running informal guest houses. Momsen's study is particularly applicable to Treasure Beach because of the large number of guest houses and small businesses run by women.

The literature on sex tourism has largely dealt with Western or Japanese males exploiting women in developing countries, especially Southeast Asia (Truong 1990; Hall 1994), and more recently Cuba (O'Connell Davidson 1996). A consistent theme equates sex tourism with colonial subjugation and theorizes tourism in general as a masculine-gendered activity which is itself a form of prostitution (Graburn 1983; Hall 1994). Researchers have paid much less attention to relationships between foreign women and local men (Pruitt and LaFont 1995; Craik 1997). Norris and Wall (1994, 73) pose the question, “is there a demand for male sexual services in the tourist destinations in the Third World?” The 1998 movie “How Stella Gets Her Groove Back,” seems to be an affirmative reply in the case of Jamaica. Stella, played by Angela Bassett, is a forty year-old African American stockbroker who goes to Jamaica seeking a romantic interlude. Her case is unusual in that her twenty year-old Jamaican lover is a medical student. Her relationship, however, is not unusual in that it is difficult to characterize this exchange as prostitution, and her interest in Winston, played by Taye Diggs, is more than sexual.

Opperman (1999) criticizes the narrow view of sex tourism taken by most researchers and points out that often these encounters take place without a direct
exchange of sex for money. He argues that there is a continuum of intimate relationships between tourists and locals, with both men and women participating as “sex seekers and sex providers” (1999, 261). This continuum ranges from short-term encounters exchanging sex for money to long-term relationships and marriage.

Pruitt and LaFont’s (1995) study of “romance tourism” in Jamaica is especially applicable to my work. It focuses on relationships between “Euro-American” women and Jamaican men. Women assumed unaccustomed gender role in providing economically for their Jamaican boyfriends, often bringing them back to their home countries. She makes a distinction between romance tourism as it is practiced in Jamaica and sex tourism in Thailand. Pruitt and LaFont assert that “these liaisons are constructed through a discourse of romance and long-term relationship, an emotional involvement usually not present in sex tourism (1995, 423). The question of who is exploiting whom is blurred. If the relationship does become long-term, difficulties often ensue because of differing culturally-based gender roles. Dependence on foreign women, especially in the women’s home society, often leads to resentment and sometimes violence on the part of the Jamaican men because of a perceived imbalance of power. Pruitt and LaFont (1995, 435) quote the following popular Jamaican song by Shabba Ranks:

Me, me, no woman can rule me.  
Now me is a man and me have me woman.  
But if she try to rule me, me have contention.  
She could get a broke foot or broke hand.  
And me rule she, she no rule me.  
If me tell her say A, she can’t tell me B.
Images, Landscape and Texts

Geographers James and Nancy Duncan (1992, 20) have called attention to Roland Barthe’s essay, “The Blue Guide” as an example of:

landscape interpretation in which he analyzes both the mythology surrounding travel and the claim of the travel guide to be a primary tool of landscape appreciation and an essential bourgeois educational aid to vision and cultural awareness. Instead, Barthes argues, the travel guide functions as “an agent of blindness” that focuses the travelers’s attention on a limited range of landscape features, thereby “overpowering” or even “masking” the “real” spectacle of human life and history.

I have chosen travel guides written specifically for tourists from what Stephan Greenblatt (1991, 6) calls “a stockpile of representations” in order to place these changing images of landscape and culture in historical context. This history of tourist images of Jamaica is a genealogy in that guides are produced by tourist experiences; these experiences are in turn reproduced by other tourists (see Matless on Foucault 1992). In some cases the authors explicitly acknowledge their predecessors.

Because of the subjective nature of interpreting literary sources and landscapes as texts, it seems appropriate to turn to the constructs and methodology of critical social theory as it was expressed in a 1988 article by James and Nancy Duncan. “(Re)reading the Landscape” proposes that the key to an understanding of “the role of landscape in social process ... may lie in the intersection of literary theory arid social theory” (1988, 117). Contemporary literary critics do not accept any written text as having a single “innocent” meaning. Texts contain multiple meanings that can be discovered by reading deeply into the structure of the text and reinterpreting it. In
terms of reading landscapes, the Duncans advocate moving beyond a search for a "deep structure" and fastening instead on the examination of a variety of texts that have become transformed into landscapes (1988, 121). The Duncans consider landscapes as "transformations of social and political ideologies into physical form" (1988, 126). Given that landscape, culture and society are interwoven, and that cultural and societal processes take place in a spatial context, "virtually any landscape can be analyzed as a text in which social relations are inscribed" (1988, 123).

Since landscapes result from cultural practices, dominant ideologies often impose their own mythologies on landscapes. This imposition of a particular landscape within a culture or upon another is termed naturalization — that is, making the imposition of cultural hegemony seem natural. Naturalization may be "accomplished by the application of written texts" or it may be the "unintended result of a set of social practices" (1988, 125). Unlike poststructuralists, the Duncans assert that there is an empirical reality and it is the task of the investigator to denaturalize landscapes where a dominant interpretation is pervasive.

These texts were not selected because they represent a monolithic Western, imperialist, racist, or some other dominant ideology. On the contrary, they exhibit a diversity of views that vary because of the agency of individual authors. The writers are influenced by their experiences in Jamaica, as well as the social and cultural milieu of their home societies. However, the images of culture and landscape produced and reproduced in these texts viewed as a whole are Eurocentric and idealized.
CHAPTER THREE
“GUIDES” TO THE HISTORY OF TOURISM AND DEVELOPMENT IN JAMAICA

In his book which has become the standard text on the geography of Latin America, Preston James wrote:

In places like the Antilles one finds the truly temperate climates of the world. These islands are bathed by currents of warm ocean water and are swept by the easterly trade winds of the open sea. Temperatures are moderately high and vary little from season to season (James and Minkel 1986, 153).

Through travel literature, tourist guides and brochures, the tourist industry and travelers themselves generate representations of the landscape and its inhabitants to their own culture. This chapter examines Western images of the human and natural landscape in Jamaica from 1849 to the present as they are presented in texts designed specifically for tourists. Four premises inform this chapter: 1) the nature of tourism during any given time period reflects the social practices and ideology of the home society and the economic imperatives of the of the host society; 2) trends in Jamaican tourism reflect its dependency on changing development paradigms; 3) texts meant to serve as guides for tourists throughout most of the history of Jamaican tourism have consistently idealized the natural components of the landscape while representations of the culture have been largely negative or nonexistent; and 4) beginning in the 1970s, a shift has taken place in the nature of these representations from a preoccupation with the landscape alone to the construction and consumption of places.
Historical Context

Tourist perceptions of people, landscapes and events differ according to social group, culture and historical period (Urry 1990). I have chosen travel guides written specifically for tourists drawn from a “stockpile of representations,” and I place these changing images of landscape and culture in historical context (Greenblatt 1991, 6). This history of tourist images of Jamaica is a genealogy in that the guides produced by tourist experiences in turn direct subsequent tourists (see Matless on Foucault 1992). In some cases the authors explicitly acknowledge their predecessors.

Jamaican tourism mirrors the development of international leisure travel. Before the mid-nineteenth century, travel for pleasure was restricted to the aristocracy (Feifer 1986). With the spread of the Industrial Revolution and innovations in transportation, travel became accessible to increasing numbers of people in Europe and North America. Until the 1950s, however, travel for leisure overseas remained the prerogative of the wealthy bourgeoisie. Innovations in aviation and post-World War II economic growth marked the arrival of middle-class mass tourism. Elite tourism declined as mass produced package tours expanded their share of the market. The 1970s were a time of crisis and transition for Jamaican tourism. By the mid-1980s the industry had responded by tapping its own cultural roots and entered a new phase I call post-tourism (Feiffer 1986; see also Britton 1991; Urry 1990).

Jamaica has responded and sometimes led in the adoption of, and adaptation to, different styles of tourism. Within the periods I have outlined above, I will map the
parallel paths of tourism and development theories in Jamaica. Richard Peet and Michael Watts (1993) have traced a “genealogy of development” from colonial systems of control, classical imperialism, through post-World War II modernization and growth driven paradigms centered on the state or private capital. The 1980s have seen a lessening of state involvement in development and a shift to neo-liberal, trickle-down, market economics. The failures of mainstream development became more evident as income polarization increased with the massive restructuring required of Third World societies because of the debt crisis (Peet and Watts 1993; Wilbur and Jameson 1988). At the same time, civil society became a focus of interest for academic circles and international funding agencies as alternative strategies emphasizing sustainability and local control began to emerge. In the case of Jamaica and Treasure Beach, this genealogy of development is closely intertwined with that of tourism.

**Victorian Tourists: Health, Progress and Self-improvement**

Victorian bourgeois tourism grew out of the aristocratic tradition of the Grand Tour and visits to spas to take the cure (Curry 1991). In 1841 Thomas Cook launched his first railway tour, the prototype of modern mass tourism (Swinglehurst 1982). Travel in this era was meant to be educational, uplifting and healthy (Feifer 1986). Charles Dickens observed of a group of Victorian tourists in Paris, “many of them carry books of reference and nearly all take notes” (Feifer 1986, 169). The tourist traveled at this time for the good of the mind as well as the body.
Englishman Robert Baird visited the West Indies in 1849 “solely on account, or in pursuit of health” (1850, 14). His Impressions and Experiences of the Indies and North America in 1849 was written from “copious though rough notes” that he kept of his “daily experiences” and then published as a guide for others seeking the healthful climate. In his description of the Jamaican landscape, Baird (1850, 86) records “the impressions and effects it had upon [his] mind.”

To me it appeared (and the image though a plain one, is the only one I can remember which gives my ideas with any sort of accuracy) as if the whole island had at one time been in a boiling state, then suddenly cooled down, when at its point of highest ebullition, and after that split in every possible direction, and the fissures, so formed, clothed with the noblest flowers and foliage to their highest heights and innermost recesses.

Baird’s image is hardly a plain one, and in other passages, he uses terms like “exceeding beauty” and “impetuous torrents.” This is descriptive language in the style of John Ruskin, whom Feifer (1986, 163) cites as having a direct effect on the aesthetic sense of Victorian tourists. Pratt (1992) equates this process of aestheticization with dehumanization of the landscape. Indeed, while Baird describes the charms of the “Creole ladies” — meaning white in this context — and the “distress” of their planter husbands since the abolition of slavery, he omits any mention of the people of color who made up the vast majority of the population, except that by their refusal to remain and work on the plantations, they are ruining the white planters. His racial ideology reflects that of Thomas Carlyle who argued in the December 1849 issue of Fraser’s Magazine “that the blacks, both for their own good
and for that of the empire, must be compelled to work for whatever wages the white plantation owners are able to pay" (Spurr 1993, 66).

Novelist Anthony Trollope (1985) also appreciated the natural landscape of Jamaica, comparing the Blue Mountains to the idealized scenery of Switzerland and the Tyrol, but he took a livelier interest in the people. Trollope arrived in Jamaica in 1859 and is mentioned as an inspiration to Algernon E. Aspinall in the latter's 1910 guidebook. Trollope wryly and sympathetically records his encounters with people of all races. He comments favorably on the “picturesque” provision grounds of the former slaves and the hospitality of their former masters. Trollope evidences a keen interest in the question of race relations. In the manner of eighteenth century naturalists, he classifies Jamaicans into three races — black, colored and white — and assigns them inherent characteristics. Blacks are capable of the hardest work; they are sensual, idle and unintelligent. “They laugh and sing and sleep through life” (Trollope 1985, 45). As for whites, it is natural that they “should hold ascendancy over those who are black or colored” (1985, 68). Trollope (1985, 57) theorizes that:

Providence has sent white men and black men to these regions in order that from them may spring a race fitted by intellect for civilization; and fitted also by physical organization for tropical labour. The negro in his primitive state is not, I think, fitted for the former; and the European white Creole is certainly not fitted for the latter.

Many environmental determinist geographers shared Trollope’s “theory” regarding the inability of the “White Race” to acclimatize to the tropics well into the early twentieth century (Livingstone 1992). Ellen Churchill warned in 1911 that white settlers in the
tropics were susceptible to “derangements in the physiological functions of heart, liver, kidneys and organs of reproduction” because of “intense enervation” (quoted in Livingston 1992, 235-6). Trollope’s solution was to permit the Anglicized mixed population to rule under British tutelage, and the Anglo-Saxon race, “having done its appointed work,” will then move on to “beget nations, civilize countries, and instruct in truth and knowledge the dominant races of the coming ages” (Trollope 1985, 64).

Trollope’s proposed solution to race relations in Jamaica reveals his position in the debate between two schools of thought regarding the question of race in mid-nineteenth century European scientific discourse. David Spurr’s (1993) Rhetoric of Empire contrasts the view of the Comte de Gobineau’s Essai sur l’Inégalité des Races Humaines with Darwin’s classification of human groups. Gobineau’s essay, published in 1854, divided the human species into three races and claimed that in an unmixed state, the black race was mentally deficient, sensual and dangerous. Asians were less primitive than blacks and, of course, the white race had never “existed in a purely primitive state.” Gobineau saw these distinctions as “native, original, sharply defined and permanent” (Spurr 1993, 65). Darwin also classified human societies but did not see these distinctions as permanent. Trollope’s portrayal of Jamaicans in terms of this racist ideology was not unusual for the time. What is surprising is the reproduction of this classification of character by race in later tourist images.

Stark’s Illustrated Jamaica Guide was published in 1898, and touts Jamaica as the “Gem of the Antilles. Nowhere else so accessible to Americans can be found such
a delightful tropical resort with a Summer climate” (Stark 1898, 1). The guide reinforces its promise of “perpetual summer” with a statement that doctors recommend “trips to the Tropics during the winter season,” that is, for those with the means and leisure. Although the advent of screw propulsion in steamships in the 1840s had vastly improved ocean transportation, travel for pleasure at sea was still the prerogative of the well-off (Swinglehurst 1974). In addition to the temperate climate noted by Columbus 407 years previously, the guide draws attention to the landscape. “Jamaica, as regards scenery and verdure, is a magnificent island, and surpassed by none in the world” (Stark 1898, 6). Written on the verge of what Bonham Richardson (1992, 76) calls the American Century in the Caribbean, the guide's theme reflects that of the 1893 Columbian World's Fair in Chicago — technical and scientific progress (Relph 1987). Stark describes the fruits of progress in Jamaica: completion of the railway system by American capital; construction of more hotels; and flourishing banana plantations run by the Boston Fruit Company, the predecessor of United Fruit. Stark (1898, 40) credits the Jamaican International Exhibition of 1891 with “bringing Jamaica to the attention of the outside world” and resulting in an increase in “tourist steamer” traffic. In 1904 the United Fruit Company rebuilt the Titchfield Hotel at Port Antonio to accommodate increasing numbers of American passengers arriving on the company's steamers. It was largely through the efforts of United Fruit that Americans began to visit the island in large numbers (Taylor 1993).
In its description of the inhabitants, Stark’s guide classifies the population in much the same way as Trollope did. “Idleness is the curse of the negro . . . the white man cannot do field work in the tropics and live” (Stark 1898, 187-8). Stark differs from Trollope in that he does not see the “colored” population as an asset to Jamaica. In accordance with the eugenics movement of the time, Stark (1898, 189) pronounces that “the two races cannot intermarry without harm to both.” He hastens to assure the tourist that “the colonial government recognizes the necessity of keeping all these diverse elements in absolute subjection” (1898, 193).

Stark’s assurance that colonial authorities exercised complete political, economic and social control aptly summarizes Jamaica’s place in the world and nineteenth century ideas connecting tourism with progress and development.

The structural form of any tourist development necessarily parallels the preexisting socioeconomic order in a country. Inevitably, then, the very way a tourism industry is planned and shaped will recreate the fabric of the colonial situation (Crick 1989, 322).

In Slavery and Capitalism (1944) Eric Williams forcefully argued that the slave trade and labor performed by slaves on Caribbean sugar plantations was a major source of the capital that financed the industrialization of Britain. It is appropriate that this “early version of the dependency thesis” (Wallerstein 1980, 144) was proposed by a West Indian Marxist. From the late seventeenth century on, Jamaica’s position in the capitalist world system was that of a peripheral state whose population remained impoverished so that the local plantocracy and metropole could thrive. After the abolition of slavery in 1838, the plantocracy and imperial authorities turned to less
coercive and more hegemonic methods of control. The Morant Bay massacre, where Governor Eyre in 1865 ordered 430 rioters executed, indicates that those in power would not hesitate to use deadly force if necessary.

A central tenet of late nineteenth century colonial discourse was that *laissez faire* economics and imperial rule brought about progress: the precursor of development theory (Peet and Watts 1993; Said 1993). Railways were built and banana plantations were established with American capital. Progress was linked to tourism when the Boston Fruit Company's steamers began to bring wealthy (and racist) American tourists as passengers. In 1891 the colonial government sponsored its own version of the Columbian Exhibition's celebration of progress planned for Chicago in 1893.

The Jamaica Exhibition was expected to bring many to Jamaica for the first time, who would make known the advantages of Jamaica as a winter resort to others and thus lay the foundation for a steady and increasing flow of tourists to the Island (*Handbook of Jamaica* for 1891-92, quoted in Taylor 1993, 53).

Anticipating a "flow of tourists," the colonial administration enacted the Jamaica Hotel Act which advanced public credit for the construction of five large "American-style" hotels. Ironically, this early departure from *laissez faire* capitalism based on a foreign model ended in bankruptcy for all but one of the hotels by 1906 (Taylor 1993).

Small-scale Tourism 1900-1950: Beaches and Automobiles

The twentieth century saw the growth of Montego Bay as the center of Jamaican tourism. The development of Jamaica's North Coast mirrors the evolution of tourism in Europe and North America as it began to center around the automobile and
sunbathing (Hugill 1985). Luminaries of the avant-garde would set the trend. In 1923 Cole Porter would spend the summer on the Riviera in the company of Scott and Zelda Fitzgerald, Gertrude Stein and Alice B. Toklas and Picasso. They bathed in the sea for pleasure and basked in the sun to be closer to nature (Feifer 1986, 215). It was in this atmosphere that Fitzgerald would write *Tender is the Night* extolling the sun and sand, and glorifying the sea holiday (Newby 1981).

