2007

In Their Own Image: the Public Library Collection as a Reflection of its Donors

Suzanne Marie Stauffer
Louisiana State University at Baton Rouge, stauffer@lsu.edu

In Their Own Image: The Public Library Collection as a Reflection of Its Donors

Suzanne M. Stauffer

Early library boards espoused the positive effects of socially beneficial and culturally substantive knowledge. The Ogden (Utah) Carnegie Free Library board was no exception. However, when the library opened in 1903, it included a large number of donated materials that reflected a library mission beyond education and self-improvement. Ogden's community and social leaders, many of whom were library board members, donated a wide range of material, creating a public library that responded to and reflected the community's needs and interests, not merely those expressed in public statements and official documents. This information yields insights into the donors' views of the broad role of the public library in the community as well as their desire to establish an individual, ethnic, religious, and political presence in the communal institution of the library.

Until recently, research into the history of the American public library has focused on the institution itself, relying on statistical data and public records to document its institutional history rather than exploring the social and cultural context in which the library was established, the community that created it and why it did so, and the characteristics of those who used it and the use that they made of it. For at least a decade now, leading library historians have been calling for studies of the sociocultural context of the American public library and of the interaction between the public library and its users, that is, of the "library in the life of the user."[1] One area of interest is the role of the library as a public place through which users interact and create a community (or communities) through the shared cultural experience of reading the same books, magazines, and newspapers.

Unfortunately, there is a dearth of records that would allow us to examine exactly who was reading what and when in most communities, as those who pursue public library history know only too well. For various reasons, from the protection of privacy to lack of storage space to ignorance of their historical importance, most libraries have routinely

Libraries & the Cultural Record, Vol. 42, No. 4, 2007

discarded patron, circulation, and acquisition records. The historical records that are available frequently report nothing more than the number of new library cards, number of circulations, and number of acquisitions in a given year. Too often, all that is known about the value of the community in the library and of the library in the life of the user is derived from the public pronouncements of national and local library leaders and library supporters.

In 1893 the leaders of the American Library Association adopted the motto "The best reading for the largest number at the least expense."[2] They argued over whether novels and other forms of popular fiction had a place in the public library. Most agreed that "if a novel is a good book, and accomplishes any good purposes, it is entitled to its place in a . . . public library. If in any sense it is a bad or even useless book, it should be rejected."[3] The association's "Model Library" included only 15 percent fiction.[4]

Many librarians and library boards of the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, in their public statements and official documents, espoused the positive effects of socially beneficial and culturally substantive knowledge. They promoted the belief that reading "good books" would result in individual self-improvement and lead inevitably to an informed, orderly, moral society.[5] At the same time, they warned against the dangers of reading novels (i.e., popular fiction, particularly romances) and "sensational fiction" (i.e., action/adventures) and opposed their inclusion in public libraries on the grounds that they would "give us incorrect pictures of life" or "false conceptions of life."[6] "Sensational novels . . . are either false to nature, or to morals, or to art, or to all of these, and therefore injurious to those who read them."[7] Readers of the *Library Journal* were advised that "there is no greater evil abroad in the land than the flood of pernicious literature in the hands of boys and girls," and purchasers of dime and yellow novels were characterized as "wallowing in the mire of bookstands" that sold the material.[8]

Writers of such articles were unanimous in their construction of the purpose and role of the tax-supported public library in society. The library was to present "our youth" with material "out of which well-directed after-efforts will build up the mind to those systematically true proportions which fit it for its every-day social relations" and provide trained librarians to guide "the half-formed intellect into such reading as shall tend to make the coming man a good citizen in the community."[9]

In keeping with these beliefs, many western mining and railroad towns established libraries as part of a campaign to create a stable economy and instill a moral social order and cultural values in their

nascent communities.[10] In Ogden, Utah, the site of the completion of the transcontinental railroad, the board of the Ogden Carnegie Free Library was no exception, according to board members' public statements, the discussions recorded in their minutes, and the library materials they approved for purchase.

However, when the library opened on April 20, 1903, much of the collection consisted of donations from women's organizations, churches, and individuals, not materials acquired by the board or the librarian. Members of the community, many of them board members and library supporters, donated additional materials during the first year the library was open, materials that reflected their individual tastes and views of the mission and purpose of the public library in their lives and in the life of their community. The nature of their donated material indicates that they held a broader view of the role of the library—not simply as an educational institution but also as a source of recreational reading, a repository of information of all types, and a reflection of the diverse makeup of the community.

All of the items in the collection, including donations, were recorded in accession books that contain the standard bibliographic information about each work as well as the source of the item and the date and reason for its withdrawal from the collection. Although the source of some of the items was recorded as merely "donated" and for others it was left blank, it was indicated for well over 90 percent of the items, so that the books each group and individual donated, how long those items remained in the collection, and the reason for their withdrawal can be ascertained in the vast majority of the cases. As is common with holographic materials, some of the entries are difficult to read and so had to be eliminated from this study. However, the vast majority of the records are complete and legible. The Dewey Decimal Classification number is recorded in many cases, making it possible to identify a nonfiction work and its subject, but the accession books do not indicate whether items were in the children's or adults' collection, nor do they record the exact number of circulations or to whom.

Also available are the librarians' annual reports for those years, correspondence between the library board and the Carnegie Corporation, newspaper reports of the speeches made during the dedication ceremonies and other library events, and limited biographical information about the donors gleaned from obituaries and other genealogical resources. A critical analysis of this information as a whole yields insights into the donors' attitudes toward the role of the public library in the community, their concept of the type of literature that should be made available to the public as a shared community resource, and their

opinions about which materials were worthy to be enshrined within this "citadel of self-culture."[11]

Also, by considering the date of and reason for withdrawal, it is possible to arrive at some indication of how the donated materials actually were used by the public at large in the library's early years: which books in which categories and age groups received the most use and which seemed to languish unread on the shelves. This essay is restricted to the donated materials in the collection when it opened on April 20, 1903, and those donated during its first operating year (April 20, 1903, through May 31, 1904), since donations of materials declined significantly after that time. Although the community continued to support the library after the first year, money rather than books was donated, allowing the librarian to select the titles according to the established collection development policies.