Stark's (1898, 129-30) description of Montego Bay mentions Dr. Alexander McCatty's sanatorium for invalids as “one of the pleasantest and best in Jamaica.” It was situated on a hill overlooking a white, sandy beach. These “excellent bathing facilities, together with the attendance of Dr. McCatty” made Montego Bay a “truly ideal place for invalids,” especially those with “dyspepsia and nervous prostration.” In 1906 Dr. McCatty donated the beach to the town and a “bathing clubhouse” was built (Pariser 1986). Doctor's Cave Beach became the nucleus of tourism in Montego Bay, and the local population was systematically barred from using it (Taylor 1993).

Englishman Algernon E. Aspinall began publishing his concise and popular *Pocket Guide to the West Indies* in 1907. The tersely written Aspinall guides contain no descriptions of landscape or people, but they do chronicle the advent of the automobile, sea bathing for pleasure, and by 1940, sunbathing guests are staying in the ten hotels that have arisen in the area. The 1910 guide (Aspinall 1910, 122) describes Doctor's Cave as being “unsurpassed” for bathing. In addition:
there are miles of coral reefs in the neighborhood over which visitors can pass in perfect safety inspecting the while the most remarkable marine gardens. . . . The roads in the parish are very good for driving, motoring or cycling.

These visitors were staying in the “several good lodging and boarding houses . . . frequented by the best people” noted by Stark (1898, 129). When the 1923 Pocket Guide was published the bathing was still unsurpassed, the coral reefs “remarkable” and the roads good for “motoring,” and — apart from the sanitorium — there are still no hotels listed for Montego Bay (Aspinall 1923, 288). By the time the 1940 Aspinall guide was issued, however, it listed ten hotels for Montego Bay and Ocho Rios (Aspinall 1940, 260). The roads and reefs are as they were, but the “bathing both in the sea and sun is unsurpassable” (1940, 293 [emphasis added]).

Two guidebooks representative of this period are Jamaica of Today, by A. Hyatt Verrill and Pleasure Island by Esther Chapman (1951), both geared to touring Jamaica by car. Verrill (1931, 64) states that “the real way to see the island is for the visitor to take his or her motor car to Jamaica.” Of course, his advice only applies to those who could afford to afford to own and ship automobiles. In 1931 there were “excellent” roads and an adequate number of gas stations and garages (Verrill 1931, 65). Like every guidebook thereafter, he warns against driving too fast and observes that the speed limit is “rarely adhered to” (1931, 66). Chapman also assumes that her clientele will be motoring around the island, though a change in traveling style was imminent. The airport in Montego Bay was completed in 1946, allowing wealthy tourists direct access to a growing number of fashionable resorts (Anglo-American Caribbean
Commission 1945). Chapman (1931, 21-2) notes the increased accessibility of the island "made possible by modern travel facilities" and credits these improvements with bringing in visitors who, "tired of the stringencies and austerities of northern lands, have chosen Jamaica as a permanent abiding place." In a departure from previous and most subsequent guides, Chapman (1931, 22) asserts that the visitor or prospective resident who

is keenly interested in life and its manifestations, who is enthralled by the spectacle of human beings working out their salvation in a new manner and in a different type of environment, will be fascinated by the varied and vital life of the island of Jamaica: just as he will be enraptured by its loveliness.

The contrast between the two guidebooks is startling because of the very different images they project of the Jamaican people. Verrill's 1931 guidebook devotes an entire chapter to "The Jamaican Negroes and Their Ways." Like Trollope and Stark, he classifies the Jamaican as a noble savage, but still a member of a primitive race. In Verrill's (1931, 140) view, the Jamaican "is by nature lazy, he allows his animal instincts to rule . . . his body is more important than his mind." He admires their sense of rhythm and storytelling skills. Verrill (1931, 145) reflects the paternalistic bent of his own society when he writes, "like our own negroes, those of Jamaica are passionately fond of hymns and spirituals."

Rather than attempt a subjective description of the landscape, Verrill reduces the natural features of Jamaica to list of objects: mountains, birds, buildings, fruits, exotic
plants and flowering trees. Verrill’s objectification of both the landscape and culture of Jamaica is the antithesis of Esther Chapman’s perspective.

Although she was a member of the educated elite, Chapman’s view is that of an insider. She is Jamaican, and interweaves her description of the nature, culture and tourist sights. Chapman’s Jamaica is personal and subjective. She recounts the folklore, foodways and problems of the common people, as well as mentioning the names of the people who own the exclusive resorts that have sprung up on the North Coast and the interior. The tourist facilities are under a mixture of local and foreign, mostly British, ownership and cater to affluent tourists. Chapman (1951, 158) asserts that the Sunset Lodge in Montego bay is

undoubtedly the most fashionable resort in the West Indies. . . . Great names are to be found in its register. The holders of fabulous titles brush shoulders with the no less fabulous figures of the literary and artistic scene.

Despite the contrast, the two guides indicate that Jamaica was a pre-mass tourism paradise for the wealthy, more like the Riviera in the 1920s than the present-day Caribbean. The first four decades of the twentieth century saw a slow but steady increase in the numbers of tourists, especially on the North Coast. As Jamaica’s share of the world sugar market declined, the plantocracy invested in hotels on the North Coast and turned their great houses into expensive guest houses (Taylor 1993). Tourism in Jamaica assumed the character of an industry owned by the local elite and patronized by an international elite including Errol Flynn, Noel Coward and the Prince of Wales. Needless to say, profits from the tourist trade remained in the hands of

76
foreign fruit companies and the Jamaican ruling class. Another result of the expansion of elite tourism in Jamaica was the extension of control over local resources by the white elite and alienation of the "commons" in the interest of capital accumulation.

An immediate consequence [of tourism] was the exclusion of lower classes — in effect, black people — from facilities such as passenger ships and beaches. It was tourism that gave the Doctor's Cave Bathing Club, a private club, the muscle to take over the beach in Montego Bay and turn it from a popular local spot to a private beach for tourists (Kurlansky 1992, 25).

As the post-World War II era saw the advent of cheap air travel which transformed tourism from an elite an object of high mass consumption in the West, the peripheral regions of the world began a process of decolonization. In Jamaica and the rest of the British Empire this process began with the 1940 Colonial Development and Welfare Act. Carlene Edie (1991, 31) sees this legislation as "the precursor of the Jamaican welfare state which became the basis for middle class ascendency." As world demand for aluminium expanded, American and Canadian companies penetrated the Jamaican economy on a massive scale. The colonial government and after independence in 1962, the Peoples National Party (PNP) and the Jamaican Labor Party (JLP), encouraged investment of foreign capital with a program of "industrialization by invitation" promising low taxes and waiving tariffs on supplies brought into the country by participating companies (Edie 1991). With an illiteracy rate of 70 percent in 1954, most of the new jobs created by the expansion of foreign investment and the bureaucracy went to the educated middle and upper classes. The majority of Jamaicans did not participate in this postwar prosperity. Large numbers of
the peasantry were displaced by bauxite mining operations which continue to have serious environmental effects. Emigration to other parts of the Caribbean — Panama, Costa Rica and Cuba, for example — had long been an option for the displaced and unemployed. In the new postwar era of development they sought low paying, unskilled work in Kingston, the tourist resorts of the North Coast, Britain and North America (Edie 1991; Boyd 1988; Beckwith 1982).

The Keynesian mixture of government planning and infusion of global capital advocated by the postwar development discourse was applied to tourism in the Caribbean. Representatives of the two hegemonic powers of the region (as the Anglo-American Caribbean Commission) met in 1943 and issued a report called Caribbean Tourist Trade: A Regional Approach (1945). This report specifically endorsed tourism as a tool for regional development. Postwar construction centered on Montego Bay where an airstrip had been built during the war. The number of hotel rooms in this area increased from 229 units in 1946 to 1,350 in 1956 (Taylor 1993). The inauguration of jet travel and package tours in the mid-1960s marked the arrival of mass tourism in Jamaica. Hotel accommodations on the island exploded from 9,616 in 1968 to nearly 20,000 in 1973 (West Indies and Caribbean Yearbook 1974; 1977-78). Like the bauxite and manufacturing sectors most of this new investment in the tourist industry was foreign owned. A member of Parliament, from Montego Bay commented:

The foreign interests have come down like Philistines in Montego Bay and they have bought hundreds and thousands of acres of land. The town is

78
circumscribed and surrounded, and in a little while there will be no more room for the middle class people and people in the low income bracket (quoted in Taylor 1993).

Conrad Hilton, one of the most prominent of those “foreign interests,” echoed the American government’s desire to use the concept of development as an ideological weapon against communism:

Each of our hotels is a little America. . . . I sincerely believe we are doing our bit to spread world peace, and fight socialism (O’Grady 1982, 50).

Mass Tourism 1950-1980: From Class to Mass

As mentioned previously, after World War II air travel surged. From 1950 to 1975 a new type of aircraft appeared about every five years (Feifer 1986; Swinglehurst 1982; Pearce 1982). In the 1950s package tours were developed between Britain and the Mediterranean. As a result, large scale resorts began to develop on the Costa del Sol and the Baleares (Swinglehurst 1982). Soon airlines were competing for tourist traffic that was increasing by ten percent yearly from 1960 to 1974 (Feifer 1986, 223). Economies of scale, fare wars and charter flights brought the cost of air travel within reach of the middle class (Feifer 1986; Swinglehurst 1982).

Tourist arrivals in Jamaica increased from 93,626 in 1951 to 224,492 in 1961 (West Indies and Caribbean Yearbook 1953-54; 1965). In 1972 407,806 tourists visited the island (W.I. and C. Yearbook 1974). Yet, well into the 1960s, Jamaica remained a haven for well-heeled tourists. Errol Flynn’s exploits at Navy Island at Port Antonio are still the subject of local gossip and the table at Noel Coward’s house
at Port Maria is preserved as it was for the Queen Mum’s visit, with “Room with a View” wafting over the sound system.

The Standard Guide to the Caribbean by Lawrence and Sylvia Martin and John Wilhem’s Guide to the Caribbean Islands were both published in 1960. These two guidebooks similarly extol the climate, vegetation and beaches of the Caribbean islands in dense descriptive language:

The sun pours down upon [the islands] like a shower of gold. The sea they enclose is incredibly blue. Their tropical greens are the ultimate in green. Their beaches are lapped by crystal-clear waters (Martin and Martin 1960, 6).

John Wilhelm's (1960, 1) guide describes the West Indies as islands
together with refreshing breezes from the trade winds puffing over exotic white beaches set in sapphire green waters. Over the beaches lean graceful palms, while all about are spice trees, flowering oranges and flamboyant and bursting purple bougainvillea.

The extravagant use of modifiers is characteristic of earlier Victorian travel accounts (Pratt 1992). This dense description evokes a color-enhanced photograph of the scene.

The writers have reduced the natural landscape to a verbal glossy brochure.

Although they use similar language to describe the landscape, the two guides differ markedly in their images of the people who inhabit it. The Martins' guide reflects American society in the early 1960s, when overtly racist comments became unacceptable in print. On the other hand, the Martins dehumanize the landscape, as far as the black population is concerned, in much the same way as Baird's account did. The places where most Jamaicans live are dismissed. “Kingston is no place to linger.
Most country towns and villages also are unattractive” (Martin and Martin 1960, 94).

Their description of Jamaican culture is limited to a brief vignette from a Saturday market in Port Maria. Two respectably dressed Salvation Army women are singing hymn to the accompaniment of drums.

The hymns become more and more syncopated, until the Army lasses and onlookers were all jiggling. The waiter bringing you a drink while the orchestra is playing a hot number will do the same. But keep your distance. The Jamaican Negro is not friendly (1960, 81-2).

The last sentence is a telling commentary on American social relations at the time; overt racism is to be avoided, but segregation is still the norm. Conversely, the Martins manage to devote three pages to a description of the typical expatriate Englishman. They are also incorrigible name-droppers. Montego Bay “is noted for its celebrities, among whom are English countesses and barons, Austrian archdukes, Churchills and assorted Rockefellers, Lord Beaverbrook” and so on (Martin and Martin 1960, 89).

Wilhelm's (1960, 6) guide recognizes that most tourists visit the Caribbean “for relaxation and enjoyment,” but he also feels that the tourist should “know something of the people and problems” of the area. His sympathetic portrayal of Jamaican culture and social concerns is reminiscent of Esther Chapman’s 1951 guide with one important difference — Wilhelm is American, not Jamaican. His effort to make tourists aware that real people inhabit this tropical paradise may reflect a growing concern in America over the effects of the Cuban Revolution. In a section subtitled “A Few Serious Reflections,” Wilhelm (1960, 9) notes that few islands in the Caribbean
have many resources other than beaches and sugar cane, except for Cuba. "But Cuban children who have never had a glass of milk in their lives are not hard to find."

In 1968 Jamaica’s version of mass tourism still catered to tourists with social aspirations. When the 1969-1970 edition of Fielding's Guide to the Caribbean (Harman and Harman 1968) was issued, Montego Bay boasted thirty-two “fine” resort hotels with accommodations for 2700 visitors. Harman and Harman (1968, 333.) write approvingly of those establishments that ban conventions and group tourism and warn readers about places where “large proportions of guests are conventioneers and package-tour members.” They examine hotel furnishings and decor with a critical eye. “Deftly outfitted in turquoises, greens and oranges, with cool white wicker furniture” and “U.S. commercial-house decor” are typical assessments (Harman and Harman 1968, 332-3). The cursory description of budget hotels includes the Coral Cliff, which “still maintains a turn-of-the-century aura of British gentility” and is “an address for which you need not apologize”; and the Hacton House, where “abominable pink plastic flamingos accent the otherwise pleasant outdoor dining area” (1968, 335). The decline of the North Coast as an exclusive resort area for the rich and famous is illustrated by the Harmans’ review of Frenchman’s Cove. The rates had fallen from $2,500 per week for two in 1960, to $1,672 in 1968 (Martin and Martin 1960, 86; Harman and Harman 1968, 345). The Harmans (1968, 345-6) lament that “the most expensive hotel in the Caribbean” lacked fresh caviar and roasted boar’s head. The list
of celebrity tourists visiting the North Coast is reduced to Betsy Palmer, Kitty Carlisle and Charleton Heston.

The changing image and scale of Jamaican tourism is perhaps best represented by the Jamaica Playboy Club in Ocho Rios. This 400 room hotel had opened as The Marrakesh in 1960 but ran into immediate financial difficulties (Martin and Martin, 1960), perhaps because its furnishings were “right out of Ben Hur, with purple walls and Roman columns” (Wilhelm 1960, 119). The Marrakesh was reborn as Hugh Hefner’s first Playboy Hotel in 1964. The Playboy Club presages a shift from the image of Jamaican resorts as the exclusive reserve of the international jet set, to one of hedonism and sensuality. “Over 400 happy celebrants occupy hippily bedecked, air-conditioned hutches” (Harman and Harman 1968, 340).

The tension between the two images is manifested in the Harmans’ depiction of the Jamaican people. The twin tropes of this guide are servility and eroticization. Jamaicans “want to help, to please” the visitor in the same tradition they had served their British masters. They represent the “West Indian at his best” and unlike many ungrateful Caribbean islanders “appreciate the value of tourism to the economy” (Harman and Harman 1968, 311). Rudeness will only be encountered “off the beaten tourist track” — meaning outside of the resort areas. Kingston is written off entirely. “Let the sociologists or flower children mingle with the ganja-smoking toughs, the tainted trollops, or the bearded Ras Tafarians” (1968, 355).
Despite the Harmans’ (1968, 357) distaste for the “tainted trollops” of Kingston, they describe Jamaican women as “combining the best features of the many races which have mingled to produce them.” As if to reinforce the insatiability of the natives they point out that “70% of Jamaican children are born illegitimate.” A further comment in this section, coyly entitled “Hanky Panky,” reflects changing sexual mores in American society of the late 1960s:

The young men, with their wide, muscled shoulders and trim, narrow hips, exude a similar magnetism to which, advisedly or not, northern tourists (both male and female) sometimes succumb (1968, 358). While emphasizing the sensual aspect of Jamaicans, the authors also advise caution. Liaisons with islanders can lead to “on occasion disapproval [which] can manifest itself in uncomfortably violent, or at least unpleasant, form” (Harman and Harman 1968, 358). In David Spurr’s (1993, 177) words: “the colonized country represents not only sexual promise, but sexual danger as well.” The Harmans' (1968, 310-11) description of the landscape also sizzles with sexual innuendos:

The beauty of Jamaica is, quite literally dazzling — this stunning hit-you-between-the-eyes loveliness is in itself a potent reason for visiting the island. . . . Fantastic views are heightened by the brilliance of flowers and the rich tropical green of vegetation. Shimmering seascapes abound, with the Caribbean slamming against rocky coasts or swirling onto the palm-fringed, fine sand beaches.

The ten years that separate the Harmans' guide from Margaret Zellers’ Fielding’s Caribbean, 1979 saw a restructuring of the tourist industry. The number of hotel rooms had increased from 9,616 in 1968 to nearly 20,000 in 1973 (Caribbean Year Book 1974; Caribbean Year Book 1978). By 1979 the tides of mass tourism had
dashed the image of Jamaica's North Coast as an exclusive paradise for the Anglo-American elite. Barry Floyd (1979), head of the geography department of the University of the West Indies, cataloged some of the ill effects of mass tourism in Jamaica. The best beaches on the island had become off-limits to Jamaicans. Construction of high-rise hotels "conforming to international styling" had led to a "ferro-concrete desecration" of Jamaica's shoreline (Floyd 1979, 100). The contrast between foreign affluence and local poverty brought about "relaxation of social and sexual mores, erosion of personal dignity and perpetuation of social and racial inequalities" (1979, 101). Finally, the American recession from 1975 to 1977 had led to 23.7 percent drop in hotel room occupancy forcing some hotels on the North Coast to close.

In Montego Bay, one hotel was as ruinate as an abandoned sugar mill — doors swung ajar, vegetation pushed up through the patios, and the toilet fixtures had been ripped out, captured and taken to the squatter settlements of Norwood or Flankers (Graham Norton in Floyd 1979, 102).

Transition: Michael Manley and the Crisis in Tourism

In 1972 Michael Manley, leader of the Peoples' National Party was elected Prime Minister on a platform that espoused democratic socialism and advocated closer ties with Cuba. Dependency theory now became the official explanation for the existence of poverty in Jamaica (Manley 1987). Although Jamaica had followed the World Bank approved path to development and the economy grew 5.8 percent per annum from 1958 to 1972, the skewed distribution of income had worsened during
that time period (Boyd 1988). The fact that Jamaica's per capita income is reasonably high by Third World standards, while the inequality of income distribution is among the world's worst, points out the futility of using income as a measure of "standard of living." In spite of the fact that Jamaica had exceeded all World Bank developmental formula targets from 1950 to 1968, the unemployment rate was at 23.4% in 1953 and 23.5% in 1972 (Keith and Keith 1992; Boyd 1988). It was apparent to Manley and the ordinary Jamaicans who elected him that the strategy of adhering to World Bank formulas and foreign capital as an engine of development for the whole island had failed.

Manley declared democratic socialism in 1974 and proceeded to expand the role of the state at the expense of foreign capital, especially the bauxite industry; institute price controls and subsidies for basic goods; raise minimum wages; dispense with the IMF; and support a wide range of social programs aimed at fulfilling basic human needs (Keith and Keith 1992; Boyd 1988). Manley's embrace of dependency theory was at times contradictory. John Isbister's (1991, 51) discussion of dependency theory recognizes two schools of thought among its adherents, a radical socialist wing and a liberal wing . . . that argues that capitalist free enterprise should remain, but that it should be subject to strong guidance . . . [to] ensure that it is directed to serving the real needs of the people and not the external demands of foreign markets.

The People's National Party's ideology was no different than that of Western European socialism. The more radical wing, however, calls for "full socialist revolutions in Third World societies" and the "expropriation of private enterprises,
both foreign-owned and domestic” (1991, 51). The PNP's domestic policy fits into the liberal dependency camp, but much of Manley’s rhetoric was more radical. His vocal support for liberation movements in Latin America and Africa, and his friendship with Castro, caused consternation among the Jamaican elite and the United States government. Manley extended his critique of mainstream development theory to the problems of mainstream tourism. Shortly after the PNP came to power in 1972, the minister of tourism, P. J. Patterson, warned in a speech entitled “Tourism: An Essential Plank of Our Development” that tourism “was on the verge of a crisis” (Taylor 1993, 170):

I AM WELL AWARE THAT it has become fashionable in certain circles to dismiss the tourist industry and spend all the time in condemning its social effects. . . . I prefer to take the positive view that these are problems we can control, particularly once we take the decision — as I now take — to put the industry in our own hands — to manage it as we see fit to determine its shape and direction (original emphasis).

With the onset of the oil crisis in 1973, more hotels were driven over the edge into bankruptcy. There was speculation in Jamaica that the decline in tourism was the result of U.S. policy to destabilize the Manley government by “orchestration of negative, sensationalist press in order to frighten potential visitors” (Hillman and D'Agostino 1992, 152).

By 1977 Manley was forced by a combination of factors to abandon his experiment with democratic socialism as an antidote for dependency. The aluminum companies had cut back on bauxite production in response to the government’s partial nationalization and reduced world demand. The middle and upper classes were
moving capital, and often themselves, out of the country and tourists were staying away in droves. The oil crisis and subsequent worldwide recession exacerbated these problems, as did the antagonism of the United States (Keith and Keith 1992; Edie 1991; Beckford 1980). Falling revenues and increased social spending had produced huge increases in the balance of payments deficit and the foreign debt. These factors combined with soaring inflation forced Manley to come to terms with the IMF in April 1977 (Edie 1991, Beckford 1980). The IMF demanded drastic structural adjustments in return for loans.

These measures had an immediate and drastic effect on living standards. In 1978, real wages fell by an estimated 35 percent, the share of labor income fell from 55.2 to 52.3 percent, and the average real per capita consumption declined by 13 percent (Edie 1991, 109).

The Manley government realized, much as the Cuban government has discovered, that revival of tourism was one of the few economic options available. In 1977 Manley reorganized government tourism agencies and set up Jamaican National Hotels and Properties Ltd. to take over financially troubled hotels (Floyd 1979). The Jamaican Tourist Board wanted to look at ways of “attracting a different clientele from that of fickle, high-income visitors” whom they also considered to be insensitive to Jamaican culture (1979, 103). For example, the tourist board began to actively promote Jamaica as a destination for African-Americans (Taylor 1993).

The Manley government advocated a “fresh approach” to the tourist industry, including substitution of local products for imports in the tourist sector and promoting hotel construction that would “preserve environmental and indigenous aesthetic
values” by creating “distinctive Jamaican recreational settings” (Floyd 1979, 103). The government was also concerned with quality of service and accommodations in the tourist industry. A Man of Standards (hotel inspector) was appointed with the power to revoke operator licenses and the ministry conducted seminars and training programs for hotel employees (Taylor 1993).

In keeping with its policy of reducing dependence on external markets and encouraging local participation, the government promoted domestic tourism by negotiating lower rates for Jamaican residents (Taylor 1993). During this time of crisis in tourism, “the local vacationer may have proved to be the vital difference between a profit and a loss position for many hotels” (Taylor 1993, 185). Another of the Manley government’s innovations was launched in 1977:

The success of the newly-opened Negril Beach Village, a hedonistic ClubMediterranee type operation, and the continued attractiveness of Negril to the unconventional post-hippy generation, proves that tourists will come to Jamaica, if the area offers them what they want (Floyd 1979, 103).

In 1968 there was only one small resort at Negril (Harman and Harman 1968). Throughout the 1970s a steady influx of young Americans, whom the Harmans had condescendingly called “flower children,” had found their own version of paradise in Negril. Negril Beach Village was to become the all-inclusive simulacrum of their version of paradise.
Margaret Zellers's *Fielding's Caribbean* 1979 guide marks the transition between modern mass tourism and post-tourism. The frontispiece contains a quote from Julio Cortazar's novel, *Hopscotch*:

That true otherness made up of delicate contacts, marvelous adjustments with the world, could not be attained from just one point; the outstretched hand had to find response in another hand stretched out from the beyond, from the other part (Zellers 1978, v).

Fielding Publications had developed a social conscience since 1968 and realized that to sell guides, they must appeal to a more varied clientele. In her introduction to Jamaica, Zellers ignores the natural landscape and enters into a dialogue with a woodcarver and a Rastafarian. This subjective rhetorical device is part of her attempt to mediate between the new economic, social and cultural realities of Jamaica and her largely middle class American audience. Zellers (1978, 334) assures the tourist that despite their glassy eyes and “long hair fixed to position with cow dung,” true Rastafarians “are peaceloving and gentle.” She equates the spread of imitation Rastas throughout the Caribbean with “the world-wide hippie movement.”

A discussion of politics was absent from the 1969-70 Fielding’s Guide. In contrast, Zellers (1978, 335) quotes Michael Manley extensively in an attempt to explain to tourists why things have changed. Manley defends his “third path” as a way of lessening dependency on the “Anglo-Saxon nexus of economic and political power.” Anthony Payne and Paul Sutton (1993, 15) described Manley’s ideological stance as a technique for “living with dependency.” Indeed, Jamaica's continuing
dependence on tourism as a source of foreign exchange is demonstrated by Manley’s
greeting to potential tourists:

Americans are still welcome as our guests on vacation. . . . The sun, the
sea, the beaches and the mountains are as beautiful as ever, but . . .
today’s Jamaica is a much more exciting place (Zellars 1978, 337).

Zellers (1978, 337) responds in the text by admonishing her readers that “Jamaica is
home for the Jamaicans—and not your personal playground.”

Although Zellers’s introduction reflects the more “tolerant, respectful, and
supportive stance” adopted toward the Caribbean by the Carter administration and the
general liberalization of American society (Payne and Sutton 1993, 15), she is not
comfortable with the changes that have taken place in Jamaican tourism. Her
appraisal of the older, exclusive resorts shows a longing for the past. The Tryall Golf
and Beach Club “isn’t the way it used to be in the good old days, but then Jamaica isn’t
the way it used to be either” (1978, 350). Frenchman’s Cove — once the most
expensive resort in the Caribbean — is struggling to “keep the vines from growing
over the sign” (1978, 382). Except for a few resorts that have managed to maintain
their standards — notably, the Round Hill Hotel, and Sans Souci — most north shore
resorts depend on package tours and charter flights. Zellers’s (1978, 340) assessment
of Montego Bay applies to most of the North Coast:

THE resort area in Jamaica more than 20 years ago when the freezing
northerners’ lunge toward the sun included traveling with trunks of top-
notch clothes for black-tie evenings. That way of life has gone — and so
has the excellent service that the handful who could afford it enjoyed.
Egalitarians will applaud the disappearance of the servant-master
syndrome, but one result of the changing lifestyle has been that hotels
built from the late '50s to the early '70s, before architects and investors woke up to the fact that their local climate — and visiting clientele — had changed, are struggling to move to the modern reggae tempo.

Zellers is ambivalent toward the modern tempo of tourism as she finds it in Negril. She describes the place as it was before the government-run Negril Beach Village was built as “a hideaway for peace-loving vacationers, including hippies who liked the grass that grows around here.” Negril is still “offbeat. barefoot, natural — and those who want a no-frills vacation with an option for the easy life can find it here” (Zellers 1978, 360). However, Zellers finds the government's attempt to gear tourism to “changing lifestyles” distasteful. Negril Beach Village “tries too hard to be Eden and an orgy.” In her opinion, “the bacchanal is too carefully planned for profit to send me into ecstasy” (1978, 362). Of course, the point was to make a profit at a time when the government was operating an expensive and expanding group of financially troubled hotels” (1978, 349). Zellers (1978, 362) deplores the “mass-with-no-class” aspect of this all-inclusive resort. She seems particularly put-off by nudity and warns readers away who might be “fazed at all by the sight of a man wearing only his scuba tank.” She also seems shocked to note that “among the travel agencies making group bookings last summer was Lambda Travel, with a July week for gays” (1978, 363).

Ironically, hedonism, lifestyle and nature were to become dominant images in the next phase of Jamaican tourism.
Two Streams of Post-tourism: 1980-Present

In Chapter One, I linked both large-scale and small-scale forms of post-tourism in Jamaica with countercultural movements in North America and Europe. In the late 1960s and early 1970s Negril became the primary destination for these low-budget alternative tourists. Negril Beach village was originally geared toward the “unconventional posthippie generation” (Floyd 1979, 103). That generation has now largely become what has been variously described as the new upper-middle, postaffluent or service class (Britton 1991; Albertson 1988; Knox 1987). For this class, tourism is a commodity purchased as

a *lifestyle*; a statement of taste and demonstration of the possession of cultural and symbolic capital; an invigoration of the *body*; an uplifting of the *spirit*; a broadening of the *mind*; a signifier of status; a confirmation or challenge of attitudes (Britton 1991, 464 [emphasis added]).

“The Mind, The Body, The Spirit, The Soul” is the slogan of Hedonism II — previously known as Negril Beach Village. In 1981 John Issa bought Negril Beach Village from the Seaga government as it was moving toward privatization in response to pressure from International Monetary Fund and the Reagan administration (McAfee 1991). The Issa family is one of the four wealthiest families in Jamaica and have been involved in tourism since the 1940s (Hillman and D’Agoatino 1992). The Issas took an early lead in product differentiation by converting the Tower Isle — opened by Abe Issa in 1953 — into an all-inclusive resort called Couples, in 1978. Their Superclub chain now includes eight all-inclusive resorts, each catering to differing tastes of the new upper-middle class. Butch Stewart, scion of another wealthy Jamaican family,
operates a competing chain called Sandals. Like Superclub, the Sandals chain has expanded its operations throughout the Caribbean and has designed different resorts catering to specific segments of the market.

Although all-inclusives have played a crucial role in reviving the flagging tourist industry in Jamaica, there is a widespread perception, especially among small businessmen and vendors on the North Coast that Superclubs and Sandals have further concentrated the economic benefits of tourism into the pockets of the white, Jamaican elite. A study of Jamaican tourism conducted by the Organization of American States found that “all-inclusive hotels generate the largest amount of revenue but their impact on the economy is smaller per dollar than other accommodation sectors” (quoted in Patullo 1996, 75).

The all-inclusive resort had been so widely imitated throughout the Caribbean and the world, they now merit their own guide called *Hot Spots* (Vogel 1989). Jamaica takes up more pages of the guide than any other country. “Why all-inclusive vacations?” queries author Jason Vogel. He then proceeds to compare all-inclusives to “Erica Jong's fantasy of ‘zipless' sex” (Vogel 1989, 1), presumably because of the tourist's freedom from the responsibilities of dealing with transport, carrying luggage and tipping. Vogel’s (1989, 75) introduction to Jamaica begins:

Jamaica’s beauty is found in the lush interior farmlands, in the influential culture and music, in the beautiful resorts, in spicy native food, and in the soul of its people.
Tourists are unlikely experience the “soul” of the Jamaican people because they are relaxing “in a secure and scenic compound” (Vogel 1989, 75). Safe in their compound, tourists are assured they will not be “hassled” by indigenous people trying to earn a living in a land of “intense poverty.” Although Jamaicans have “earned the reputation of being surly,” they are educable. “Billboards proclaim the benefits of tourism, and this education starts in the primary schools” (Vogel 1989, 76). Vogel (1989, 76) asks: “Should visitors feel guilty about living in luxury while many locals live in poverty? No!” Vogel (1989, 76) naturalizes Jamaican poverty for the tourist by explaining that “the economic system, climate and culture differ greatly.” For those who would like more interaction with Jamaicans, the guide urges the visitor to fraternize with the Jamaican staff at their resorts, or — in another form of carefully controlled interaction — take advantage of a Jamaica Tourist Board program called “Meet the People.”

Vogel’s description of the landscape echoes that of Western visitors from Columbus on. Jamaica’s “fame and popularity stem from its blue-green mountains, lush forests, beautiful beaches, and consistently warm weather” (Vogel 1989, 75). However, the post-tourist does not have to leave the resort compound to experience the scenery.

Product differentiation is one of the keystones of the all-inclusive resort concept. The use of built and natural environments to produce a specific landscape image is
illustrated by the Hot Spots guide’s (Vogel 1989, 104) description of the Tryall Golf, Tennis, and Beach Club all-inclusive:

At Tryall, you can experience the life of a British colonial lord. This magnificent estate is secluded among the 2,200 acres of towering palms, bougainvillea, flowering trees, and gardens. The resort’s opulence centers on the historic Great House, open to all guests.

On Vogel’s rating system, the Tryall’s “fun quotient” is low, rating only two umbrellas. There is no nude beach, and “whites” are required on the tennis courts.

At the opposite end of the scale is Hedonism II. Its “fun quotient” is very high, rating five umbrellas. Rooms are available overlooking the nude beach. Hedonism II projects a composite image of sports clinic, fraternity party, singles bar, honeymoon heaven, or a combination of the above. Its motto states that pleasure comes in many different forms (Vogel 1989, 161).

The resort hums with organized activities: Reggae lessons, off-color games, Toga Night, and an all-night disco. The all-inclusive fee “includes drinks and ganja is readily available” (1989, 161).

I visited Hedonism II for an afternoon in the summer of 1995. Non-guests are normally not allowed inside the fenced compound, but SuperClubs offers a five hour pass from noon until 6:00 in the evening for US$50. The resort has two beaches, the nearly deserted “prude” beach and the nude beach which is the center of daytime activity. Nude volleyball and a body painting contest were the featured organized activities the day of my visit. Guests sunbathing on rafts and on the beach were
themselves a tourist attraction for boatloads of Jamaicans swooping in close to shore for a view of the naked foreigners.

I spoke with Judy, a college student from Seattle, who came to Hedonism II with two of her girlfriends. She had heard “terrible stories about Jamaica and the crime and all” but her friends had convinced her that Hedonism II would be safe. Judy had been in Jamaica for three days and not left the compound. “Everything I want is right here,” she said. Phil and Mary, a couple from San Francisco in their thirties, have been coming to Negril since 1985. They normally spend a week on their own and three days at Hedonism II because, like the Jamaicans offshore, they enjoy watching the other tourists. Less adventurous guests can venture out of the compound on escorted excursions to view the sights protected by the “environmental bubble” the resort provides.

Earlier in the day, I had spoken with a young Jamaican named Mike who runs a patty stand on family land adjoining the beach. As he cooked the lobster, chicken and vegetable pastries over a charcoal fire built in an old wheel rim, he told me about growing up in Negril:

I was born and raised in Negril and sure I have seen a lot of change. When I was a kid I would run up and down this beach, man, up and down the beach. Then Hedonism II and Sandals put up fences across the beach all the way down to the sea, man. That not right, that not right.

At Hedonism II, I wandered over to the edge of the property where a chain-link fence extends across the beach and out into the water (figure 3.1). A security guard approached me and politely asked if I were a guest. I showed him my day pass and
Figure 2.1. Fence blocking access to beach at Hedonism II.
asked him if it wasn’t illegal in Jamaica to close off the beach to the public. He replied, “Yes, it is illegal but nudity is also illegal in Jamaica. The people who own this place [the Issa family] have pull.”

If all-inclusive resorts manifest a postmodern penchant for hedonistic consumption, there are still many tourists who “consciously attempt to avoid the formal tourism production system by selecting their own itinerary, accommodation, and transport” (Britton 1991, 456). These tourists represent the “resistance” current of postmodernism. David Harvey (1989, 303) maintains that “oppositional movements become a part of the very fragmentation which a mobile capitalism and flexible accumulation can feed upon.” In many ways, this is the case in Jamaica. All-inclusive post-tourism grew out of the utopian countercultural tourism that centered on Negril in the 1970s. Vogel (1989, 89) informs us that “the management of nearly every all-inclusive denies that its employees sell ganja. They do, in fact, but very discreetly.” Smoking marijuana, nudity and denial of public beach access below the mean high tide are all illegal practices in Jamaica, but they have been institutionalized by mainstream post-tourism and incorporated into the product.