Ogden in the 1890s and Early 1900s

When the library was dedicated in 1903, Ogden was known as a "wide open city," with prostitution, gambling, and narcotics easily available in the area near the railroad station. The completion of the transcontinental railroad in 1869 had literally brought the outside world to Ogden, founded by Mormon settlers in 1847. The population increased more than tenfold, from 1,464 in 1860 to 14,899 in 1890. This new community was no longer strictly white, of European descent, and Mormon but was ethnically, politically, and religiously diverse. Chinese, Italians, Greeks, African Americans, and Japanese all settled in Ogden to work for the railroad and provide services to railroad employees. In 1889 Liberal Party candidate Fred J. Kiesel was elected the first non-Mormon mayor in Utah by nearly four hundred votes (a 65 percent majority) over the Mormon People's Party candidate. His election was a significant symbol of the changing political and social climate in the city. By 1893 Republican and Democratic parties had been established in the city, and the Populist and Socialist parties were also represented.[12]

The first non-Mormon religious services held in Ogden were probably Episcopalian services held by the Reverend James L. Gillogly in 1870, more than twenty years after the city was founded. The city would become increasingly diverse religiously over the next three decades, so that more than a dozen religious bodies were represented by the time the Carnegie Free Library was dedicated in 1903.[13]

Although several efforts were made to establish a public library in Ogden before 1890, none succeeded until ten women formed the Public

Library Aid Society (also referred to as the Ladies' Public Library Aid Society) and raised nearly $300 at an entertainment held on New Year's Eve 1890 and additional funds at a "kirmess" (carnival) held on two separate occasions in February 1891.[14] The Ogden Public Library Association was formed on January 9, 1891, to provide a free library and reading room "where students would find books for reference, and pleasure seekers could pass away a few quiet hours."[15]

A reading room of 873 volumes, 483 of which were donated by the Women's Christian Temperance Union, opened on August 1, 1892. The librarian, Grace Emerson, encouraged the community to support the library financially so that it could become "the center of the intellectual life of the town and effect [*sic*] the morals and manners of the entire community."[16] When the city council refused to appropriate funds for the new library, fifteen businessmen pledged to pay one dollar each for four months. These donations, along with membership subscriptions and frequent fund-raising events, enabled the library to survive.[17] At the annual meeting in January 1895 prominent educators encouraged community financial support for the public library in its role as a complement to the public schools and an important factor in civilization throughout the ages. The editor of the *Ogden Standard* urged some measure of tax support for a public library, "an institution so much needed as an adjunct of the splendid system of public schools and such a potent factor in the betterment of the minds and morals of the community."[18]

When Utah achieved statehood in 1896, the new state legislature approved an act permitting cities to levy a property tax in support of a public library on petition of a given number of legal voters and property tax payers.[19] The Ogden city council rejected the petition presented that year but did appropriate $25 per month for the library.[20] Interested individuals and groups in the community continued to support the library, including Fred J. Kiesel ($25 per year), the young ladies of the SOOB Club, the various women's clubs and literary societies, politicians, and businessmen.[21] In 1899 and 1900 the men's Weber and Columbia clubs baseball teams donated the proceeds from an exhibition game to the library.[22]

That the official mission of the library was one of social control, moral reform, and self-improvement, particularly of the young, is evidenced by public statements at the time. The women on the board served for the "satisfaction of giving to our young people good wholesome reading, and having done something toward elevating the moral tone of the city."[23] At the annual meeting in January 1897 the "prevalent taste for pernicious literature" was blamed for "undermining the national character"

more than alcohol, and the "importance of free public libraries in the education of the common people" was emphasized.[24] The board also promoted the library as an institution of adult education, claiming a joint mission with the board of education for "the advancement of the intelligence of the community we serve."[25]

In 1901 Ogden became the first city in Utah to apply for and receive a Carnegie grant for a library building, with $25,000 awarded. The application committee of U.S. Attorney William L. Maginnis; Rev. Elmer I. Goshen, pastor of the First Congregational Church; and Miss Minnie Kiesel, daughter of former mayor and now state senator Fred J. Kiesel, represented the most influential non-Mormon factions of society: the federal government, the Protestant Church, and upper-class Protestant society. In its letter to Carnegie the committee emphasized that Ogden was a prosperous and growing city that, as the terminus of several railroads, should increase in prosperity and cosmopolitanism. They deplored the lack of public cultural institutions and opportunities "by reason of the religious differences which have affected this region for so many years but which are now, we hope, dying out. . . . [T]he people have been thrown upon sectarian as distinguished from public and united efforts for their social and cultural opportunities."[26]

The theme of community divisions being healed through united effort in building a tax-supported free public library is evident throughout their appeal. They assured Carnegie that "there is no doubt sufficient local pride in Ogden that all other differences would be laid aside and that the people unitedly would do all that the law allowed in providing a site and a revenue and *other such conditions could be attached to the gift as would forever prevent any sectarian control of the same.*"[27] It is significant to note that, while they claimed that the divisions and differences were dying out, concern over "sectarian control" (meaning Mormon control) of this public institution remained strong enough to warrant a suggestion to Carnegie that he attach conditions to the grant to prevent it.

The committee further declared that a Carnegie library building would provide "evidence of our love of culture and refinement which, with the churches and schools, shall form a triangle of highest intelligence, a building that shall keep pace with our growing city, and be an institution in every way worthy of the second city in Utah."[28] The letter also mentioned that a large number of inhabitants were railroad men, implying that there was a relatively large, unstable element in the city. Thus, the library was portrayed as a symbol of civic pride and united accomplishment, was characterized as an institution of social reform and

social control, and was presented as a means to provide for individual self-improvement and self-education.