Alternative Post-tourism

Harry S. Pariser’s Guide to Jamaica is clearly meant for the alternative post-tourist; those tourists who consciously avoid the haunts of mainstream post-tourism. It contains the following acknowledgements to “San Francisco’s Tenderloin district [which] served to remind me that America, too, is a very much a Third World
country," and to "President Ronaldo 'Grenada’ Reagan whose gaffes abroad and poor policy planning made it clear why more and better travel guides are necessary" (1986, 1). Pariser’s introduction could be lifted from any of the other guides to paradise. The description is picturesque in the sense of a landscape painting. Jamaica has “white sandy beaches framed by the turquoise ocean, the cool and misty heights of the Blue Mountains . . . lush and varied vegetation to enjoy, and fascinating people to meet” (1986, 7). This is a painting, however, “on the canvas of reality using the paint of information” (Pariser 1986, 1). He advises his readers:

If you're going there for the sun and surf, stay home and use your sun lamp and local swimming pool . . . Although you may be spending your vacation in what seems to you a tropical paradise, it's not a paradise for the people living there. . . . Remember the injustices wreaked here and don't serve to perpetuate them (1986, 64).

Like Victorian travelers, the alternative tourist should be traveling “to gain insights and broaden his perspective of the world” (1986, 1). Pariser’s advice on food and lodging emphasizes cheap rooms, camping and local cuisine. He does not waste words on furnishings and ambience. Instead, much of the book is devoted to educating the reader as to the natural, cultural and historical aspects of the country.

Although Pariser's guide would seem to be the antithesis of more traditional portrayals, he reinforces the stereotypical image of Jamaican culture by devoting a full thirteen pages to Rastas, ganja and reggae. Granted, his depiction of these aspects of Jamaica which have been appropriated into Western culture — one finds young, white “Rastaburbians” even on the streets of Shepherdstown, West Virginia — are more
detailed and “factual” than other accounts. For example, the section on marijuana discusses its history — it was brought to Jamaica by East Indian laborers beginning in 1845; varieties — Lamb's Bread, Burr and Cotton are the best; and revenues — about US$200 million yearly (1986, 28-30).

All-inclusive resorts represent the mainstream form of post-tourism. Elements of the local landscape and culture are selectively incorporated into a carefully controlled environment in the same way that theme parks and shopping malls offer a simulated experience in a nontreating, sanitized compound. According to Vogel and informants I interviewed in the course of my research, recreational drugs do manage to penetrate the cordon sanitaire surrounding the enclave, but in general, all-inclusives market a carefully staged and controlled cultural experience. The search for difference is accomplished by constructing a variety of resort complexes that appeal to a range of tastes and lifestyles, and providing an array of activities and experiences that can be sampled within the compound.

Alternative tourism seeks difference in the form of “real” places. True, these places are romanticized and the independent alternative views Jamaicans as exotic objects, but the alternative does not seek to exclude ordinary Jamaicans from the landscape as the all-inclusive form of post-tourism does. I contend that both forms of post-tourism — all-inclusives being mainstream and places like Treasure Beach the alternative — are different from older forms of tourism in that they commodify culture as well as landscape (Poon 1993). Pariser's guide does not mention Treasure Beach,
however, other alternative guides published soon after the Paliser book highlight Treasure Beach and the South Coast specifically for the quality of “otherness” of landscape and culture.

When I began my research in 1994, the majority of foreign tourists in Treasure Beach were German. Not surprisingly, I found the first description of Treasure Beach by an alternative guide book in the “Richtig reisen” — or true traveling — a guide to Jamaica by Brigitte Geh (1986). Geh intertwines landscape and culture so that the first full page photograph is of a small Jamaican boy with mini-dreads sitting in the doorway of a thatched country house, the second is a visual portrayal of the Harman’s (1968, 311) “Caribbean slamming against rocky coasts,” while the third photograph depicts the very un-Caribbean landscape of Treasure Beach. Later in the text she describes the scene:

Ein heisser Wind bürstet das Steppengrass unter zersausten Bäumen hindurch über die weite Ebene. Plötzlich taucht das Meer auf, glitzert unter der Sonne, dass wir’s nur noch durch schmale Augenslitze ertragen.

A hot wind brushes savannah grass under the tousled trees that rise above the wide plain. Suddenly, the sea appears glistening in the sun so that we can only bear the sight by squinting (1986, 194 my translation).

For Geh (1986, 194) Treasure Beach is “wirklich ein Schatz von einem Strand, ohne jeden touristischen Trubel (really a treasure of a beach, without any touristic tumult.)” The extraordinary scenery, lack of organized tourism and the simple but hardworking country people are themes that reappear every in every written account of Treasure Beach thereafter:
Tourismus ist für die Leute der Südküste — Farmer, Fischer und Händler — noch kein rechter Begriff. . . . Und nur wenige Touristen, die sich von der Nordküste hierher verirren.

Tourism is for the people of the South Coast — farmers, fisherman and shopkeepers — still not a real concept. . . . And only a few tourists who have strayed here from the North Coast (Geh 1986, 238).

By the time Geh was writing in 1986 local people had, in fact, developed a concept of tourism. I will discuss early tourism in Treasure Beach in more detail in the following chapter, but an infrastructure was in place catering to a clientele ranging from the rather up-market Treasure Beach Hotel and Olde Wharf Resort to a number of guesthouses for young backpackers. Geh mentions only one guesthouse, Four M's Cottage, but there were at least ten more operating on an informal basis at the time. Then, as now, many local residents who rented rooms to tourists were reluctant to publicize their accommodations because of the “tax man.”

I found the first mention of Treasure Beach in an English language guidebook in Insight Guides: Jamaica (Zach 1991). The Insight Guides series was initiated 1970 by an expatriate German to represent the exotic culture of Bali primarily to young Australians and New Zealanders who were discovering the island as a nearby — and far more interesting — alternative to going “home” to England. The editor Paul Zach, compares the “exotic destinations of the Caribbean Sea” directly to Bali. “The warm, exciting island of Jamaica, in particular, is reminiscent of Bali” (1991, 7). As the title implies, the Insight Guides are specifically written for “the visitor who wants to know
the history and culture of his destination to make each trip a total experience” (1991, 7). Like the Pariser and Geh books, the *Insight Guides: Jamaica* contains in depth sections on history, music, Rastafarianism and ganja. Unlike the two earlier alternative guides, the Insight series is lavishly illustrated with color prints and photographs and is widely known as the *National Geographic* of guidebooks. Brightly colored images evoking people, place and tradition leap at the reader from nearly every page. This is a guidebook written by committee, and that committee is composed of Jamaican writers, journalists, and scholars. For example Carl Stone, a respected Jamaican sociologist and pollster whom I have cited above, wrote the section on Jamaican politics. The end flap beckons the reader to

make yourself at home as Jamaican authors invite you into their own lives to entertain and educate you with vivid word portraits of their culture (1991).

Contributions to the guide by knowledgeable Jamaicans — one of whom Olive Senior, a writer, owns a house in Treasure Beach — may explain why readers touring the South Coast are “best advised to head to Treasure Beach. This out of the way but lovely stretch of sand is an ‘in’ spot for young Jamaicans” (1991, 223). This “lovely stretch of sand,” however, is endowed with an important limiting physical characteristic which Geh neglects to mention: “swimming can be tricky, as waves crash the shore and there is a vicious undertow where the land is not protected by reefs” (1991, 223).
The people of Treasure Beach on the other hand, receive a wholehearted endorsement.

The local residents of Treasure Beach are very friendly and helpful. Many are also unusual for their blue eyes, blondish hair, café-au-lait complexions, and slightly Scottish accents. A popular explanation is that their ancestors were Scottish seaman who were shipwrecked on this shore (1991, 223).

As I traveled around the island and spent time in Treasure Beach I heard these elements of local identity voiced over and over again. For example, the cab driver in Kingston upon hearing that I was living in Treasure Beach responded, “Ah, yes the people there are hardworking and very friendly, and I hear they are very fair [light complected].” A Jamaican account of the area published by H. P. Jacobs in the West Indian Review in 1953 noted the “usual shipwreck” stories to explain Scots ancestry, but ascribes their presence to the settlement by Scottish survivors of Henry Morgan’s failed expedition to the Darién region of Panama in 1670 (1953, 11). His description of the people echoes the prevailing image of the area throughout the island.

The people of the savannahs with poor soil, deficient rainfall and no convenient sources of irrigation water, have long been described as the most hardworking peasantry in Jamaica (1953, 14).

During my initial fieldwork, I met Desmond Henry, a former minister of tourism and prominent local resident, who had begun to market Treasure Beach to the outside world through a local Non-governmental Organization (NGO) called Community Tourism and another private organization called Countryside Tourism. I interviewed
him in January 1994 and found that he had specifically targeted these same images of local culture and identity that emphasize the distinctiveness of Treasure Beach.

We need to get people here to realize that their culture is unique. You look at Negril. They have a whole new culture there based on tourist culture. . . . We need to educate people not to change their way of life. People here are small farmers and fisherman. They supply 70% of the table vegetables in Jamaica and their farming methods are unique. . . . When people build here, we want not just structures of any kind, but those that blend with the topography and local tradition. . . . White visitors feel comfortable here, especially women. You don't have people shouting out "Hey Whitie" at the tourists here because they [the locals] have white blood too (personal communication).

Henry's vision for tourism in Treasure Beach fits into the current paradigm for both tourism and development: sustainability. Sustainable tourism is meant to be low-impact, locally based and culturally sensitive. Henry seems to realize that by focusing on local culture as a touristic commodity, the community is at risk of altering its sense of place while embracing an alternative strategy of development. A persistent theme in this genealogy of tourism is the search for difference, but each period differs in emphasis and impact on the people and landscape of Jamaica.

Victorians were searching for a different and more healthy climate. They appreciated the landscape in the way they appreciated dramatic landscape paintings of the time. Because of colonialism with its attendant racial theories, the people and their culture were regarded as degenerate and somewhat threatening. During the period of small-scale elite tourism, the beach and sea bathing become the focus of difference. That part of the landscape was often physically appropriated, as at Doctor Cave's Beach, and the local people excluded. With the advent of mass tourism the landscape
of the North Coast of Jamaica was overwhelmed by development. As this landscape began to resemble other resort areas throughout the world Jamaicans themselves received more attention, at first as good servants or objects of desire. As the transition away from mass, standardized tourism occurs in the 1970s, Jamaican culture mainly in the form of ganja, reggae and Rastas emerged as a markers of difference from other tropical destinations. The seeds of post-tourism are planted as young American “hippies” flock to Negril to consume — literally in the case of drugs — these elements of Jamaican culture along with the area’s relatively undeveloped landscape. In the 1980s two branches of post-tourism, mainstream and alternative, emerged from the economic social and economic crises of the previous decade. The mainstream, all-inclusive resorts have been successful in creating difference by incorporating selected culture and landscape experiences into a controlled environment and marketing a constructed sense of place to specific tastes, incomes and lifestyles. The alternative independent traveler is guided toward the consumption of local culture. In the case of Treasure Beach, although the landscape is also radically different, it is the distinctiveness of the people themselves that is the object of consumption. As Treasure Beach succeeds in marketing it own special commodity it risks losing its distinctive sense of place.
CHAPTER FOUR
ROOTS AND ROUTES:
THE DEVELOPMENT OF POST-TOURISM
IN TREASURE BEACH

This chapter traces the development of alternative post-tourism in Treasure Beach. We have seen how two streams of post-tourism evolved in the context of Jamaica as a developing country. I have argued that both mainstream post-tourism, in the form of the all-pervasive all-inclusive resorts, and alternative small-scale tourism were influenced by the countercultural movement. Both forms consume and commodify sense of place, but alternative post-tourists are especially sensitive to the perceived cultural authenticity and distinctiveness of the places they consume.

Here, I examine the roots and ongoing process of commodification of place as it occurs in the specific context of Treasure Beach. By roots, I mean earlier forms of tourism in my study area from which this particular stream of post-tourism, characterized by the independent “traveler,” grew. I will also briefly examine the socioeconomic origins of some of the major and minor actors and their involvement in tourism and development.

“Route” in the physical sense is how people get there, both now and in the past. Another sense of the word directly concerns the process of commodification — how people were routed there, and what brought them to the place. In a final sense of the word, route is where alternative tourism and the people of this place are going. In the sense of both roots and routes I look at three key places within the geography of Treasure Beach: Jake’s Place, Golden Sands Guest House and Trans-Love Bakery.
Throughout the course of this narrative I discuss their origins and their roles in the commodification of place at Treasure Beach.

Roots

The earliest tourist account of Treasure Beach I encountered was written in 1937 by Glanville Smith, a North American. Smith (1937. 8) considered himself a traveler, not a “steam-roller tourist,” and was fond of anthropological musings on matters of language, religion and political economy. He arrived by sea, surely the least common way of arriving in Treasure Beach. The anchorages used by local fishermen are protected by short stretches of reef separated by openings which are difficult to negotiate under the best conditions, much less in the rough seas often encountered here. Indeed, from 1994 to 1998 not a single pleasure craft was moored at any of the four fishing villages lining the coast.

Arriving as he did, Smith was following in the wake of European explorers and pirates seeking out exotic corners of the Caribbean. He fits into the elite category of tourists who were the mainstay of Jamaican tourism until the late 1960s but shows a keen interest in the people themselves and emphasizes many of the same aspects of place that now attract alternative post-tourists searching for a unique quality of “otherness.” His descriptions of landscape and culture also hearken back to a much earlier pre-Victorian era of exploration and description in which environment and culture are classified and appropriated into an existing European order of nature (Pratt 1992). Unlike Robert Baird’s romantically descriptive 1850 account of the landscape,
Smith’s language is specific rather than general when he describes the landscape and vegetation. By stressing the partly European origins of the people, he portrays them in a sympathetic light for his North American readers. Like present-day accounts of the area, he points out how different this place is from the rest of the island. Smith begins by contrasting Treasure Beach with St. Ann’s Parish on the North Coast:

Different parts of one . . . island can show striking contrasts . . . .
Behind Pedro [Plains] the long ridge of the Santa Cruz Mountains steeps in the sun, a giant sawhorse with [a] dusty patchwork quilt of fields thrown over it.

Instead of the lush vegetation of St. Ann’s Parish,

the trees that punctuate the district are thatch palms stiff as brushes, tough lignum vitae with blue stars sown over their dense lumps of foliage . . . or Great Pedro Bluff, there, jutting roughly into the blue Caribbean, is a scratch-patch of cactus, thorns and briars. After the spring rains have come down from the hills, such a rush of blossoming sweeps through it as only a dry country wilderness can show (Smith 1937, 89).

Smith’s moves from the landscape to the people who “were a surprise” compared to most Jamaican peasants whom he considered impoverished and dependent on white landlords:

But though crops may fail three years in a row, there still is enterprise in the place. The land is held in small plots, each with its thatched clean cabin of white or pink, around which oleanders blossom . . . . At Calabash Bay the black canoes came flying with their draughts of fish, white sails bent energetically to the brine (Smith 1937, 90).

In the next passage Smith confesses his admiration for the character of the people themselves. He seems to believe that their virtues are derived, in part, from their supposed ethnic background:
It would be false to say less than that I fell in love with the Bay people. They were the lovely kind. How had it happened that so many Scotch mariners had been stranded on this coast, settled, and left the legacy of Celtic blood? The brown country-folk and fishermen, with their blue eyes and taffy-colored wool, bore Scotch names proudly, and were no less proud of their Scotch code of honesty. They were polite, friendly, and self-respecting (Smith 1937, 90).

**Ancestry and Political Economy**

How, indeed, did it happen that so many Scotsmen settled at Pedro Plains, presumably intermarried with local blacks, and “left their legacy of Celtic blood”? Shipwreck stories aside, there was substantial Scottish immigration to Jamaica throughout the colonial period. Edward Long, an early historian of Jamaica, estimated in 1774 that “very near one third of the of the inhabitants are either natives of [Scotland] or descendants of those who were” (quoted in Karras 1992, 54). The only documented settlement of Scots — the aforementioned survivors of Morgan’s 1670 expedition — is in the vicinity of Malvern, about fifteen miles away in the mountains behind Treasure Beach (Reidell and Moore 1987; Jacobs 1953). It is likely that some of these families may have eventually migrated down to the coast, where there are old cattle pens on the Ordinance Survey maps named Duncan and Campbell. However, the prominent local names — James, Senior, Henry, Parchment and Ebanks, for example — do not appear to be particularly Celtic in origin. Smith probably comes closer to the truth when he alludes to the absence of white landlords, and therefore of slavery, as contributing to the industriousness of the people in the area. Light rainfall makes sugar cultivation in this part of St. Elizabeth Parish virtually impossible. Livestock
raising — cattle, mules and horses — was the only large-scale economic activity at Pedro Plains, or *Hatos de Pereda*, during the Spanish and subsequent British colonial periods (Wade 1984; Padron 1952). Although a few slaves were used as herders in the cattle “pens” of Jamaica, the dry, southwestern portion of St. Elizabeth did not support an agricultural system based on extensive use of slave labor. Smith recognizes that it is not just the reputed presence of Scottish “blood” that contributes to the relative prosperity and independence of the local peasantry:

> In Jamaica the pattern of country society is set by the plantations, usually. At the center of each is the nucleus of white management with its servants around it. Around this, in hundreds of acres of bush and field, the ex-slave populace lives, its labor bought by the management as needed (1937, 89).

Pedro Plains, on the other hand, was “one of those rare communities in the British islands where the lava of white benevolence had not hardened down from above, to keep the nonwhites in a proper order” (1937, 90). A much later traveler I met in the course of my fieldwork confirmed Smith’s musings as to the source of “enterprise” in this place.

Dr. Gayle McGarrity, a Berkeley-trained Jamaican anthropologist with family roots in southwestern St. Elizabeth, was taking a break from her own fieldwork in the public schools of Kingston and staying at the Treasure Beach Hotel. Over coffee at Trans-Love Bakery, which by 1996 had become a clearing house for nearly every tourist passing through Treasure Beach, I asked her if she felt the people here were different from people in other parts of Jamaica. She concurred with Smith’s
impression that the area is very different in socioeconomic terms from the rest of the island. "Yes," she noted:

The political economy of this region is quite different. There is a larger proportion of small freeholders here than in any other part of the island. There are a few remnants of large cattle estates left, but in general, the distribution of wealth here is far less skewed [than the rest of Jamaica]. . .this is direct result of the lack of slavery here.