When the library was dedicated on April 20, 1903, the first city-appointed board of directors consisted of President Joseph S. Peery, a Mormon sheep rancher; Vice President Mrs. Harriet S. Emerson, a member of the First Congregational Church; Secretary Judge James A. Howell, an Episcopalian; Treasurer Archie P. Bigelow, a Mormon bank president; Father Patrick M. Cushnahan, priest of St. Joseph's Catholic Church; Daniel Hamer, a Mormon civil servant; Mrs. Kate Hilliard, journalist and Socialist; Minnie Kiesel; and Heber H. Thomas, a Mormon photographer.[29] The diversity of the religious and political affiliations of the board members indicates that the library was intended to be a unifying factor in the community by seeking to respond to the needs of all of these groups. The homogeneity of the board—white, European, middle and upper socioeconomic class—suggests that the desired mission of the library would be one of education and Progressive social and cultural reform.[30] The words of the board members and others who spoke at the dedication support this idea.

The majority of speakers called for donations to a book fund to "fill these shelves with great and good literature," and many influential religious leaders, politicians, and businessmen responded, raising a total of $2,000 for the book fund.[32] Whatever the motives of the individuals making the challenges, donating to the library was one means for competing with rivals in the community, whether religious, political, commercial, or social.

The Donations and the Donors

Librarian Grace Emerson had resigned in December 1902 due to her engagement to be married, so the board instituted a national search for her replacement and eventually selected Zoe E. Faddis of Chicago, "a young woman thoroughly trained in all the modern methods of conducting a free public library, a lady of high ideals and one who realizes that our books will be of little value to us unless presided over by a thoroughly equipped librarian," to begin in April 1903.[33] According to her annual report for 1903, one of her first activities was to weed the collection inherited from the pre-Carnegie library.[34] While she does not indicate her rubric for weeding or the exact number of items withdrawn, stating simply that "many of the books which had been in the old library were worn out, lost, or withdrawn," her actions demonstrate that she was not reluctant to discard material she felt no longer belonged in the library.

In the same report she recommended that the board arrange for the money raised by public schools to purchase books to go directly to the library so that she could determine what to purchase. This suggests that she would have been equally selective about which donated items she added in the future.

The annual report states that the collection after weeding and adding new purchased and donated items consisted of 3,192 volumes "at the beginning of the fiscal year." By May 31, 1904, the end of the fiscal year, the collection had grown to 4,209 volumes, with 1,062 added that year, of which 628 (or 60 percent) were donated. Forty-five were withdrawn, lost, or declared missing.[35] At this point, donated materials in the collection totaled approximately twelve hundred volumes and ten periodical titles.[36] This number includes items donated prior to April 1903 as well as those donated during the 1903–4 fiscal year. According to the accession books Faddis created, more than 600 of these volumes had been donated by social, religious, and governmental organizations, and about 524 were donated by individuals whose names are given. (All numbers are approximate due to the occasional difficulty of reading the entry or to lack of information.)

Organizational Donations

An analysis of the approximately twelve hundred titles listed in the accession books as donated as of May 31, 1904, reveals that about six hundred were given by organizations. The vast majority of the books that the WCTU donated were adult literature and religious and inspirational materials aimed at self-improvement, in keeping with its mission of social and self-improvement and reform. Other organizational donors included the Mormon Church, which presented the library with seventy-five volumes of church history, biography, and doctrine; the Knights of Columbus, who donated a Catholic encyclopedia; the Church of Christ Scientist, which gave three volumes of Mary Baker Eddy's works; and the Congregational Sunday school, which donated a set of the "American Reformers" biographies. The SOOB Club donated forty-two books on art, music, history of the book, and literature, worth $176, at the library opening and another thirty-seven similar titles later, for a total of seventy-nine that year.[37] The U.S. government, the single largest donor, contributed 233 publications in 1904, primarily U.S. Geological Survey and Department of Agriculture reports. Another thirty to forty federal and state documents were donated by various elected officials.

TABLE 1
BOOKS DONATED BY INDIVIDUALS TO OGDEN LIBRARY AS OF MAY 31, 1904 BY AGE GROUP AND TYPE*

	Total	Fiction	Non-Fiction
Total	524	178	346
Adult	380	174	206
YA/Children	169	21	148

*Numbers total more than 524 because some works were suitable for more than one group.

Donating works to the library may have served as an attempt to gain public validation for many of these religious organizations. In a community dominated by a single religion, rival denominations may have donated works as much to establish their presence in the community as to provide information about their beliefs, in much the same way that the board included representatives of various denominations and that religious leaders had pledged to the library during the dedication ceremonies. While it is unlikely that the Knights of Columbus expected the volumes of the Catholic encyclopedia to circulate to non-Catholic homes in the community, if their only goal had been to provide a reference resource for the Catholic community, they could have simply donated a copy to the Sacred Heart Academy. By placing a copy of the work in a tax-supported public institution, they gained recognition for the Catholic Church as a legitimate community organization within the Mormon-majority city and state.

Individual Donations

Of more interest to this study are the roughly 524 volumes donated by individuals before and during the 1903–4 fiscal year. As far as can be determined from what is known of the authors and titles represented, approximately 380 of these were adult materials. Approximately 38 percent (143) of these were popular fiction and historical romances, and about 8 percent (31) were works of literature (i.e., Greek plays, Shakespeare, poetry, etc.), nonfiction, with the remaining consisting of primarily history, biography, religion, applied science, music, and art as well as twenty-eight volumes of ten different periodicals (counted as one title each).