Glanville Smith may be the first documented tourist arrival in Treasure Beach, but by 1937 tourism had already arrived. In his role as a modern explorer, he preferred his islanders to be "unmarred by the mad world outside" (1937, 3); therefore, in the body of the text he mentions no outside white visitors aside from himself. There is, however, a footnote after his attribution of local industry and honesty to the absence of white landowners:

This is no longer wholly true. The coast is being opened to the tourist trade, which means that the best shore properties are in part now in alien white hands (1937, 90).

Smith's 1937 prediction is only the first in a long series of prophecies continuing up to the present that situate Treasure Beach on the cusp of a tourism boom while touting its still unspoiled character.

Construction began on the Treasure Beach Hotel in 1939, shortly after Smith's visit to Calabash Bay. Some local residents can still tell stories about the hotel's beginnings. Martin Lewis, now nearing seventy, worked as a laborer on the hotel when he was a teenager. Friendly, polite and dignified, Martin exemplifies many of the qualities Smith praised in the inhabitants of Pedro Plains. He enjoys talking to
strangers with no expectation of a “likkle sint’ing” in return. Tourists often complain that in Negril and MoBay most, but certainly not all, interactions between tourists and locals result in an attempt to sell something, often drugs, or an outright request for money in exchange for information or simple conversation. Very seldom is this the case in Treasure Beach.

The Local Racial Order

Martin Lewis also typifies the population Smith encountered in his ethnic heritage; he is a red man, a person of mixed descent. The terms red man and red gal are used all over Jamaica as a somewhat derogatory terms for a person of mixed black and white heritage who, especially in the past, had middle class pretensions. In Jamaican parlance, he or she is a “cuffy,” occupying a niche in the Jamaican racial order above darker skinned people (Cliff 1984). In Treasure Beach, however, most of the original inhabitants were “red men,” and so the term does not have the derogatory connotation it would in Kingston. There is, however, an aspect of class associated with the use of the term. Members of the local elite and professional people of the same coloration would consider themselves as part of the brown middle class.

Martin is lean, with short-cropped white hair and a reddish-brown complexion. It is from him that I first heard the local explanation of the term red man.

It is, you know, like mix[ed] blood. They say that Scotch sailors wreck upon the coast here back in slavery times and marry with black Jamaican gals. That is where we come from.
Like most of the men from these fishing villages Martin “went to sea” as a boy (figure 4.1).

Mark you, it was a very hard way to make money. We had no motors on the boats like you see now. The boats were small, carved out from log, with sails. When the wind too high, you cannot go to sea. When the wind is too soft, you cannot go to sea. Lord have mercy if a blow come up when you fish on Pedro Banks [about 50 miles offshore]! If it not kill you the wind blow you to Colombia.

Martin decided that working construction was an opportunity to get ahead. He relates that the Treasure Beach Hotel was constructed by a wealthy white Jamaican from Black River named Duncan. It was built specifically to cater to weekend visits by young Englishwomen who taught at Hampton College, a preparatory schools for girls in Malvern. I discovered later that the early tourists were more diverse, but as I began to hear about the English schoolteachers from other informants, I realized that they seem to have left a more lasting impression on the local inhabitants than other visitors.

Naming the Attraction

Martin also explained the origin of the name Treasure Beach to me:

No, I never hear of any buried treasure here. But they say that at Frenchman’s Bay [the beach where the hotel is located] is where a French pirate was killed. No man, Mr. Duncan, he thought up the name Treasure Beach for the hotel to dress it up a bit you know. We always call it Frenchman’s Bay, or jus’ Frenchman . . . Later, they began to call the whole district all the way back to the [Santa Cruz] mountains Treasure Beach. I still call it Pedro Plains.

Duncan’s act of naming his hotel and the beach it overlooks eventually resulted in the renaming of the entire area. The name served to differentiate this pocket of grey sand
Figure 4.1. Fishing boats at Calabash Bay.
beach at Frenchman’s Bay from others along the coast and mark it as a sight worth seeing and experiencing. More importantly, this naming phase was the first step in the continuing commodification of place at Treasure Beach.

After the hotel was completed in 1941, Martin played steel guitar in a mento band at the hotel’s restaurant. Mento can best be described as Jamaica’s version of calypso. It was originally performed as dance music in rural areas, and in the 1940s and early 50s evolved into a more urbanized popular style (Manuel 1995). Martin went on to more lucrative jobs performing in hotels on the North Coast, which were in their heyday as resorts for the rich and famous. He is now retired and lives on a small pension he receives from the Manchester Municipal Gas Works in England. Martin’s stint working in England — an “England man” is the local term — and his involvement in tourism are common and often intertwined strategies for getting ahead in Treasure Beach.

Elite Tourism

Frank Pringle’s involvement with tourism comes from the opposite pole of the Jamaican social spectrum. He confirmed Martin’s account of the building and naming of the Treasure Beach Hotel and elaborated on tourism here in general during this early period. The Pringle family arrived in Jamaica in the early 1900s from England, invested in sugar and cattle land which was selling cheaply at the time, and took their place among island’s white elite. Frank was director of the Jamaica Tourist Board during the last years of colonial rule. In spite of his background, Pringle moves
comfortably in contemporary Jamaican society. His daughter married a black Jamaican with Frank's blessing and he tells the story of the following conversation he had with Michael Manley:

I was attending a reception at the Pegasus Hotel [in Kingston] and chatting with Michael about land reform. I told him that my grandfather could ride from the North Coast to Kingston without leaving his own land. Michael replied, "If that were still true, we should have to do something about it."

Frank is not a full time resident of Treasure Beach, but his family has owned property there since the 1930s. He and his wife, June Gay, built a three bedroom villa — a villa in Jamaica is any sort of vacation home — between Calabash Bay and Frenchman's Bay in 1942.

June Gay's parents came over from England in the 1920s and settled in Mandeville in the neighboring parish of Manchester, about forty miles from Treasure Beach. Her family also bought land in Treasure Beach, and her sister and brother-in-law, Sally and Perry Henzell, eventually built a small resort called Jake's Place. Jake's would significantly change the pace of commodification of place in Treasure Beach.

Mandeville has been called "the most English town in Jamaica" because of its cool highland climate and the number of English expatriates who have settled there. By the early 1950s it had also become the center of bauxite operations in Jamaica, bringing in more resident foreigners from Canada and the United States. June Gay and Frank recall that with the completion of paved roads as far as Malvern in the 1930s, Treasure Beach became accessible from Mandeville by automobile. Most roads in the Pedro
Plains district remained unimproved until the 1970s, but because of the dry climate they remained passable year round. English, Canadian and American expatriates were able to take the advice of Verrill’s 1931 guide and see Jamaica by car. Rather modest villas were built to accommodate the families from Mandeville who were joined by government officials and some wealthy Jamaicans from Kingston. I should emphasize that, until recently, any Jamaican who owned a car would have been considered wealthy. Frank Pringle estimates that by the late 1970s perhaps thirty or forty villas were widely scattered along the shore and through the hills overlooking the coast.

These early tourists were guided to Treasure Beach almost entirely by word of mouth, and until very recently this was still the case. There is, however, some documentation of tourist promotion in Jamaican publications, and indications that, in spite of the arrival of tourism, the image it projected as a place remained essentially the same. A 1959 article in the Sunday Gleaner entitled “St. Elizabeth Coming into a Fuller Destiny” reports that:

the murmur of the sea is restful and the only sign of life except for Canadians and Kingstonians taking their morning swim is the distant sight of fishermen hauling in their nets at a far headland (Sealy 1959, 20).

A 1975 Gleaner article emphasizes the distinctiveness of the landscape: “Calabash Bay is still amongst the most beautifully fascinating places in all Jamaica. The scenery here is quite exceptional,” and it reads, and echoes Glanville Smith’s sentiments that “the people at Calabash Bay are consistently pleasant and hospitable.” The writer also remarks on the “modest to rather elegant cottages owned by Mandeville and Kingston
people" (Hawkes 1975, 3). A 1978 article entitled “St. Elizabeth Diary” contains an early reference to the new place name:

Treasure Beach is a very profitable fishing area with a beautiful hotel overlooking the sea. There is potential there for future tourist development . . . . The climatic conditions differ dramatically from the rest of the parish and this is reflected in the vegetation found there (Gladstone 1978, 10).

The Community Opens Up

New roads and industries provided access to Treasure Beach for tourists and also for Jamaicans looking for new opportunities. Garver, a dark-skinned man from the eastern, wetter side of St. Elizabeth Parish, arrived in Treasure Beach in 1968 as a young man hoping to find work in this “profitable fishing area.” He was an early arrival in what was a steady stream, though not yet a flood, of new residents looking for work. Garver does not switch as easily from Jamaican patois to a more standard form of Caribbean English because he has neither lived abroad nor had much direct contact with tourists. Therefore, I will not attempt to reproduce his exact words as he spoke them. In essence, he recalls:

I came here because I did not want work in the cane fields like the rest of my family. I was the first black man among red skinned people. In those days you could not get work on the fishing boats. They would take on only their own kind, not a black man. Yes, I met with racism here.

Garver was certainly not the first black person in Treasure Beach, but he obviously felt the sting of exclusion from this tightly knit fishing and farming community who looked after their own first. He finally befriended Bozzie, a local man his own age whose grandmother had saved enough money to buy a used pick-up truck. Her oldest
son was working in Canada, and in proper Jamaican tradition “looked back,” sending his mother a monthly sum. Garver and Bozzie bought local produce, much of which cannot be grown well on the rest of the island — escallions (green onions), melons (watermelons), cabbages and tomatoes — and drove to the markets of May Pen, Spanish Town, Kingston and the North Coast. The improved roads that opened up Treasure Beach to tourists in the 1930s also created an island-wide distribution network for the area’s fish and produce. Increased traffic on the local road network has encouraged farmers to sell directly to consumers from the side of the road (figure 4.2). In Garver’s case, his association with Bozzie earned him acceptance in the community. Garver learned to lay block from Bozzie’s brother, and opportunities to ply his trade as a mason opened up as local fishermen and farmers began to replace their traditional thatched wattle and daub houses with stuccoed block houses.

Local residents who had “gone a foreign” like Martin, began to return in the late 1960s and early 1970s, in some cases to stretch their pensions and saving, and in others simply to satisfy a longing to be home. Infrastructure improvements such as electricity and water provided an additional incentive for retirees who had gotten accustomed to these amenities abroad, although there are still frequent interruptions in service. Most of the area received electricity between 1969 and 1970, and water lines were extended in 1980. Telephone service arrived in 1991 firmly connecting Treasure Beach with the outside world.
Figure 4.2. Farmer selling produce by the road.
Miss Ruby, Garver's neighbor, remembers walking down the tar and chip road between Frenchman's Bay and Calabash Bay in 1991. She nodded and said good morning to the "donkey ladies," Miss Inez and Miss Jennifer, selling fresh fruit and vegetables to the occasional tourist walking the road (figure 4.3). "How is business today?" asked Miss Ruby. "We nuh sell not'ing today except to tourist, everyone, talk, talk, talk on the phone" replied Miss Inez. Miss Ruby looked around. She was right, none of the locals resident were out on their porches or in their yards. She looked down the road lined with small block houses and an occasional nog, very small houses made of wattle and daub, and recalled that phone service had just been introduced yesterday for the first time and everyone, except for the three young German tourists walking in the distance, was talking to each other on the phone.

Garver remembers that as demand for new construction increased — fueled mostly by local demand and returnees rather than tourism — a labor shortage developed and more people followed in his footsteps from other parts of St. Elizabeth and Jamaica in search of work. As more new residents arrived, the population became more diversified along the color continuum, and distinctions became more blurred as Jamaica moved as a whole toward an African based identity. Garver's opinion of the change in local race relations might be applied on a national and perhaps global level: "t'ings bettah fe'we now, but dem bukra [white man] still on top." Joe, a red man who was taking me along the coast to Black River, gave me another example of the
Figure 4.3. Miss Inez and Miss Jennifer making their rounds.
changing racial order. “Yeah man, I never run with red gals. They mind me too much of my sisters. I like the black gals from the mountains.”

Countercultural Tourists

Huey and three of his buddies from Thunder Bay, Ontario, Canada roared into Treasure Beach on rented motorcycles in January 1978. The four young men had been fleeing the frozen North in February for the beaches of Negril every year since 1973. Like Garver, they all worked construction; Huey is a plumber and his friends are carpenters. Winter is their slow season so they can afford to take a month each year. The Thunder Bay Posse (posse as in drug gang), as they are now known in Treasure Beach, were part of the earliest wave of post-tourism to wash up here. I have argued that the both currents of post-tourism — the independent alternative and the all-inclusive mainstream — are rooted in the countercultural hippie invasion of Negril. The Thunder Bay Posse are not exactly your peace-and-love variety of hippie in search of the exotic other, but they played an important role in developing one of most important sites of post-tourism in Treasure. In their five seasons at Negril, from 1973 to 1977, they learned to appreciate Jamaican culture and music, but they especially appreciated Red Stripe, red rum, drugs and warm weather. Huey explained what brought them from there to Treasure Beach:

We heard about Negril from some friends in Toronto. Hell, we didn’t know anything about Jamaica and we didn’t care. We just wanted someplace warm where you could camp on the beach for free and smoke ganja and eat mushrooms for a month...The year before we came here the girls [wives and girlfriends] wanted to come along instead of freezin’ their asses off at home, so we rented rooms. You couldn’t camp any
more on the beach anyway. They hated it, too much noise, too much hassle, no privacy. They didn’t want to come back to Jamaica. But we really liked it here. So, in ’78 we came down early and promised we’d find someplace quiet. Plus, we’d get to spend a month on our own. Of course, we went to Negril first to party for while and met a couple of German guys who told us about Treasure Beach.

Winford Lewis (no relation to Martin) had returned to Treasure Beach after working eight years in England. He was too young to retire but had inherited a piece of property from his uncle on the beach at Frenchman’s Bay near the Treasure Beach Hotel. The property fronted on the main road that snaked between the four villages and contained a large one-story block building. Winford’s uncle had built the structure several years before with the intention of opening a bar and dance hall, but the project never materialized. Winford had saved some money and considered finishing off the building and opening the club, but would have to invest all of his savings. “Fe’ true, I was not sure if it would succeed. The white people from the villas go to the hotel when they go out at all, and the local people all go to the rum shop down the road, the Fisherman’s Bar.”

Meanwhile, the Thunder Bay Posse was searching for accommodations. The place was certainly quiet enough, the people were friendly and they were delighted with the raucous ambiance of the Fishermen’s Bar where they relished being the only white people in the place. The Treasure Beach Hotel was out of the question as a place to stay and the few villas for rent were either too small or too pricey. There were two guesthouses in the area with four rooms each. The Four-M’s Cottage was out because the somewhat straitlaced owner, Miss Effie, frowned on ganja and did not like
their looks anyway. Shakespeare Cottage would have been appropriate but some young Germans were long-term tourists and might be staying several weeks.

Huey noticed the empty building on the bend of the road and approached Winford with an offer. He and his friends would supply the labor to partition the building into four rooms with a common room in the center, install louvered windows, doors and bathroom fixtures, and finally, hook up the plumbing to the newly laid waterline by the road. Winford supplied the materials and a few simple furnishings and reserved four rooms for the Thunder Bay Posse every February. The work was nearly finished when the women arrived in February and Golden Sands Guest House was born.

Winford’s guesthouse eventually grew to include ten still very sparsely furnished rooms, a separate cottage and a covered pavilion serving beer and soft drinks when someone is on hand to serve them (figure 4.4). Winford recounts that most of his guests in the 1980s were young Germans who heard about Golden Sands through word of mouth. The strand in front of Golden Sands has become the most popular beach in the area and a local woman, Miss Annie, set up a small thatched “chicken and fish shack” nearby serving cold beer and food to foreign and Jamaican tourists (figure 4.5). Along with Trans-Love Bakery and Jake’s Place, Golden Sands is a gathering place and informal information center for alternative post-tourists. The name itself denotes another step in commodification. Only with a lot of imagination, and with the
Figure 4.4. Golden Sands Guest House at Frenchman’s Bay.
Figure 4.5. Miss Annie's "chicken and fish" shack.
afternoon sun at exactly the right angle, could the grey sand of Frenchman’s Bay appear golden.

**Alternative Entrepreneurship**

Two Americans, Michael Harmon and Julie Koliopulos, stepped out of a bright red minibus in June 1989 at Roots Corner, as the space under the calabash tree on the bend just outside of Wilford’s yard is called. Several young Germans waiting in the shade with backpacks squeezed in to take their places. “Yup,” said Michael, “this is the place.” Julie wasn’t so sure, she preferred the classic lush, green tropical paradise on the eastern side of Jamaica around Port Antonio. On the advice of a young Englishman, they had visited here before at the beginning of their reconnaissance trip, and had then traveled around the island in the tracks of mostly German alternative tourists looking for the right place to carry out their plans. They had decided to open a bakery and coffee shop that would appeal specifically to these young Germans and others like them. At the same time they wanted local people to feel welcome in their place as a matter of both social justice and practicality.

Michael believes very seriously in social justice and hard work. Julie believes very seriously in hedonism and doing exactly what she wants to do. He had been a roofer and backwoods social philosopher for most of his life after a stint with military intelligence the National Security Agency. Recently, he had started a second career as a freelance baker. She specialized in living a designer lifestyle on a shoestring budget and creating ambiance. Michael wanted to get out of “Amerika” and Julie wanted to
live in the tropics. Opening a bakery in Jamaica catering to alternative post-tourists seemed like a good compromise. It helped that Michael and Julie were decidedly countercultural themselves. They found a suitable building shared with a small bar about a quarter mile east from Golden Sands and christened the place Trans-Love Bakery after a 1960s Donovan tune “Trans-Love Airways.”