Local authors, among them Nephi Anderson, George Q. Cannon, and E. L. Cox, or their relatives donated copies of their own works, chiefly poetry and biography, in what can be interpreted as an attempt to establish themselves as bona fide literary and historical figures in the community, if only in the donors' minds. Whether these works were retained because of community interest, the desire to please influential individuals, or for some other reason, the fact remains that the authors or their families valued inclusion in the public library with its attendant public recognition.

In some cases, donors appear to have been cleaning out their bookshelves, donating miscellaneous collections of old and outdated textbooks, government documents, professional materials, how-to books, and the like, much as people do today. Although this may suggest that people viewed the library as a sort of "book graveyard," it may also demonstrate the near reverence in which they held the written word, since reading materials were scarce in the years before the transcontinental railroad was completed and continued to be difficult and expensive to obtain so far from the publishing centers of the East and Midwest. Book donations could also reflect their view of the library as the community's repository for information to serve every kind of need, whether practical, theoretical, political, or educational. Meriting inclusion in the library catalog may have served as a validation of the worth of the material as well and, by extension, the worth of the use that they had made of it. Whatever the reason, donors chose to contribute these items to the public library rather than burning them or otherwise disposing of them, indicating that they felt that the books retained some social or cultural value.

Based on the authors and titles, about 169 of all works donated by individuals appear to be suitable for children and young adults. Most were donated by public schoolteachers and administrators. Only about twenty of these were fiction or literature, and three or possibly four of those appear to have been written specifically for children under the age of fourteen. The number of young adult fiction works increases considerably if adult historical fiction, romances, adventure stories, and the like are included, but children's literature is essentially unrepresented in the collection. This analysis is supported by the librarian's request in 1904 for additional funds from Carnegie to purchase children's books.[38]

More than 40 percent of the nonfiction that was donated by individuals was suitable for young adults and children, and nearly 90 percent of the donated children's books were nonfiction, while the few works of fiction were predominantly classical rather than popular literature.

TABLE 2
LIBRARY CARDS ISSUED, APRIL–DECEMBER 1903
OGDEN CARNEGIE LIBRARY

Library Cards	April 1903	Dec. 1903
Total	1226	3357 (+174%)
Adult/Young adult	673	1986 (+195%)
Children	553	1371 (+148%)

In most cases, those who donated fiction for children also donated nonfiction, while many donors of adult books donated only fiction. This suggests that the donors of children's books viewed the library's role in children's lives, or perhaps in the community as a whole, as primarily that of an educational institution and as an adjunct to the public schools. The librarian remarked on "the growing interest which parents take in their children's reading, many of them accompanying their children to the library."[39]

The relative balance between donations of adult fiction and nonfiction suggests that, regardless of the position of the American Library Association and the library board toward popular fiction, the members of the community felt that it was appropriate for the adult collection and took steps to see that it was available. This evidently reflected the desire of others in the community, as demonstrated by the increase in circulation and membership by the end of the 1903–4 fiscal year. Use of the library increased steadily that first year, "in spite of the inability to supply the demand for new books."[40] The number of library cards rose by 250 percent, from 1,226 to 3,357, or 20 percent of the population, and continued to increase each year. By May 31, 1904, cards had been issued to 1,986 adults and 1,371 children (younger than fourteen years old), a 174 percent increase in a year.

These library members borrowed an average of about 12 books each in the 362 days preceding May 31, 1904, that the library was open for circulation, for a total circulation of 39,014 volumes, or an average of 9 circulations per volume in the collection. More than 81 percent of the adult fiction collection had circulated, but only 44 percent of children's books (which were nearly all nonfiction) had gone out, numbers that remained fairly steady over the next several years.[42]

Due to this heavy use, more than half of the novels donated prior to the beginning of the 1904–5 fiscal year had to be withdrawn by 1908

TABLE 3
BOOKS DONATED TO OGDEN LIBRARY
AS OF MAY 31, 1904 AND WITHDRAWN BY 1920 BY GENRE

Genre of donated material	Withdrawn by 1920 due to heavy use
Fiction	75%
Novels	80%
Literary fiction	50%
Non-Fiction	20%
Biography	33%
History	34%
Science	35%
Religion	20%
General	15%

and nearly 80 percent by 1920 because they were "worn out," many after having been rebound at least once. During that same period, 1904–20, nearly 50 percent of the literary works donated prior to 1904 were withdrawn for the same reason, meaning that close to 75 percent of the fiction donated before 1904 was withdrawn due to heavy use in those sixteen years. Another 10 percent of the volumes of fiction were lost during the same time. Of the donated nonfiction about 33 percent of the biographies were withdrawn by 1920, 34 percent of the history, 35 percent of the science, 20 percent of the religious works, and 15 percent of the general nonfiction, for a total of about 20 percent lost or worn out.[43] Clearly, fiction and literature received the heaviest use over time, while biographies, history, and applied science had the heaviest use among the nonfiction.

Examples of Popular Fiction

The works of fiction that circulated so highly included fourteen historical romances by Luise Mühlbach, pseudonym of the nineteenth-century German novelist Klara Müller Mundt, donated by local merchant Herbert Stein. Mundt was also "a prominent advocate of woman suffrage and other radical changes in the status of women[,] . . . an extreme liberalist[,] and actively participated in several reform movements,"

attitudes that would have been reflected in her writings.[44] Mundt's works donated to the library included *Frederick the Great and His Court, The Merchant of Berlin, Marie Antoinette and Her Son,* and *Mohammed Ali and His House.*

Another eleven donated works of fiction were historical romances with titles such as *Don Orsino, Saracinesca,* and *Khaled: A Tale of Arabia,* written by Francis Crawford, an American novelist of the late nineteenth century whose aim "was not to moralize or to paint life in the realistic mode . . . but simply to entertain."[45] Most of these books were withdrawn within about ten years because they were worn out, suggesting that many of Ogden's citizens did, in fact, find them entertaining.

Other popular works and authors included three novels, *Rebel, Adventurers,* and *Galloping Dick,* by H. B. Marriott Watson, an Australian writer of adventure, historical romance, and early science fiction; the complete works of Sir Arthur Conan Doyle; and one or two titles each by a variety of American and English writers of primarily historical fiction such as western American writer of historical romances Gertrude Atherton, southern American writer James Allen, antislavery and pro-Reconstructionist author Albion Tourgee, and English historical novelist and historian Sir Walter Besant.

The works of literature included those by Shakespeare, Milton, Chaucer, Goldsmith, Swift, Plato, and Socrates and also more adventurous works by then-modern authors such as Dickens, Hugo, Eliot, Hardy, Kipling, Stevenson, and Verne.

The predominance of historical fiction, romances, and adventure stories strongly suggests that, in keeping with the publicly declared mission of the library, donors were attempting to attract young adults in particular to the library by supplying the better types of reading materials that were thought to be appealing to that age group. The works also give insight into the literary tastes and preferences of some of Ogden's leading citizens, regardless of their public pronouncement as library board members, and of their view of what constituted "good books."

The Donors

The list of major library donors is almost indistinguishable from the list of major library supporters during the preceding decade. The one hundred individuals listed, less than 1 percent of the population, represent no more than ninety-seven families—Grace and Harriet Emerson, the Kiesels and the Schansenbachs, and A. B. Patton and Mrs. A. B. Patton are known to be related—and possibly fewer than that. Six

of the nine surnames of board members appear among the seventy-nine different surnames that appear on the list of donors, four of these six known to be board members or their families (Emerson, Cushnahan, Hilliard, and Kiesel).

Many of the major donors had been library board members and donors since the 1890s. Most of the women were also members of women's clubs that raised money for the library, and the men belonged to men's clubs that were similarly active. They were educators, politicians, professional men, and society women. Even the names of those who donated only one or two books can be found in the society and business pages and in the lists of public schoolteachers and political candidates. Both in their words and through their actions they demonstrated that they viewed the public library as an institution essential to the life of the community. As the wealthier and more influential members of the community, they were in a financial and social position to ensure that their vision of the public library and the community that it would help to create would become a reality. Not only did they have the funds to purchase significant numbers of books to donate to the library, but, then as now, the librarian may have felt constrained to add their donations to the collection, a shared community resource.

Men and women are represented nearly equally among the one hundred individual donors (or ninety-nine, if Mrs. Gill and Mrs. J. D. Gill are the same woman, or ninety-eight, if Mrs. Howell and Mrs. Reese Howell are also identical), but the largest donors are men. More than half of the books given by individuals were received from only five donors, all of them men.

Three-fourths of the donors gave three or fewer books. Of these, fifty-nine gave one volume each, fourteen donated two each, and two gave three each, for a total of ninety-three, or less than 20 percent.

The single largest individual donor, William Allison, Ogden superintendent of schools and member of the state board of education, gave about one hundred books, nearly all of which appear to be children's books. These included U.S. history, myths and legends of various countries, poetry and classical literature, and science readers and biography as well as fictional works by authors such as Washington Irving, Sir Walter Scott, and Hans Christian Andersen. Whether these were purchased with his own money or with school funds is unknown. In either case, his donation of such materials to the public library supported its mission as an institution of public education commensurate with the public schools. It also suggests that the public library was serving as the de facto library for the public schools or at least as an educational resource.

Orlando J. Stilwell, former teacher of history, science, and German at the Ogden Military Academy and teacher of the commercial course at the public high school, donated thirteen volumes of the *Illustrated American* and seventeen volumes of *Scientific American* as well as more than forty works of history, philosophy, geography, religion, U.S. government, mathematics, and science. Fellow educator elementary school principal Joel J. Harris donated twenty-five primers and readers.

William L. Maginnis donated fifty-four novels over a period of several months, all historical fiction and romances, including Guy Boothby's *Pharos, the Egyptian,* a work of occult fiction. Judge Maginnis, assistant U.S. attorney of Utah, was a Roman Catholic, a member of the library board in 1901, and a signatory of the Carnegie application. His wife, Letia M. Maginnis, was a member of the board in 1891 and an active member of the women's club La Coterie, which actively supported the library. Since they were the parents of ten children, it is tempting to suppose that the works were first bought for the children in the family, then donated to the library, particularly as Judge Maginnis continued to donate this type of work in these numbers on a regular basis for several years. Regardless of the circumstances, he chose to donate specific books in quantity over time rather than their equivalent value in cash to the library.

Local realtor Olin A. Kennedy, recording steward of the First Methodist Church and secretary of the Socialist Party, donated forty-one volumes of science and philosophy, including works by Darwin, Tyndall, Huxley, Spencer, Kant, Hegel, Adam Smith, John Herschel, Bacon, and Kelvin, and six other works, including *The Hound of the Baskervilles* and *Literary Study of the Bible.* A native of Illinois, Kennedy had graduated with a bachelor of arts degree from Simpson College in Iowa and taught school before moving to Utah in 1889 as a newspaper reporter and printer.[46]

Current library board members donated twenty-five volumes among them. Mrs. Harriet Emerson, a founding member of the Public Library Aid Society and president of the board from 1891 until 1903, donated two works of science and three of history. She was the second wife of Judge Philip Emerson and stepmother to librarian Grace Emerson as well as a founding member of La Coterie and of the Child Culture Club, through which she was influential in establishing a free kindergarten in Ogden. Active politically as well as socially, she was elected city auditor in 1897 by a 30 percent margin.[47]

District Court Judge James A. Howell, board secretary, donated *Webster's International Dictionary,* while Father Patrick M. Cushnahan, a native of Ireland, donated nine historical romances by Francis Crawford

and *The Complete Poems & Works of J. B. O'Reilly.* Minnie Kiesel donated nine novels, including those by Dickens, Verne, Hugo, and other popular works, and three volumes of children's fiction. A member of La Coterie and the SOOB Club, she became a member of the Ogden Carnegie Free Library board in 1893, when she was eighteen years old, and served on the board for many years.