A Jamaican student in my ethnography class said to me, “You will have no problem doing ethnographic research in Jamaica. Everyone has an opinion and we love to talk.” Michael is also opinionated and loves to talk. He established an instant rapport with the local villagers who showed a keen interest in their project. Michael remembers:

We were the first foreigners to come in here and open up a small business, so everyone was curious and offered advice. When our second-hand industrial stove and refrigerator were delivered the whole town showed up to help unload, mostly because they wanted to see “what go on.” They said we’d never make it, the Germans were too cheap, they never ate out. One guy suggested we open up a drive-up patty [meat or vegetable pie] window. Hell, most of our [potential] customers, Jamaican or foreign, don’t have cars.

One need Michael and Julie identified in their targeted market was good strong coffee. In the land of Blue Mountain coffee it was nearly impossible to find fresh-brewed coffee outside of the resort areas. Coffee is an important export crop and is now priced beyond the means of most ordinary Jamaicans; instant coffee is far cheaper and more “modern.” They located a source of fresh beans and roasted them at the shop. On opening day, in January 1990, as Michael roasted the beans in the kitchen at 5:00 in the morning,
four old ladies showed up. They had smelled the beans roasting and said they hadn’t smelled that smell in years, not since they used to roast fresh beans over a fire in the yard when they were kids. From then on, we served free coffee to any local Jamaicans who showed up before 7:00. . . . Once the Germans realized we had good coffee, fresh baguettes with guava jelly and chocolate cake, I had ‘em.

I should add that the menu would also includes fresh orange juice, which is also difficult to obtain outside of the resort areas, and some interesting variations on traditional Jamaican ingredients: grapefruit cake, ackee quiche, and mango Black Forest cake.

They hired local men to build rough chairs and tables and a thatched pavilion next to the building with a waist-high wattle fence around it to keep out the goats and cows. These traditional skills of weaving branches into wattle and using Sabal fronds — locally called thatch palms — for roofing had fallen into disuse following the advent of concrete block and zinc construction. In contrast to their use of traditional materials and methods in construction, Julie painted every surface inside and out with bold Miami Beach Art Deco colors, and superimposed sea shells, tropical birds and palms as decorative motifs. Local tastes tended toward more muted color schemes: rust red, whitewash and an occasional pastel pink or blue.

Michael was right. He and Julie had instinctively hit upon the right combination to attract not only the low-budget alternative tourists staying at places like Golden Sands, but also a growing number of up-scale tourists including professional people from Kingston, diplomats and foreign aid workers staying in the Treasure Beach Hotel and the more expensive villas. Michael and Julie insured the patronage of ordinary
local people by discreetly instituting preferential prices for residents. This two-tiered price system is not uncommon in Jamaica. Lower hotel room prices for Jamaican residents versus foreigners were formally introduced during the Manley era to encourage domestic tourism. Similarly, taxi drivers and vendors usually charge foreigners more than Jamaicans.

Julie added a final touch to the bright blue gate in the wattle fence at the entrance to the covered pavilion: painted in white, flowing letters was the invitation, “Enter for coolness” (figure 4.6). I do not think it is pushing textual analysis too far to suggest that this greeting implies more than “come in out of the hot tropical sun and pass some time here.” Trans-Love by its very name projects an image of coolness, or “hipness.” There is cultural capital to be gained by all who pass through these gates. The owners had done more than combine a pastiche of local traditional architectural forms with non-traditional decor, and quintessentially Jamaican ingredients with nouveau cuisine. They had created a postmodern space in which tourists could encounter the “exotic other.” This was also a space in which the “exotic other” could encounter tourists either for entertainment value, or to acquire cultural and perhaps, economic capital.

The Hinterland

On December 31, 1993 the Cherry-B, one of the three minibuses which ply the route to Treasure Beach, pulls up to the curb where I wait on Main Street in Black
Figure 4.6. Trans-Love Bakery, "Enter for Coolness."
River, the parish seat of St. Elizabeth Parish. My Caribbean Islands Handbook succinctly says:

Black River is one of the oldest towns in Jamaica. It had its heyday in the 18th century when it was the main exporting harbour for logwood dyes. The first car imported into Jamaica. Along the shore are some fine early 19th century mansions, some of which are being restored (Cameron and Box 1993, 199).

Although the Jamaican Tourist Board had established an office there, Black River had not yet attracted much attention itself as a tourism commodity, nor had Treasure Beach. Before boarding the minibus, I visited the Tourist Board office looking for literature on Treasure Beach. The lady behind the desk apologetically handed me the only two brochures she had that mentioned the place. The brochure entitled “Discover Jamaica’s Exciting South Coast” contained three advertisements for villas but no other information on Treasure Beach. The other brochure was for the Treasure Beach Hotel and again made no mention of the surrounding communities. Clearly, the formal tourism production system had not yet discovered Treasure Beach.

I squeezed into the crowded minibus with seven other people including three women returning from market, two school children and two Swedish tourists with enormous backpacks — plus Cherry, the driver, and her cousin, the “sideman” or conductor, who helped shoehorn people into the vehicle and collect fares. Cherry spoke with an obvious English accent. Her parents had emigrated from Treasure Beach to London in the 1950s. When they returned after retirement, Cherry decided to accompany them and assess the opportunities in Treasure Beach for starting her own
business. She heard complaints from residents and tourists about inadequate minibus
service and increasing demand on the route to Black River. She used her savings to
buy a new, bright red Toyota minivan and now delivers reliable and comfortable
service on the route. Her experience as a returnee and female entrepreneur is not
unusual in Treasure Beach.

At the eastern edge of town, we cross an old iron bridge over the dark waters of
Black River, Jamaica’s longest river system. To the right is the sea and a small rusting
freighter anchored at the river’s mouth. To the left of the bridge, about ten large
pontoon boats are moored to the bank. A billboard with a crocodile painted on it
proclaims Swaby’s Safari Tours. The Great Morass of the Black River is the island’s
largest wetland and is home to the only remaining significant population of saltwater
crocodiles, locally called alligators. In Jamaica’s belated rush to jump on the
ecotourism bandwagon, tours of the morass have been marketed by the Jamaica
Tourist Board as the premier attraction on the South Coast. Ecotourism, as it is
practiced here, is no more environmentally correct than swamp tours in Louisiana, as
the animals are somewhat harassed and fed by the tour operators to fulfill tourist
expectations. Commodification of this landscape, however, has had at least two
beneficial effects. Charles Swaby and several other tour operators are no longer
guiding hunters into the morass to slaughter the animals, and a movement is under way
to incorporate the morass into a nature preserve (Baker 1996).
After the bridge the two lane road runs for about four miles on a spit of sand between the mangrove covered morass and the sea. There are several small hotels, guest houses and villas on the seaside. These are the last tourist accommodations we encounter before Treasure Beach. We turn inland and cut through lush pastures, dotted with huge silk cotton trees (ceibas) draped with bromeliads. After only six miles the vegetation becomes noticeably drier. Silk cottons become scarcer, acacias begin to appear, and the pasturage is not as green. We have begun to enter the rain shadow of the Santa Cruz Mountains. As the road begins to curve south, a broad plain extends to the foot of the mountains. Although the land is dry, small cultivated fields scratched into the red soil are scattered among the acacia trees and knee-high, straw-colored Guinea grass (figure 4.7). The farmers live in neat cottages built in vernacular style but with modern materials. Most of them haul water by pick-up truck, either borrowed or their own, in fifty gallon drums and carefully mulch around the plants with guinea grass. This dryland farming landscape is one source of the area’s relative prosperity and a marker of its culture. As we turn back toward the sea a sweeping vista opens up as the land drops off more steeply toward the Caribbean and then levels off (figure 4.8). The four small bays that make up Treasure Beach and the more gently sloping savannah land behind them are embraced by two arms of this last escarpment as it reaches to the sea. The arm that grips the sea to the southeast of Treasure Beach is an up-tilted block of limestone called Great Pedro Bluff. The bluff is spiked with cacti thirty feet tall and is dense with xerophytic vegetation (figure 4.9). The
Figure 4.7. Scallion field mulched with guinea grass.
Figure 4.8. Pedro Plains sloping toward the sea.
Figure 4.9. Xerophytic vegetation on Great Pedro Bluff.
guidebooks are right, the change in landscape here comes almost as a shock, especially to a geographer. We meet the sea at Calabash Bay where the road makes a hard right toward Frenchman’s Bay. Cherry drops me off at the corner in front of the modest but comfortable house where I will be staying with Julie of Trans-Love Bakery during my research.

A Walk Through Treasure Beach

The mile of narrow tar and chip road between the corner at Calabash Bay and Trans-Love Bakery is the core of Treasure Beach (figure 4.10). The corner is actually a crossroads. A short dirt lane leads to the Fisherman’s Coop and beach at Calabash Bay. Every Wednesday, two women from Middle Quarters, about twenty miles east of Treasure Beach where rainfall is plentiful, set out their produce — including white yams, cho-cho (chayote), and sweet potatoes — which cannot be grown locally. They return with local produce to Middle Quarters, participating in an exchange of products made possible by the contrasting environments of St. Elizabeth Parish.

Across from this impromptu market space are three originally small houses that have obviously been enlarged in several stages. The owners of these houses participate informally in the tourist production system by renting out rooms to tourists for US$10 per day. Miss Bea, one of the owners, has been able to rebuild her original wattle and daub house, or nog, in a larger concrete version and add two rooms (figure 4.11). She explains:

My husband was a fisherman lost at sea in 1981. It was a burdensome time. The [Fisherman’s] Coop give some money, so I bring water into
Figure 4.10. Treasure Beach between Calasbash Bay and Frenchman’s Bay (Survey Department 1976).
Figure 4.11. Miss Bea’s House at Calabash Bay.
the house and add a bathroom. If you take tourists into your house, you must have water. At first, I have only one bedroom so I stay with my sister when I have guests. Then, likkle by likkle my brother build me two more rooms. . . . Most of them [tourists] are nice people . . . and sometimes they send me a likkle somt'ing when they go back a foreign.

Miss Bea’s experience in running an informal guest house is common in Treasure Beach. She occasionally puts a hand-lettered “room for rent” sign in her front window, but relies mostly on word of mouth to attract clientele. A close-knit network of family and neighbors supply her with guests and provide help in times of need. Guests have free use of the house and yard, and upon request, Miss Bea will cook steamed fish with rice and peas adding a further touch of authenticity to the tourist experience. Returnees from England and North America have built larger, more modern houses that still evoke a sense of local vernacular style (figure 4.12). Many of them take in tourists but charge more, and are less dependent on the income than Miss Bea.

Returning to the main road I walk past Villa Caprice, Calabash House and Doubloon, spacious villas situated with their backs to the sea. Tropical vegetation and flowering hibiscus and bougainvillea screen the villas from the road. The wealthy Kingstonians who own these villas can afford to use water lavishly to recreate the gardens found within their walled compounds in the capital. Here in Treasure Beach, however, the threat of crime is not as great, and low iron fences front the properties. Calabash house is one the older villas dating from the 1930s. As in the earliest period of tourism in Treasure Beach, Jamaicans and Canadians make up the majority of
Figure 4.12. Vacation villa built by returnees at Calabash Bay.
guests staying in the villas. The owners, one of whom is the local member of parliament, supply a housekeeper and gardener for the comfort of their guests.

Domestic help in Jamaica are called “helpers” as a sign of respect, and as a way masking the social relations between the working classes and the middle and upper classes. In a country with an official unemployment rate of 16.5% in 1997, and an estimated 30% of the workforce in the informal, or underground sector of the economy, labor is cheap and replaceable. Nevertheless, workers demand “respect” in the Jamaican spirit of resistance (World Trade Organization 1999, 5-6). Young males or youths (pronounced yoots) use the word “respect” with a slightly raised fist as a greeting among themselves and with tourists who are expected to reply with a similar gesture, a meeting of fists, and the phrase “Respect mon.” The greeting has obvious ideological connotations, but in MoBay and Negril it is often a prelude to a come on. If tourists refuse to buy whatever goods or services are being offered, they are accused of lacking respect and being racist. This behavior is widespread throughout the West Indies and officially called harassment. Harassment is rare in Treasure Beach and its absence is frequently commented upon by tourists.

“Good mamin’ suh” is the most common greeting I receive while walking down the road in Treasure Beach. Morning and afternoon are the best time to walk rather than in the heat of the afternoon, and most local people go about their business or visiting at those times. They greet everyone including tourists and expect a greeting in return. People lean over the gates and chat with neighbors on the porch. Most houses,
large or small, have a well-demarcated yard. The yard in Jamaica is an extension of
the house — indoor kitchens are a fairly recent introduction — and a member of the
household is a “yardie.” Whether they are aware of it or not, tourists staying people’s
homes become “yardies” and therefore entitled to a kind of temporary status, or
symbolic capital in the community. One does not go through a gate and march up to
the door of a house. Visitors, even good friends, are expected to stand at the gate and
call out.

The road undulates gently over the lay of the land as it parallels the sea. Most of
the villas are on the seaside, but they are still interspersed with fishermen’s cottages
and several small open fields. The houses on the landward side are generally more
modest, although even on my first trip to Treasure Beach there was a good deal of
small-scale construction, usually performed by the owners or their relatives. There are
more gaps on this side of the road, and beyond the houses, the fields are open
savannahs of tall guinea grass dotted with acacia trees bent away from the prevailing
winds (figure 4.13). Tourists frequently comment on the similarity of the landscape to
East Africa, another familiar place image and commodified landscape. This familiar,
yet exotic landscape evokes a strong impression of difference for visitors.

The tiny whitewashed Treasure Beach Church of God stands in a small field on
the seaward side of the road (figure 4.14). Every Sunday morning the door stands
open and the passerby can see and hear the enthusiastic call and response in praise of
the Lord — “What do you think of Jesus? I think he’s alright.” The congregation
Figure 4.13. Dry savannah land with acacia trees.
Figure 4.14. Treasure Beach Church of God.
usually consists of six to ten older ladies singing to the accompaniment of a tambourine. Tourists expecting reggae are hearing the “roots” of popular Jamaican music instead. The style is quite similar to rural black gospel music in the American South, but the tambourine is played more like a drum with simple and steady beat — “a muffled double pulse reminiscent of a heartbeat” (Manuel 1995, 160). This rhythm is a basic element of Afro-Protestant Jamaican “Revival” music and was passed down through ska music to reggae.

Jake’s, now called Jake’s Place, is a bit farther down the road on the same side as the Church of God. At the time of my first visit in 1994, it was a restaurant founded and run by a white Jamaican, Sally Henzell. Sally’s sister June Gay is married to Frank Pringle whose father, John, was married to Carmen deLissa, owner of the Sunset Lodge in MoBay. Esther Chapman described the Sunset Lodge in 1951 as “the most fashionable resorts in the Caribbean. . . . You can read as much about the Sunset Lodge and its celebrities in the writings of the New York columnists as in the West Indian Review” (1951, 158). Sally’s husband is Perry Henzell, an Antiguan born writer and film producer known for helping to popularize reggae music through his film “The Harder They Come.” Perry is well connected in the international music and film industries and, as we have seen with Miss Bea, family connections and support in Jamaica are important irrespective of social class.

Sally bought a parcel of beachfront property with a small fishermen’s cottage near her sister’s land in 1991. She renovated the cottage, extended the front porch as a
dining area, and turned it into a restaurant. She now tells tourists and travel writers that the restaurant is named for her parrot Jake. Sally and Perry, however, possess a keen sense of irony; "jakes" is also local slang for Jamaican whites. The patio behind the restaurant overlooks a small beach nestled in the craggy calcareous rocks that line this part of the shore. The view is dramatic, but the beach is subject to a vicious undertow.

In 1994, the patio at Jake's was a gathering place for foreign expatriates living in Treasure Beach, a few up-scale tourists staying at the Treasure Beach Hotel and local villas, the more free-spending alternative post-tourists, and well-heeled Jamaican and foreign friends of the Henzells. Local patronage was somewhat limited because of the rather high prices, but the staff of "helpers" and their friends and relatives provided the local color essential to the post-tourist experience. For example, Duggie, a local man, tended the patio bar and entertained the guests with his sharp wit and dry humor. Kettle, an elderly friend of Duggie, proved to be especially popular with tourists. He flirted with foreign women and told amusing and ribald stories in a thick patois. Duggie and the guests plied him with shots of white rum. As he steadily drank shot after shot of rum, the more comical and entertaining he became for the clientele. Finally, he would collapse at the bar and be taken home. In the eyes of the tourists, Kettle was an authentic local "character," but they were really laughing at a stock, comic stereotype right out of racist black-face minstrel shows (Mellinger 1994).
Encounters

Many tourists come to Treasure Beach specifically for the possibility of rewarding interactions with local residents. Even the more up-market tourists seem to value interaction so long as it takes place in a fairly controlled and safe environment. Budget tourists are generally more adventurous and will seek interaction in arenas that are truly foreign. Trans-Love provided a place where both strands of post-tourists could feel comfortable mingling with local villagers and occasional members of the local elite and have an excellent breakfast at the same time. Farmers have even made Trans-Love a regular stop on their routes as they drive around the area selling produce (figure 4.15). A fairly typical entry transcribed from my field notes read:

Sunday 10:30 February 16, 1994. Trans-Love. Vonnie, Jackie and Marie in the shop, singing gospel hymns. Marie smiles and says “Good mornin’ next Michael” hands me my coffee. Martin sits outside on the steps and strums his guitar quietly to the hymns. 15 people in Trans-love, 6 Germans, 4 Jamaicans, 1 Dutchman, 3 Americans, 2 Italian. Two Italian girls being courted by Terry and Bigga. Dutch guy playing dominos with Mackford. Lisa and Brandy are the two Americans. They sit at the women’s ex-pat table with a spliff complaining about Jamaican men. German men sitting together eating baguettes drinking coffee, much adorned with body rings (figure 4.16). German couple with two young children playing on the floor watch dominos and chat with Mackford about fishing. Frank Pringle drives up with his nephew and comes into the pavilion, he greets everyone and has a loud joke with Mackford in patois. His brown-skinned nephew runs over to shyly regard the 2 little German boys whose parents smile and urge them to play. Julie comes out with the parrot on her shoulder sits down with Frank. I go over and we talk about Butch Stewart.