Former librarian Grace Emerson donated Dana's *Library Primer,* Dewey's *Decimal Classification & Relative Index* and *Simplified Library School Rules,* and five works on reading and books. Although Miss Emerson did not have formal library training, this suggests that she was self-taught in the basic principles of library science and that she expected the next librarian to maintain the same professional standards.

Other major donors included Mrs. John D. Gill, a member of the library board from 1893 until at least 1895 and wife of realtor J. D. Gill, who donated thirteen (or fourteen) books, half fiction and half nonfiction, including history, biography, and philosophy. Of particular note is a work titled *Cause & Cure of Infidelity.* Mrs. Mary Remick, a Christian Scientist and the mother of Mabel Remick, a member of the library board from 1893 through 1894, donated ten works, including Townsend on civic government, philosophy, Greek and Roman mythology, and that new science of psychology, as well as Disraeli's *Lothair,* a novel about religious conflict.[48] Frank J. Cannon, son of Mormon apostle George Q. Cannon, a member of the library board in 1891, founder and former editor of the *Ogden Standard,* and former U.S. senator, donated seven volumes of Mormon biography and history, despite, or perhaps because of, being one of the most famous Mormon apostates, known as a heavy drinker and frequenter of Ogden's brothels.[49]

High school teacher Elizabeth Orth donated eight works of nonfiction, including *Wonders of European Art, Domestic Science,* a volume of essays by Thomas Carlyle, and Plato's *Dialogues.* Eva Erb, assistant county clerk and daughter of Gabriel S. Erb, late secretary of the Ogden Electric Light Company, donated six science books that possibly belonged to her late father—*Manual of Civil Engineering, Electricity & Electrical Engineering, Textbook of Mineralogy, Elementary Treatise on Physics, System of Instruction in Quantitative Chemical Analysis,* and *Elements of Surveying & Leveling*—and Edward Young's poem *Night Thoughts.*[50] F. M. Beardsley, owner of the Beardsley House hotel, donated six historical novels, including Blackmore's *Lorna Doone.* Mrs. Cora Carleton (or Carlton), library board member from 1893 until 1895, member of several women's clubs, and an active member of the Republican Party, donated five reference works on music and one children's story, *Samantha at the World's Fair.*[51] Mormon bishop Josiah M.

Ferrin donated five non-Mormon works on religion, *Dictionary of the Bible, Life & Epistles of Saint Paul, Life & Times of Jesus the Messiah, Commentary on the Old & New Testaments,* and *Complete Concordance to the Holy Scriptures.* These were donated about a year before he died at the age of seventy.[52]

Mrs. Adolph Schansenbach, sister-in-law to Mrs. Fred J. Kiesel, donated fifteen volumes of three German magazines, the collected works of both Heine and Schiller in German, and a biography of Schuyler Colfax in English. This suggests that others besides the Kiesels and the Schansenbachs also read German, among them the students in the Military Academy's German class, and indicates a desire on Mrs. Schansenbach's part to support German-language use and cultural appreciation within the community. Ruth Hilliard, eighteen-year-old daughter of library board member Kate S. Hilliard, donated four nonfiction children's geography books and five issues of the magazine *Theosophy.*[53] Although little could be discovered about Ruth Hilliard, her mother was a member of the Child Culture Club, the Utah Woman Suffrage Association, and the Social Democratic Party and was state organizer of the Utah Federation of Women's Clubs in 1902. Mrs. Hilliard viewed participation in the federation as the best way to spread socialism among Utah women and may have held the same view of the public library.[54]

Conclusion

In common with library boards in the rest of the country, the Ogden Carnegie Free Library board promoted the library as a cultural and educational institution for "elevating the moral tone of the city," providing for the education of "the common people," and promoting individual self-improvement. Many of the library supporters (organizational donors in particular) donated nonfiction and literary materials that suggest that they agreed with this view of the role of the library in the life of the user and the community. However, many of the items donated by individuals, including prominent members of the community, were more in keeping with a view of the library as a source of books for recreation and entertainment.

Although the individual donors were the political, social, and educational leaders of the community, the materials they donated were more diverse than the demographics would suggest, ranging from popular fiction to Greek philosophy and German magazines. Their donations indicate that they viewed the public library as an educational institution for children and adults, a source of recreational and popular fiction, a means of establishing religious, ethnic, political, individual, and cultural presence

and identity in the community, and a repository of information of all types for community use, not solely of the knowledge and wisdom of the ages.

Many of the donations were not unexpected: educators donated educational materials, elected and appointed officials donated government documents, the women who belonged to literary clubs donated literature and art and music books, and professionals and business people donated nonfiction items relevant to their concerns. However, as private individuals, they unexpectedly donated a much higher percentage of popular fiction, particularly historical romances and adventure stories, than their public statements as library board members and supporters would predict. Library users in the community responded by utilizing the library primarily as a source of recreational reading. While many of these works may have been donated in the hope of attracting young adults to the library and providing an alternative to "penny dreadfuls" and other "pernicious" popular literature, circulation figures demonstrate that they were clearly catering to adult reading tastes as well.

Although it is impossible to determine the donors' motives and attitudes in detail without access to additional primary materials, their actions demonstrate that they felt that popular fiction belonged in the public library along with classic literature and works of nonfiction. Whether they purchased the materials specifically for the library or bought the books for their own use and donated them later, whether they donated such books because the librarian refused to purchase them or so that she did not have to, by donating them to the library these donors demonstrated that they believed such works belonged in the collection.

As people of money and influence, donors were able to influence the content and mission of the library through their donations, regardless of official pronouncements and policies. They helped to create a public library that was a microcosm of the larger community, one that played a vital role in the life of Ogden's citizens and responded to and reflected their actual needs and interests, not merely those expressed in public statements and official documents. As a shared public resource, the library collection was instrumental in creating and fostering communal identity and culture among the varied social, ethnic, and religious groups that comprised the city.

Notes

1. Wayne A. Wiegand, "Out of Sight, Out of Mind: Why Don't We Have Any Schools of Library and Reading Studies?" *Journal of Education for Library and Information Science* 38 (1997): 314–26; Christine Pawley, "What to Read and

How to Read: The Social Infrastructure of Young People's Reading, Osage, Iowa, 1870 to 1900," *Library Quarterly* 68 (1998): 276–97; Cheryl Knott Malone, "Reconstituting the Public Library Users of the Past: An Exploration of Nominal Record Linkage Methodology," *Journal of Education for Library and Information Science* 39 (1998): 282–90; Wayne A. Wiegand, "Tunnel Vision and Blind Spots: What the Past Tells Us about the Present: Reflections on the Twentieth-Century History of American Librarianship," *Library Quarterly* (1999): 1–32; Wayne A. Wiegand, "To Reposition a Research Agenda: What American Studies Can Teach the LIS Community about the Library in the Life of the User," *Library Quarterly* (2003): 369–82.

2. Wayne A. Wiegand, "The Politics of an Emerging Profession: The American Library Association, 1876–1917," *Contributions in Librarianship and Information Science*, no. 56 (New York: Greenwood Press, 1986), 23.

3. Ibid., 9–10.

4. Wiegand, "Tunnel Vision," 4.

5. Jesse Hauk Shera, *Foundations of the Public Library* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1949), v. 15, 248; Sidney Herbert Ditzion, *Arsenals of a Democratic Culture: A Social History of the American Public Library Movement in New England and the Middle States from 1850–1900* (Chicago: American Library Association, 1947); Dee Garrison, *Apostles of Culture: The Public Librarian and American Society, 1876–1920* (New York: Free Press, 1979); Michael H. Harris, *History of Libraries in the Western World*, 4th ed. (Lanham, Md.: Scarecrow Press, 1999); Abigail A. Van Slyck, *Free to All: Carnegie Libraries & American Culture, 1890–1920* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1995); Phyllis Dain, *The New York Public Library: A History of Its Founding and Early Years* (New York: New York Public Library, 1972).

6. Samuel S. Green, "Sensational Fiction in Public Libraries," *Library Journal* 4 (1879): 345; John Cotton Dana, "Fiction in Public Libraries," *Public Libraries* 3 (1898): 212–13.

7. Mellen Chamberlain, "Address of Mellen Chamberlain," *Library Journal* 4 (1879): 363.

8. H. A. Stimson, "Boys and Books," *Library Journal* 9 (1884): 143; Ellen M. Coe, "What Can Be Done to Help a Boy to Like Good Books after He Has Fallen into the 'Dime Novel' Habit?" *Library Journal* 20 (1895): 118.

9. William Kite, "Fiction in Public Libraries," *American Library Journal* (1876): 277.

10. Gertrude Burt, "Tucson," *Arizona Librarian* 7, no. 3 (1950): 12–13; Ruth Toles, "Bisbee," *Arizona Librarian* 7, no. 3 (1950): 4; Mabel Wilkinson, "Experience of a Field Worker in Platte County in the Early 1900s," *Wyoming Library Roundup* 41, no. 1 (1986): 50–53; Colorado State Library, *Colorado's Century of Public Libraries* (Denver: Colorado State Department of Education, 1959); Louise Jackson and Michael Day, "The Wyoming Literary and Library Association, 1870–1878," *Journal of the West* 30, no. 3 (1991): 14–24.

11. Thomas J. Schlereth, *Victorian America: Transformations in Everyday Life, 1876–1915*, Everyday Life in America, ed. Richard Balkin (New York: HarperCollins, 1991), 256.

12. Richard C. Roberts and Richard W. Sadler, *History of Weber County*, Utah Centennial County History Series (Salt Lake City: Utah Historical Society, Weber Centennial Commission, 1996), 151–95; *Statistical Abstract of Utah: Centennial Edition* (Salt Lake City: Bureau of Economic and Business Research, David

Eccles School of Business, University of Utah, 1996); Richard C. Roberts, *Ogden* [database online] (University of Utah Press, 1994 [cited 2003]), available from http://www.media.utah.edu/UHE/o/OGDEN.html.

13. Congregationalist services were held beginning in 1876, and the First Congregational Church was founded in 1884. The Methodists, Presbyterians, and Baptists founded churches between 1870 and 1890, and the Jewish congregation of Brith Sholem was established in 1890. The first parish priest was installed in St. Joseph's Catholic Church in 1878, the same year that the Sisters of the Holy Cross opened the Sacred Heart Academy. Other religious bodies founded during this period include the Spiritualists in 1874, the Salvation Army in 1887, Lutheran in 1888, Christian Science in 1892, Greek Orthodox in 1905, and African Methodist Episcopal in 1908 (Gary Topping, "The Ogden Academy: A Gentile Assault on Mormon Country," *Journal of the West* 23, no. 1 [1984]: 37–47; D. S. Tuttle, *Reminiscences of a Missionary Bishop* [New York: Thomas Whittaker, 1906]; Roberts, *Ogden*; Roberts and Sadler, *History of Weber County*, 151–94).

14. "Kirmess: A Grand Success at the Opera House Last Night," *Ogden Standard*, February 7, 1891; "Kirmess: The Second Night's Performance a Decided Success at the Grand," *Ogden Standard*, February 11, 1891; Harriet S. Emerson, "History of the Ogden Public Library," in Library History File, 1903, Special Collections Department, Weber County Library, Ogden; "Library Entertainment," *Ogden Standard*, January 3, 1891.