Each elliptical phrase from this single entry is a distillation of both Jamaican society and life at Trans-Love.
Figure 4.15. Informal market at Trans-Love.
Figure 4.16. Alternative post-tourists at Trans-Love.
When Marie calls me “next” Michael, she means another one, as in “I’ll have next Red Stripe please.” The previous Michael, the “baker man,” and Julie have split up and he went home. Julie ran the shop on her own until a German, “next baker man, Ralf” showed up and fell in love with Treasure Beach and Trans-Love. When he bought into the business they were able to expand the pavilion in the summer of 1994. Julie and Vonnie, Jackie and Marie work the counter and kitchen. Trans-Love is an opportunity for them to work near home. Otherwise, they would have to ride a minibus back and forth to Black River where jobs are still not plentiful. Like most women in tourism, they are poorly paid by American standards (Momsen 1994), but Michael and Julie pay more than the local customary wage, about US$1.00 rather than eighty cents per hour. They are amply rewarded for their socially just stance. Julie commented once on Jackie’s “incredible loyalty.” “Once when there was a broken padlock [on the door], Jackie sat up all night guarding the shop.” Jackie was learning to help Julie with the baking, adding to her repertoire of skills, however in the usual pattern she went back to the counter when Ralf came. Women in tourism generally do no receive the same opportunity for training as men (Momsen 1994).

Julie always sends Marie into Black River to buy supplies. Marie is a very attractive red gal who has no trouble getting men to help her carry and load bags into the crowded minibus. Since this field note entry, Marie accepted a German suitor and now lives in Heidelburg. Finding a foreign partner is an economic strategy for men and women. For men, a liaison with a foreign woman is also a form of symbolic
capital, gaining them respect from other Jamaican men. The situation for Jamaican women is more problematic. They risk losing respect in the community if they associate too much with foreigners (Pruitt and LaFont 1995), especially in bars. Working, however, in a place where one is likely to meet a foreign man is more respectable.

Martin, who is sitting on the step strumming, is resuming the career he began fifty years ago playing in the Treasure Beach Hotel. His older mento style is usually unfamiliar to foreigners, but they are perhaps more appreciative of the music than young local people. Julie sometimes pays him and always gives him free coffee and cake. Martin does it for the enjoyment and gains symbolic capital through the attention and curiosity of his audience. He explained to me once how he used to play for the quadrilles, an almost forgotten style of Jamaican traditional country dancing. Even though he is an England man and played in the sophisticated North Coast Hotels of the 1940s, he is a repository of “traditional” culture for both alternative post-tourists and school girls walk by in the afternoon Julie calls them over and gives each one a “likkle” square of grapefruit cake. Alternative post-tourists are perhaps more likely to bring their children along on trips abroad than the mainstream variety, for the
experience of place. Families feel secure here and of course there is a great deal of photogenic interaction between local children and visitors. Mainstream post-tourism has targeted families with children as another lifestyle niche. All-inclusives like Franklin Delano Resort offer Kiddy Kamp and nanny service to their clientele.

The two Italian girls are part of the target group of women that Desmond Henry of Community Tourism noted as suited for a sort of “countryside” tourism. Foreign women traveling alone or in pairs, certainly of the alternative post-tourist variety, are common enough in Jamaica that a dance hall/ dub tune is entitled “Two White Girls on a Minibus.” Travel has been theorized as a masculine activity whereas women are rooted in place (Leed 1991; Pratt 1992). This is a naturalized view of travel and gender roles, of course, but it does demonstrate the alterity of women who travel in a country with a reputation for violent crime. My field notes reveal at least forty two women traveling alone or in pairs during my total of seven months field work. Women traveling in Jamaica are often very relieved to reach Treasure Beach and wind up staying longer, sometimes much longer, than they had expected. Here they are relatively free from the most overt and “indecent,” to use the Jamaican term, sort of harassment. They sense that here they are safe, and the men use “sweet talk” to gain their attention instead of rude remarks about their “rass batty” (shapely posterior). In 1996 I counted at least fifteen expatriate women staying on in Treasure Beach for months or years. They become so attached to the place, and/or to a man, that they spend several months in Jamaica a year.
In 1994 Treasure Beach had only a few full-time Beach men, "rent-a-dreads," or male whores, as they are called by the brown bourgeoisie. Most of the young, unmarried local men were fishermen and farmers, but many had been taken abroad at least once by a woman. Terry, who in this vignette was sweet-talking the Italian girls, is about twenty-five and very good looking. He has friends in Germany, Switzerland, France, and Italy. He is also the son of a fisherman and drives a new pick-up truck. Aside from the economic capital he has acquired, he has built up an enormous amount of symbolic capital in terms of respect from his male friends. An American expatriate who had lived in Treasure Beach explained her view of this type of relationship:

It's so beautiful and even the air has a sensual touch. If the man is truly good at what he does, the woman pays for everything while she's there and then sends money from home. If a man can get several of these offers going at the same time he drastically improves his lifestyle. It's not only to his benefit, as the woman sees a side of Jamaica she wouldn't see otherwise.

Pruitt and LanFont call these relationships romance tourism rather than sex tourism and considering the above quote, I would agree. They explain the phenomenon in these words:

In a unique conjunction of need, hope, and desire the romance relationships between tourist woman and local men serve to transform tradition gender roles across cultural boundaries, creating power relations distinctive from those existing in either native society (1995, 436).

Lisa and Brandy, sitting at the women's expat table, live in the States and spend several months a year in Jamaica. They are both from Chicago, but do not know each other back home. Brandy, nicknamed "White rum" by the men around town, has had
several abusive experiences. “A Jamaican boyfriend can be your wildest dream come true or your worst nightmare,” she says. Lisa adds, “I’ve got to get out of Jamaica before I get another boyfriend.” Not all of these relationships turn out badly. There are several stable “Germaican” couples with children scattered around Treasure Beach and apparently a large concentration of mixed couples in Southern Germany. I hasten to add that women of all Euro-American nationalities and African American women as well are involved in romance tourism and long term relationships.

Lisa and Brandy are not drug tourists, although others are. Ganja is simply part of everyday life for a portion of the population, and they are participating by smoking a spliff, or a large marijuana cigarette. Some tourists come already primed for such an experience. They wear their hair in dreads, are able to recite dub lyrics in patois, and worship at the shrines of Bob Marley in Kingston and Nine Mile on the North Coast. These mostly European men and women travel by minibus and are avid consumers of Rastafarianism, reggae, and ganja. They are consumers of the Jamaican invented tradition of Afrocentricity (Reckford 1982; Hobsbawm 1983; Asante 1987). They are collectively known as German Rastas, although many of them are American neo-hippies. They are guided here, like nearly all alternative post-tourists, by word of mouth. They are often surprised to find that in Treasure Beach they hear as much old American country music and Rhythm and Blues as reggae and dub. Marijuana is readily available, as St. Elizabeth is not only the premier vegetable growing area in Jamaica, but also the largest producer of ganja. A brightly colored sign hangs in
Trans-Love, "Please, no Ganja," but it is honored more in the breach than in practice. These young "Rastaburbians" are consumers of an already heavily commodified version of Jamaican culture, and because they are on a "righteous pilgrimage to Zion," acquire much symbolic capital.

There are drug tourists who are mostly after economic capital. The Gleaner's "From the police blotters" read on July 11, 1984: "Two female Americans were arrested at Sanger Airport. The two were searched prior to the flight and a total of nine pounds of ganja was found in their possession. Marijuana is illegal in Jamaica in spite of its widespread use.

At the end of this ethnographic encounter, I walk over and sit down with Julie and Frank. Since he was a former director of the Jamaican Tourist Board, I told him I had heard that Butch Stewart's project to build a SuperClub resort about twenty five miles away had been halted for environmental reasons (France and Wheeler 1995). He replied knowingly, "Butch was just a little short on cash, he'll get what he wants in the end." In the final analysis, Frank was exactly right.
CHAPTER FIVE
COMMODIFICATION AND CHANGE

I was waiting for my flight out of Miami Airport for my last period of fieldwork in Jamaica from December 1996 to February 1997. I wandered over to the newspaper stand to find something to read. My eyes lit on Travel and Leisure Magazine December, 1996. “Jamaica’s Undiscovered Shore: This Side of Paradise” (Alleman 1996). The table of contents explained, “A quirky little hotel called Jake’s wakes up the sleepy southwestern coast of Jamaica” (1996, 3).

Images for the Affluent

Travel and Leisure targets up-market post-tourists who think of themselves as travelers.

The term “traveler” assumes that it is no longer a process of tourism with which the individual is engaged, but a considerably more de-differentiated, esoteric and individualized form of activity; travel is to tourism, as individual is to class (Mowforth and Munt 1994, 141).

They are high-income sophisticated tourists in search of designer experiences. The readers are alternative post-tourists but are too up-scale for the informal sector. They exemplify Bourdieu’s (1984) new bourgeoisie and their choice of relatively “untouristed” destinations reinforces their position in society. Their search for cultural capital leads them to seek new places to stay ahead of mainstream tourists. Travel and Leisure contains features on other categories of cultural goods including food, fitness, health and art, as well as travel destinations.
A special report in the December *Travel and Leisure*, "Where to Go Next" (Wise 1996) caters to this search for difference. The report offers ten destinations to "pike curiosity among experienced travelers" including: the Kimberly in northern Australia, "the country's last frontier"; Lombok in Indonesia, "Bali thirty years ago"; Spitsbergen, "there's wild, and then there's wild"; and Slovenia, "the next Prague" (1996, 106-112). Among the feature articles is a piece by George Plimpton on sailing in the Seychelles, and a guide to Buenos Aires called "Tango Argentino."

The author, Richard Alleman, had previously stayed on the "fashionable" North Coast, "favored by socialites, media moguls and movie stars." He returned to Jamaica looking for "something new" (Alleman 1996, 164). The glossy photos and text invoke the same place images as the guide books I cited in Chapter Three.

The first thing that strikes you about the southwestern coast is how different it is from the rest of Jamaica... You also find an exceedingly friendly population of farmers and fishermen. There's no hassle, no hustle here to buy drugs — or anything else for that matter (1996, 164).

Alleman (1996, 164) incorrectly notes that "for years the only places to stay were a handful of no-frills guesthouses and a couple of campgrounds, but now there's Jake's." There were villas before and the Treasure Beach hotel, but they are not distinctive enough for the readers of *Travel and Leisure*. Jake's on the other hand, "explodes with color: blood reds, Matisse blues, and funky purples... [The rooms] deliver as much style per dollar as any resort in the Caribbean" (1996, 164). Alleman's description emphasizes the eclectic *style* of the seven cottages Sally Henzell designed and built since my last trip to Treasure Beach. She combined local vernacular with
Moorish domes and hints of Antonio Gaudí in her use of broken mosaic tiles and
glass. The overall effect is a stylish postmodern pastiche; highly appropriate for
Travel and Leisure's readership.

Alleman also introduces the reader to the local people and culture. “Moonlight
poetry readings [and] performances by local mento (folk) bands” are held on the patio
(1996, 167). Sally’s son Jason now manages Jake’s, and has revived mento music
with Martin as the star performer. Alleman promises that “you will undoubtedly
befriend ‘Duggie’ Douglas Turner, who mixes a wicked rum punch” and extols the
local cuisine served at Jake’s — pepper pot and cream of pumpkin soup, conch
chowder and fresh fish (1996, 167). “Rather than boarding one of those excursion
boats filled with tour groups,” Jason will arrange for local fishermen, Wally and Peck,
to take you up the Black River Morass (1996, 168). Alleman also endorses the
ambiance at Trans-Love — “straight out of the 1960s.”

Sooner or later, everybody winds up at Trans-Love — the guests at
Jake’s, the backpackers, the rasta men with their gringa girlfriends, and
a colorful assortment of old codgers, all with stories to tell (1996, 168).

Trans-Love was still the center for interaction in Treasure Beach but Jake’s
had, indeed, become the engine waking up the “sleepy southwest coast” (1996, 3).
Alleman mentions Jake’s new association with Chris Blackwell whom I introduced as
a pioneer in the promotion of reggae music in Chapter Two. Like many members of
the Jamaican elite since the 1930s, Blackwell became involved in tourism and was
promoting Jake’s along with his own group of small but trendy hotels. He and the
Henzells moved in the same circles in Jamaica, London and New York. Alleman (1996, 164) writes: “There had to be something special about [Jake’s] because visionary hotelier Chris Blackwell had been so impressed that he decided to adopt it as one of his offbeat Island Outpost resorts.”

Previously, images of Treasure Beach appeared in guides directed toward low-budget alternative post-tourists (Geh 1985; Zach 1991; Cameron and Box 1994). As we have seen in Chapter Four, affluent “travelers” were present in small numbers from the beginning of tourism in Treasure Beach. Travel and Leisure gave Treasure Beach, through Jake’s, its first international exposure in a high profile, tourism magazine. Now, with the assistance of Blackwell and the Henzell’s own connections, these up-market alternative post-tourists became the primary targets of the tourism production system’s efforts to sell Treasure Beach.

Cyber-Images

Just before I left home, I searched the World Wide Web for Treasure Beach on November 23, 1996 and found seven hits. Most of them, including the Jamaica Tourist Board web site, mentioned Treasure Beach only in passing, but I was surprised to find any references to Treasure Beach at all, given that telephone service had only been installed in 1991. Two web sites emanated directly from Treasure Beach, a well-designed site linked to Island Outposts and packed with color images devoted to Jake’s, and a less elaborate but more informative site called Treasure Tours by Rebecca Wiersma.
Rebecca Wiersma and Julie of Trans-Love picked me up from the airport in Rebecca’s new, used Toyota van. After greeting them, I asked, “What’s new?” They replied cryptically, “New Yorkers and Lonely Planet.”

Like many of the expatriates living in Treasure Beach, Rebecca and her ex-husband migrated there from Negril in 1992. They started an illegal taxi service using an old Russian-made Lada with “Shaka Zulu” emblazoned across the rear window. She ferried alternative postourists around who wanted to see something of the countryside and picked up people at the airport who just wanted to get to Treasure Beach without “experiencing” Jamaica’s seriously deteriorating transport system.

Now, Rebecca was busy participating in the commodification of Treasure Beach. She set up a Jamaica Tourist Board approved tour company called Treasure Tours, designed her own web site, and was picking up guests at the airport for Jake’s.

Rebecca offered eight chauffeured tours including the “Non-Tourist Tour” and represented several rental cottages and villas. I have combined part of the “Non-Tourist Tour” synopsis with a description of the Blue Marlin Villa at Great Bay to show how she focuses the romantic tourist gaze on solitude, the landscape and the two traditional vocations, fishing and farming.

See a part of Jamaica that most tourists never see. Drive over two mountain ranges through the heart of St. Elizabeth’s farmland. Stop at the 1,750 ft. cliff of Lover’s Leap and get a bird’s eye view of the sea below. Then on to the secluded and quiet paradise of Guts River. Dive off the rocks into the cool crystal clear water. Snorkel among beautiful fish and underwater vegetation. Take a walk along a deserted beach. . . . The exception to this being when the fishing boats come in [at Great Bay]. Then the beach fills with local residents checking out the catch.
of the day. We encourage you to take part in this event and witness how much has remained unchanged at Great Bay during the past generation, as most residents earn their living from the sea just as their ancestors have for over 200 years. Witness how much has remained unchanged (Wiersma 1995, 2-3).

In the past, images of paradise extolled natural features in the landscape, as Wiersma has in this passage, but she places the reader in the landscape as an active participant and in both the natural and human environment. She invites you to dive into the cool, clear water. You get a bird’s eye view of the sea below from Lover’s Leap. She urges you to take part in checking out the catch and witness how little has changed at Great Bay (figure 5.1). Of course, much has changed at Great Bay over the last 200 years, but Rebecca invites you to imagine that it has remained the same.

Ironically, her web page was part of an accelerated process of change and commodification taking place in the area during and after my last visit. Unlike most subsequent images of Treasure Beach, Rebecca did not market exclusively to affluent alternative post-tourists. She had come there as an low-budget tourist and included Golden Sands Guest House in her web page at US$15 to US$25 per night.

Rebecca used her web site solely as a marketing tool, taking reservations and inquiries by phone, fax or mail. She left Jamaica for personal reasons in 1997 before she was able come online and turn her web site into a reservation system through E-mail. The ability to generate images, take reservations and answer inquiries through the Internet, combined with extensive links to other sites has the potential to make small entrepreneurs in tourism more competitive with larger concerns (Hanna and
Figure 5.1. Inspecting the catch of the day.
Millar 1997; Garcia 1997). It is certain that Internet use is growing rapidly and as of August 1999, Yahoo listed forty web sites with information on Treasure Beach.

Changes on the Ground

We pulled out of the airport on to Gloucester Avenue in Montego Bay and I immediately noticed the relative scarcity of vendors since I had last been there. Julie and Rebecca confirmed that the Ministry of Tourism had set up Resort Patrols to protect tourists from harassment. Rebecca pointed out two men in uniform with night sticks and black berets and said, “Things have gotten better here for the tourists since they started this, but the trouble is, when does the hard sell stop and the harassment begin.” Later at Trans-Love I talked to a vendor selling woven baskets who had been moved out of Negril by the Resort Patrol. “Early last year we had a demonstration against the ‘red caps’ [as they are called in Negril] after they mash up a pregnant woman with their batons just to make her move her likkle stall from the side of the road.” This particular vendor, Rasta John, was welcome at Trans-Love and in Treasure Beach in general (figure 5.2). Others who had been filtering into the area during the anti-harassment campaign were not welcomed. Bigga, a regular at the bakery complained, “most of them they not vendors they just hustlin’.” After a 1997 survey reported that 56% of tourists complained about harassment, the government increased fines for “aggressive selling” from US$80 to over US$500 — about half the average per capita income (Clark 1998, 2D).
Figure 5.2. New vendor in Treasure Beach.
As we turned off the coastal highway onto the road that winds across the island through Ferris Cross, Whitehouse and eventually to Treasure Beach, I was stunned to spot a new green highway sign guiding us to our destination and points in between. Road signs are a rarity in Jamaica, so I squinted to read the small print at the bottom, S.C.R.B. The South Coast Resort Board had erected the signs which continued to appear at every major crossroads. We passed through Whitehouse and Julie pointed out the wetland area where Butch Stewart finally received permission to build a new Sandals resort, the first large-scale development on the South Coast. The Ministry of Tourism and Environment put a temporary hold on the project in 1992 because of turtle nesting grounds on the beach and the wetland habitat just behind (France and Wheeler 1995, 63).