15. "Library Officers," *Ogden Standard*, January 9, 1891.

16. "Library Association," *Ogden Standard*, January 31, 1894.

17. Bobbee M. Hepworth, "Heritage," in *Utah Libraries: Heritage and Horizons* (Salt Lake City: Utah Library Association, 1976), 13.

18. "Public Library: Annual Meeting and Election," *Ogden Standard*, January 31, 1895.

19. Utah, *Free Public Libraries, Laws of Utah* (1896), 1–12.

20. Hepworth, "Heritage," 14; Emerson, "History," 2.

21. The SOOB Club was a social and literary club for single young women. Keeping the meaning of the initials secret was a requirement of membership, and as far as can be determined, no member ever violated that requirement.

22. "Public Library and Base Ball," *Ogden Standard*, September 14, 1900.

23. Emerson, "History," 3.

24. "Library Association Meeting," *Ogden Standard*, January 27, 1897.

25. "Ogden's Public Library," *Ogden Standard*, July 8, 1897.

26. "Carnegie Free Library," *Ogden Standard*, December 20, 1902.

27. Ibid.

28. Ibid.

29. Ibid.; "Carnegie Library Is Appropriately Opened," *Ogden Standard*, April 22, 1903; "Public Library Election," *Ogden Standard*, February 19, 1893.

30. "Library Officers"; Schlereth, *Victorian America*, 256.

31. "Carnegie Library Is Appropriately Opened."

32. Rev. Goshen promised to be one of one hundred to pledge $10 and thus raise $1,000 for the fund; Father Cushnahan met the challenge in his speech afterward. Not to be outdone, Mayor Glasmann then raised the stakes, suggesting that the ten-dollar contributions be limited to fifty and pledging to be one of five contributing $100 each or of ten contributing $50 each to make up the balance. By the next day, four more men, Senator Fred J. Kiesel, Joseph Scowcroft, A. T.

Wright, and former mayor David Eccles, had each pledged $100. Those who had originally agreed to be one of one hundred people donating $10 each insisted that their number remain at one hundred, while a third category of twenty citizens contributing $25 each was added ("Books Presented to the Library," *Ogden Standard*, April 23, 1903; "Carnegie Library Is Appropriately Opened."

33. "Carnegie Library Is Appropriately Opened"; Ogden Carnegie Free Library Board of Directors, "Board Minutes, 1901–1905"; Weber County (Utah) Library, Board Minutes, 1901–66, 1969–, Utah State Archives, Salt Lake City.

34. Ogden Carnegie Free Library Board of Directors, Annual Reports, 1904–13; Ogden Carnegie Free Library, Annual Reports, 1895–99, 1904–64, Utah State Archives, Salt Lake City.

35. Ogden Carnegie Free Library, "Standard Accession Book," 1903–11, Special Collections, Weber County Library, Ogden.

36. Ogden Carnegie Free Library Board of Directors, Annual Reports, 1904–13.

37. "Books Presented to the Library."

38. Zoe E. Faddis to Andrew Carnegie, 1904, Carnegie Corporation of New York, Carnegie Grants for Library Buildings, 1890–1917, Shields Library, University of California.

39. Ogden Carnegie Free Library Board of Directors, Annual Reports, 1904–13.

40. Ibid.

41. Faddis to Andrew Carnegie; Ogden Carnegie Free Library Board of Directors, Annual Reports, 1904–13.

42. Ogden Carnegie Free Library Board of Directors, Annual Reports, 1904–13.

43. Most of the government documents were withdrawn from the accession list in 1910, when the library became a government depository, and were indexed separately, so they are not included in these figures (ibid.).

44. "History's Women: The Unsung Heroines," 2003, http://www.historyswomen.com/Admire35.html, accessed February 22, 2005.

45. Ian Ousby, ed., *The Cambridge Guide to Literature in English* (Cambridge: University of Cambridge Press, 1992), 236–38.

46. Noble Warrum, *Utah since Statehood* [database online] (S. J. Clarke, 1919 [cited 2003]), http://www.ancestry.com/search/rectype/inddbs/5138.htm, accessed December 4, 2003; Roberts and Sadler, *History of Weber County*, 247, 303; John R. Sillito, "Women and the Socialist Party in Utah, 1900–1920," *Utah Historical Quarterly* 49, no. 3 (1981): 277.

47. "Mrs. Harriet Emerson," *Ogden Standard*, October 31, 1897; "Great Victory for the People," *Ogden Standard*, November 3, 1897.

48. "Christian Scientists Organize," *Ogden Standard*, May 14, 1895.

49. Roberts and Sadler, *History of Weber County*, 138.

50. "Board of County Commissioners' Session," *Ogden Standard*, October 13, 1902; Roberts and Sadler, *History of Weber County*, 144.

51. "Magazine Club," *Ogden Standard*, June 16, 1894; "The Coterie Meeting," *Ogden Standard*, September 8, 1894; "Independent Republicans," *Ogden Standard*, September 19, 1896; "W.C.T.U. Meeting," *Ogden Standard*, November 12, 1897.

52. "Bishop Ferrin Dead," *Ogden Standard*, June 20, 1904.

53. Published by the Theosophical Society from April 1886 to October 1897, http://www.theosociety.org/pasadena/theos/theos_no.htm, accessed May 17, 2007.

54. Sillito, "Women and the Socialist Party," 237; Sherilyn Cox Bennion, "Enterprising Ladies: Utah's Nineteenth-Century Women Editors," *Utah Historical Quarterly* 49 (Summer 1981): 291–302; Utah Federation of Women's Clubs, "Seventeenth Annual Convention," 1910, Utah History Research Library, Utah State Historical Society, Salt Lake City; John S. McCormick, "Hornets in the Hive: Socialists in Early Twentieth-Century Utah," *Utah Historical Quarterly* 50, no. 3 (1982): 225–40.