The debate over sustainable tourism — “rhetoric or reality?” (Cater 1995, 5) — comes together here on one of the few white sand beaches on the South Coast, thirty miles west of Treasure Beach. Critics of sustainable tourism in the Caribbean accuse both the tourism industry and government agencies of manipulating the terms ecotourism and sustainability “to sell the product” (France and Wheeler 1995, 66). Auliana Poon (1993, quoted in Baptiste 11A) sees the “environment as an industry, as a possibility of generating income and employment,” and endorses all-inclusives as environmentally friendly (Poon 1993). Butch Stewart assured his detractors, most of whom were academicians and residents of the South Coast, that he would “minimize the resort’s environmental impact” and set aside part of the beach for nesting turtles
Butch got what he wanted. His 258 room resort called Beaches will open in 2001.

Considering the Minister of Tourism and Environment's statement in 1993, critics of sustainable tourism have a right to be skeptical of government planning efforts and rhetoric. "We are examining opening up the South Coast of the country to tourism. It is a different type of product. We are looking at small-scale, ecologically sensitive development in the area" (Wheeller and France 1995, 67). Nearly all resort cycle theorists claim that ultimate decline can only be avoided by long range planning and proper management (Butler 1991; Cooper 1997; Pigram and Wahab 1997). Given the nature of the planning process in Jamaica, this route to sustainability is problematic.

The various, agencies, boards, ministries, NGOs and parish councils constitute an ever-shifting galaxy of authority over land use, development and the environment. Lalor (1980, 203) described Negril in the 1970s as “one of the most ‘planned’ areas in Jamaica. Yet most of the plans, Development Orders, case studies and reports have had little effect on the subsequent development of this area.” In 1992 the overall responsibility for tourism rested with the Ministry of Tourism and Environment (Wheeller and France 1995, 67). In 1994 it became the Ministry of Industry, Tourism and Commerce (The Gleaner, 1994, 6). By 1999 it was simply the Ministry of Tourism under the Minister of Tourism who is also the Prime Minister, P.J. Patterson. The planning and decision-making process in Jamaica seems chaotic, but it adheres to
a certain logic within the power structure itself. Familial ties, bonds of friendship, local power interests and trade-offs within the elite play their part in the planning process (Smith 1988). The Issas, Pringles, Blackwells, Henzells, Stewarts and the rest of the Jamaican elite know each other and are often related. Another factor the elite must never lose sight of is the possibility of popular unrest and protest. The tradition of resistance is strong despite, or perhaps because of, the skewed political economy of the country (Stone 1980).

**Treasure Beach Revisited**

The summer of 1995 had been dry, dry, dry — Jamaicans use repetition for emphasis. It is now late December 1996 and several Northerns had already passed over this winter, shedding rain even on this part of the island. Tall green grass waved in the pastures as we descended the slope down to Pedro Plains. We came to the intersection by the police station and another new green sign welcomed me to Treasure Beach. A new Suzuki four-wheel drive vehicle sat by the police station. Now the police would not have to depend on other people for rides. There were new houses scattered here and there along the road and more under construction. Julie said they were built mostly by returnees. We neared the corner at Calabash Bay and on the right stood a new shopping plaza with a bar, a Chinese-Jamaican restaurant, a small grocery store and a Workers Bank.

On my previous stays in Treasure Beach money changing was accomplished in the informal sector. I walked down a dusty red lane off the main road to Miss Doris’s
house and shouted her name from the gate. She came out to the gate and I asked if she could exchange $100 U.S. She always replied, “Yeah man, come round the back.” I followed her to the back door and she invited me into the kitchen of her tiny house and disappeared into the bedroom. She was never short of Jamaican dollars and I am sure she always had a large number of American notes on hand as well. Yet, her house was not protected by “burglar bars” as are most houses and businesses in Jamaica. As far as I knew, she was never “tiefed” (robbed). This part of the informal sector was gone.

We turned onto the main stretch of road between Calabash Bay and Frenchman’s Bay. Several houses that had been under a slow state of construction during my last visit were now finished, their fresh coats of white stucco gleaming in the sun. A new restaurant called “Lisa’s” had opened a few chains (one chain equals 22 yards) down the road from the Treasure Beach Church of God. Lisa is German and her husband Ray is from Great Bay. They attract Jamaicans and foreigners in roughly equal proportion and offer a pleasant alternative to both the more boisterous Fisherman’s Bar and the now decidedly up-market Jake’s. I caught sight of their two children playing with the neighbor kids in the side yard reminding me of the lasting effects of interaction between tourists and locals.

It was getting late in the afternoon and things would be winding down at Trans-Love, so we decided to stop at Jake’s — now officially Jake’s Village — for drinks. Jake’s faces west toward the setting sun and the afternoon light is stunning on the patio by the bar. Jason Henzell, Sally and Perry’s son, greeted us and Duggie fixed our
drinks. We could just glimpse Sally's "eclectic" collection of cottages to our left, set apart from the bar and restaurant. A slim blond sheathed in a mauve dress surrounded by photographers was posing against a domed stucco cottage turned bright orange in the late afternoon light. Jason explained that they were doing a photo shoot for Vogue magazine. I congratulated him on the article in Travel and Leisure. He replied:

Yeah man, thanks. We been gettin' plenty of exposure since that article last year in New York Magazine and since we hook up with Chris [Blackwell]. Two months ago he send Joan Osborne down here. You know she sing "What if God Was One of Us"? Well, she swimmin' here off the beach and get carried out by the undertow and nobody see her. She keep her head and swim out of it but mash up her face on the rocks when she come in. She have to cancel an MTV shoot. Lucky she's a good sport.

After I returned to the states, I would hear of other luminaries connected with either Chris Blackwell or the Henzells staying at Jake's or nearby villas: Luciano Pavarotti, Jimmy Buffet, Marianne Faithful and Adam Clayton.

As the patio began to fill for sun's finale, I heard the distinct intonations of New York accents mixed with British Received Standard from the casually well-dressed crowd admiring the sunset. Another term in the literature for Bourdieu's new bourgeoisie, or my affluent alternative tourist is "the cream of Manhattan and the City," meaning the global centers of finance and fashion: New York and London (Wood 1991, 65).

The Lonely Planet

On Sunday January 26, 1997 I sat having coffee in the coolness of Trans-Love Bakery and talking with Preston, a local man. He complained about the new rooms
the Treasure Beach Hotel added. "They build new building but it not fit in with the old part. If they build sun'ting new, it should fit in with the old."

An American couple from Santa Barbara came in with the travel section of the Los Angeles Times dated January 19, 1997. The entire spread was on Treasure Beach. The L.A. Times travel section is one of the most respected in the country (personal communication Millie Ball, travel editor New Orleans Times Picayune). People gathered around to read and discuss the article entitled Jamaica's Quiet Side by Christopher Baker. The color photos were mostly of Jake's with Duggie pictured holding a large fish. Baker got some of the details wrong but this was the first full spread in a major American newspaper. Everyone in the business community remembers Baker's trip through Treasure Beach because he also wrote the Lonely Planet Guide to Jamaica (1996) and this article was a spin-off from the book. That winter season was the busiest yet for Treasure Beach. My data indicate that at least thirty percent of the tourists I interviewed were guided to Treasure Beach by the Lonely Planet that season.

I have already quoted the Lonely Planet Guide to Jamaica several times in this dissertation. The author, Christopher Baker, earned a B.A. in geography and an M.A. in Latin American Studies. Like the Insight guides I cited in Chapter Three, the Lonely Planet series has its countercultural origins in the overland England/Australia route of the early 1970s. They claim to be "one of the largest travel publishers in the world" (1996, end page). The guides have been praised and condemned by critics.
The success of the Lonely Planet Guides testifies the hunger of young people for a deep exploration of the countries they visit and that includes a growing curiosity about social and living conditions (Seabrook 1995, 22)

Visiting the Lonely Planet site is very similar to browsing their publications in a bookshop. Relatively impersonal accounts of local culture, history and travel information spiced up with lots of up-to-date personal tips and anecdotes (Grant 1996, 16)

I have no doubt, however, about Lonely Planet’s influence on alternative post-tourism.

Treasure Beach is listed in Baker’s guide as among the ten best experiences in Jamaica.

Oozing with laid-back, off-the-beaten-track ambiance, this loosely knit south coast community is a haven of Jamaican graciousness and calm. The beaches win no prizes, but who cares! Jake’s is the place to stay (Baker 1996, 77).

I used a different excerpt in Chapter One where he describes the physical geography of the area and refers to the orographic effect of the Santa Cruz Mountains. Baker’s geographical training may also be evident in his comparison of the landscape to East Africa. He elaborates on the landscape and provides an excellent example of the romantic gaze: “the rocky headlands separate romantically lonesome, dark coral-colored sand beaches”(1996, 441). Unlike many of his predecessors, he is forthright about the beach and its dangers: “beware of the vicious undertow” (1996, 442). Baker gives the most complete description of accommodations, restaurants and shops to date. He directs our gaze toward “the sense of remoteness, easy pace, and unsullied graciousness of the local people.... the donkey women [who] ride down the hills to sell their freshly picked fruit and vegetables, while fishermen prepare to sail out to
Pedro Keys" (1996, 441). Most importantly, he remarks on the "untouristed" and unsullied" nature of the place and warns:

The area's reclusiveness is about to change. Word is getting out that this area offers something special. Developers are buying up land, and it can only be a matter of a few years before the first resorts appear (1996, 442).

Baker's images of Treasure Beach are those of a "gracious" human paradise about to be despoiled by development. He later repeated his warning in the Los Angeles Times article (Baker 1997). After I had finished my fieldwork, USA Today published an article with exactly the same lead as Baker's "Jamaica's Quiet Side" with the following qualifier: "Expanding tourism threatens the south's tranquility" (Clarke 1998, 1D). Clarke moves the threat of over-development in Treasure Beach to the international plane.

We have seen how tourism in Treasure Beach evolved into alternative post-tourism and how its nature is changing rapidly. The formal tourism production system now commodifies Treasure Beach through images of landscape and culture on a global scale. Baker and Clarke question whether the resources that attract tourists to the area — the "ambiance" or sense of place — can be sustained in the face of further development. I described Richard Butler's view of sustainability and his resort cycle model in Chapter Two. Leaving the deterministic aspect of Butler's model aside, it serves as a framework for a review of the genealogy of images and Jamaican tourism I detailed in Chapter Three. Butler (1980) asserts that his model can be applied on a national scale as well as at the local scale. Tourism in Jamaica has gone through all
the stages of the resort cycle: exploration, involvement, development, consolidation, decline and rejuvenation.

In Jamaica the exploration stage seemed to begin in the mid-nineteenth century with Anthony Trollope and Robert Baird. There were virtually no facilities on the island for tourists at the time and Trollope’s lively descriptions of the people and his musings on race and society testify to his interaction with the local population (1985, 57). Baird travels to Jamaica “solely on account, or in pursuit of health” (1850, 2). He was an explorer in the sense that he published his “notes” as a guide for others who sought a healthy climate (1850, 14). Baird’s images aestheticized and dehumanized the landscape like many of those produced after him.

The involvement stage was a long process and overlapped with the first stage in Stark’s 1898 account. The Jamaican colonial government realized the potential of tourism and passed the Jamaican Hotels Law of 1890 (Taylor 1993, 75). Stark (1898, 129) documents the involvement of local residents in Montego Bay where there were “several good lodging and boarding houses.” More hotels were opened by the Jamaican elite from the 1920s through the 1940s, and Montego Bay became a small-scale, exclusive resort for the wealthy.

Jamaican tourism entered the development stage in the 1950s as air traffic increased and large-scale resorts, often foreign-owned, were built on the North Coast. The tourist enclaves arose in Montego Bay and Ocho Ríos and Jamaicans were often excluded from beaches and tourist facilities. Images of Jamaica also excluded or
denigrated Jamaicans as the tourism evolved into a mass-packaged industry in the late 1960s and early 1970s. The development of mass-tourism marks the consolidation stage. Jamaica still retains the image as a destination for the wealthy, but the reality is changing quickly as international resort chains took over from local interests (Harmon and Harmon 1968).

The mid-1970s saw the stagnation and sharp decline of tourism in Jamaica. The global recession reduced the numbers of tourists and Montego Bay lost its cache as an up-scale resort. Many of the chain franchises went bankrupt and hotels stood empty. Rejuvenation was made possible not by adopting new attractions, but because of a shift in consumption habits in the West from mass-produced vacations to destinations that reinforced the tastes and lifestyle of the individual consumer. In the search for new products, the tourism production system now markets cultural difference as a touristic experience. Jamaica is able to successfully market its culture as a commodity because of its distinct national identity. Ironically, these distinctive images of “Jamaicaness” stem from lower class resistance to Eurocentric ideals. Rastafarians, reggae, and the supposedly “laid-back” lifestyle of the lower classes in Jamaica now appeal white, middle class, and upper-middle class foreign tourists.

My objective is not to offer a prediction on the future of Treasure Beach in the context of Butler’s resort cycle. However, its implications for tourism and the way of life in Treasure Beach cannot be ignored. In this chapter I have documented the rapid expansion of the commodification of landscape and culture in Treasure Beach. This
marketing effort involves members of a local elite with national and global influence. Butler maintains that careful planning and management is one way to achieve sustainability (1991; 1992). A second solution is to adopt a new, usually artificial attraction (1980). He considers both solutions unlikely. "The fact is that it is very difficult to have a 'little tourism'. It is like being a little bit pregnant; it has a habit of growing and changing" (1991, 206).

I do not dispute the fact that tourism is a dynamic and changing process. I suggest that within the context of these changes lays the possibility of retaining a unique sense of place in Treasure Beach. I referred to Butch Stewart's ability to circumvent the planning process because of the interplay of personalities and interests in the local and national power structure. There are players in the local power structure in Treasure Beach whose interests lay in preventing over-development. Stewart's new resort at Whitehouse is thirty miles away from their local sphere of influence and is not a direct threat to their interests. Perry and Sally Henzell, their partner Chris Blackwell, Frank Pringle who sits in the Jamaican senate, and Desmond Henry the local organizer of Community Tourism, have created an image of Treasure Beach as a certain kind of place. The tourism production system has disseminated this image on a global scale. It is in their interests to use their influence at the national and international levels to protect the landscape and culture of Treasure Beach from being overwhelmed by inappropriate development and mitigate the changes that will come.
Places are constantly in a process of becoming and the people who live there are active agents in the interplay of local and extra-local power structures (Pred 1984). Ordinary people in Treasure Beach who created the landscape and way of life which are now the objects of the tourist gaze have the power to influence events. I believe that in the spirit of Jamaican resistance, they will use it.

In the end, of course it’s the people. Preston, my mango eating buddy has more of an understanding of humans than I’ll ever have. Miss Ruby’s beautiful smile as she shares her plants with me is so touching. When my friends Inez and Jennifer who ride their donkeys miles to Treasure Beach to sell vegetables, reach deep in their baskets for a present of a papaya or otahite apple for me, I love it. There’s a goodness within the people, a true generosity of spirit in spite of having lived hard lives. What lies ahead for Treasure Beach is anybody’s guess. Development is a double-edged sword. My first partner used to say, “Everyone should just stay home.” I’m sure the Africans felt that way (personal communication Julie Koliopulos, 1999).
REFERENCES


182


183


Clarke, J. 1998. “Jamaica’s quiet side: expanding tourism threatens the south’s tranquility.” USA Today. 13 November: 2D.


Cooper, C. 1993. Noises in the blood: Orality, gender and the "vulgar" body of 

Cooper, C.P. and A. Lockwood, eds. 1994. Progress in Tourism, Recreation and 

Cosgrove, D. 1984. Social formation and symbolic landscape. Totowa, New Jersey: 
Barnes and Noble.

Crick, M. 1985. "Tracing' the anthropological self: quizzical reflections on 

Crick, M. 1989. "Representations of international tourism in the social sciences: sun, 

Davenport, C.B. and Steggerda M. 1929. Race crossing in Jamaica. Washington, 


de Kadt, E. 1976. Tourism: Passport to development? London: 
Oxford University Press.


Dear, M. 1985. "Postmodernism and planning." Environmental Planning D: Society 
and Space. 4: 367-84.


Duncan, J. and N. Duncan. 1988. "(Re)reading the landscape." Environmental 
Planning D: Society and Space. 6(2): 115-240.

Duncan, J.S. 1985. "Individual action and political power: A structuration 


Grant, M. 1996. “influencing the ‘other’.” In Focus. 19:16.


187


Sealy, T. March 5, 1959. “St. Elizabeth coming into a fully destiny.” Jamaican Gleaner.


Wiersma, R. 1995. “Treasure tours on Jamaica’s South Coast.” Website: www.ultranet.com/~usrbw/t

**West Indian and Caribbean Yearbook 1953-54.** London: Thomas Skinner.


VITA

Michael Hawkins was born on October 8, 1951, in Washington, D.C. He grew up in Prince George's County, Maryland on the interface between suburban Washington and Tidewater Maryland. After attending the University of Maryland at College Park, Michael settled in Western Maryland and taught in the Washington County public schools. The persistent cultural contrasts and continuities between Tidewater, urban America and the Blue Ridge, combined with a lust for travel, led him to embark on a new career in geography. His masters work with Ary Lamme III at the University of Florida concerned landscape interpretation close to home, in Waterford, Virginia. He ventured farther afield to Jamaica for his doctoral research in tourism and cultural geography with Miles Richardson. His other interests include representations of the plantation South, traditional dance and music of North America, the British Isles, Louisiana and the African diaspora. He is currently a doctoral candidate at Louisiana State University.
Candidate: Michael Hawkins
Major Field: Geography
Title of Dissertation: Tourism and Place in Treasure Beach, Jamaica: Imagining Paradise and the Alternative

Approved:

[Signatures]

EXAMINING COMMITTEE:

[Signatures]

Date of Examination: July 16, 1999